

Eva Brems , Gauthier de Beco and Wouter Vandenhole (eds.)

# National Human Rights Institutions and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Intersentia

April 2013

ISBN 978-1-78068-145-0

X + 190 p.



# CONTENTS

## Introduction to the Volume

EVA BREMS, GAUTHIER DE BECO and WOUTER VANDENHOLE .....	1
---	---

## The Role of National Human Rights Institutions in the Promotion and Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Historical, Theoretical and Critical Perspectives

Gauthier DE BECO .....	7
------------------------	---

1. National Human Rights Institutions (NHRIs).....	7
2. Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	12
3. The Role of National Human Rights Institutions in the Promotion and Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	16
3.1. Support for NHRI Engagement in Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	16
3.2. The Contribution of NHRIs to the Implementation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	21
3.3. Factors Encouraging NHRIs to Focus on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	23
4. Conclusion .....	29

## National Human Rights Institutions as Independent Actors in Relation to Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Lone LINDHOLT .....	33
---------------------	----

1. Introduction .....	33
2. Human Rights Actors .....	34
2.1. Definition and Rationale .....	34
2.2. The Concept of Human Rights Actor.....	35
2.3. Independent Actors.....	36
3. National Human Rights Institutions as Human Rights Actors.....	39
3.1. General Human Rights Instruments .....	40
3.2. The Paris Principles on National Human Rights Institutions .....	44
3.3. Other Documents .....	47
3.3.1. United Nations Handbook.....	47
3.3.2. Commonwealth Conference .....	47

Contents

3.3.3. Ombudsman and National Institutions Conference.....	48
3.3.4. UN Handbook on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights for National Institutions .....	48
4. Framework for the Recognition of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights... .	48
4.1. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	49
4.2. Limburg Principles .....	49
4.3. Maastricht Guidelines.....	50
4.4. UN General Comments .....	51
5. Conclusion: National Human Rights Institutions and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	53
 <b>The Bolivian Human Rights Ombudsman and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights</b>	
Thomas PEGRAM .....	57
1. Introduction .....	57
2. Fulfilling an ESCR Mandate in Bolivia .....	58
2.1. The Bolivian <i>Defensoría del Pueblo</i> .....	59
2.2. Defining an ESCR mandate .....	60
2.2.1. The parameters of an ESCR mandate .....	60
2.2.2. Defining an ESCR mandate: the internal challenge .....	63
2.2.3. Defining an ESCR mandate: the external challenge .....	64
3. Implementing an ESCR Mandate .....	66
3.1. Implementation through Legislative and Policy Impact.....	66
3.1.1. Policy impact .....	66
3.1.2. Monitoring legislation .....	67
3.1.3. Implementation through judicial activism and legal petition.....	69
3.2. Implementation through Social Accountability Mobilisation.....	71
3.2.1. Coordination with civil society organisations.....	71
3.2.2. Coordination with the media .....	73
3.3. The Defensoría and Engagement at the International Level.....	74
Conclusion .....	75
Bibliography .....	77
 <b>The Role of NHRC in Protecting and Promoting the Economic and Social Rights of Vulnerable Groups in India</b>	
Justice B.C. PATEL .....	79
1. Demographic, Political, Economic, Social and Cultural Profile of India... .	80
2. The Set Up of NHRC-India and Its Mandate .....	83

2.1. The Extensive Range of Its Functions .....	85
2.2. Complaint Handling Mechanism.....	87
2.3. <i>Suo Motu</i> Power .....	88
2.4. Powers Relating to Inquiries .....	88
2.5. Powers of Investigation.....	89
2.6. Broad Autonomy .....	89
2.7. Specialised Staff.....	89
2.8. Core and Expert Groups.....	90
2.9. Appointment of Special Rapporteurs.....	90
2.10. Holding of Camp Sittings.....	90
2.11. Creating a Culture of Human Rights.....	91
3. The Protection and Promotion of the Social and Economic Rights of Vulnerable Groups.....	92
3.1. The Right to Health.....	92
3.1.1. Access to health care.....	93
3.1.2. Nutrition.....	93
3.1.3. Public hearings on the right to health care.....	94
3.1.4. Mental health.....	95
3.1.5. Silicosis .....	95
3.1.6. Issue of endosulfan .....	96
3.2. The Right to Food .....	97
3.2.1. Starvation deaths in Odisha .....	98
3.2.2. Human rights awareness and facilitating the assessment and enforcement of the human rights programme in 28 selected districts of India .....	99
3.3. The Right to Education.....	99
3.4. The Rights of Children .....	100
3.5. The Rights of Women .....	101
3.6. The Rights of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Vulnerable Groups.....	102
3.7. The Rights of Minorities.....	104
4. Conclusion .....	104
 The Monitoring Role of the Ghana Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice (CHRAJ) in the Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Kofi QUASHIGAH .....	107
1. Introduction .....	107
2. The 1992 Constitutional Provisions .....	108
2.1. The CHRAJ as a National Human Rights Institution .....	109
2.2. The Role of CHRAJ in Relation to the State's Duties in Respect of Economic and Social Rights .....	110

Contents

3.	The CHRAJ's Concept of Monitoring .....	111
3.1.	Monitoring Approaches and Methodologies .....	112
3.2.	The Importance of NHRIs in Monitoring.....	113
3.3.	The Need for Monitoring .....	113
3.4.	Judicial Attitude in Ghana Towards Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	114
3.5.	Collaboration with NGOs in the Monitoring Exercise.....	117
4.	The CHRAJ's Thematic Areas for Monitoring .....	118
4.1.	Monitoring Goals .....	118
4.2.	Examples of Specific Thematic Research Processes.....	118
4.2.1.	Child rights .....	119
4.2.2.	The right to basic education.....	119
4.2.3.	The right to health.....	119
4.3.	A Case Study of an Investigation into Mining and Its Effects on Affected Communities .....	119
5.	The Initiated Review of the Monitoring Process .....	122
5.1.	Examples of the Benefits of the Tracking System.....	123
5.1.1.	Prisons monitoring.....	123
5.1.2.	<i>Trokosi</i> monitoring.....	123
5.2.	The Future Importance of Monitoring in the Ghanaian System.....	124
6.	Conclusion .....	124
	<b>National Human Rights Institutions and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: An Examination of the Mandate and Practice of the Ethiopian Human Rights Commission</b>	
	Mohammed ABDO .....	127

1.	Introduction .....	127
2.	The Establishment of the Commission .....	128
3.	Structure of the Commission .....	129
4.	Mandate and Power of the Commission .....	130
5.	Mandate of the Commission over Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	132
6.	Review of the Practice of the Commission in Enforcing Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	133
6.1.	Promotion of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....	133
6.2.	Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	137
7.	Assessment of the Practice of the Commission Regarding Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	141
8.	Concluding Remarks.....	146

**Equal Treatment, an Effective Mechanism to Protect Human Rights in the Netherlands?**

Laurien J.L. KOSTER .....	149
1. Introduction .....	149
2. The Equal Treatment Commission and Its Legal Mandate .....	150
3. The Right to Work: Article 6 of the ICESCR.....	152
3.1. Scope .....	152
3.2. ETC Case Law in the Field of Recruitment and Selection .....	152
3.3. The Use of Other Instruments.....	153
4. The Right to the Enjoyment of Just and Favourable Conditions of Work: Article 7 ICESCR.....	154
4.1. ETC Case Law Regarding Terms of Employment and Working Conditions .....	154
4.2. Use of Other Instruments: Investigation and Research .....	155
4.2.1. Unequal pay .....	156
4.2.2. Pregnancy.....	157
4.2.3. Work environment .....	158
4.3. Analysis and Conclusions: Relative and Absolute Standards.....	158
5. Article 11 ICESCR: An Adequate Standard of Living.....	160
5.1. Introduction .....	160
5.2. Housing.....	160
6. The Right to Health: Article 12 ICESCR .....	161
7. The Right to Education: Article 13 ICESCR .....	162
8. Concluding Remarks.....	165

**Anti-Discrimination Legislation and the Role of an Equality body in the Promotion of Economic and Social Rights**

Jozef DE WITTE .....	167
1. The Centre for Equal Opportunities and Opposition to Racism.....	167
2. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	170
3. Non-Discrimination Legislation.....	171
4. The Role of the Centre when Economic and Social Rights are Violated ..	173
4.1. The Right to Work.....	174
4.2. The Right to Housing .....	174
4.3. The Right to Health Care .....	175
4.4. The Right to Dispose of One's Property.....	175
4.5. The Right to Social and Leisure Activities.....	175

Contents

4.6. The Right to Participate in Economic and Social Life.....	175
4.7. Difficulties.....	176
5. The Centre's Other Contributions to the Realisation of Economic and Social Rights.....	177
6. Conclusion .....	179
<b>The Role of National Inquiries in the Protection of Social and Economic Rights</b>	
Brian BURDEKIN .....	181
1. The United Nations Standards for NHRIs (the 'Paris Principles') .....	182
2. National Inquiries .....	184
3. The Australian National Inquiry on Mental Illness.....	186