ESREA Migration, Racism and Xenophobia
Research Network Conference

Diversity and Social Cohesion – are these incompatible objectives?

CONFERENCE PROGRAMME

What is the role of adult education and adult educators in understanding these tensions and contributing to the development of diverse societies?

ICOSS, The University of Sheffield, UK

December 2-3 2009
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>December 2 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.30-13.30:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.30-14.00:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.00-15.30:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skilled Immigrants’ Access to Vocational Training</strong> - Annette Sprung, Department of Education, Karl-Franzens-University Graz, Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dreaming the Success: Educational and Occupational Aspirations and Expectations among diverse Second Generation Immigrants</strong> - Estrella Gualda, Social Centre for Research on Social Studies and Social Intervention, University of Huelva, Spain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The role of power relations in a community interaction project in a Visual Communication Design (VCD) course</strong> - Elmarie Costandius, Stellenbosch University, South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Highly skilled: The experience of 2 Romanians in becoming a UK teacher</strong> - Alan Benson, London Metropolitan University, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Language, diversity and cohesion. Biographical research and talk of belonging and exclusion</strong> – Rob Evans, Language Centre Otto-von.Guericke University, Magdeburg, Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Putting it on the map: psychogeographic mapping as a tool for community building?</strong> - Gillian Cowell, University of Stirling, Scotland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.30-16.00:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.00-17.30:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responsive Approaches to Adult Education: Antithetical to Social Integration?</strong> - Lindsey Fraser, Fiona Chapel and Samar Al-Afandi, Communities and Partnerships, Lifelong Learning Centre, University of Leeds, England</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>How to live with difference in a homogeneous society: findings from a training initiative to combat xenophobic attitudes in Japanese student nurses in the wake of an influx of Indonesian nurses to Japan</strong> - Naoko Suzuki, Centre for University Extension, University of Tokushima, Japan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aristotle, adult education and European citizenship</strong> - Shirley Egley &amp; David Sullivan, School of Education, University of Wales, Newport, Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hierarchies and unities of the victimised: Poland’s minorities on the way to empowerment</strong> - Marcin Starnawski, Institute of Pedagogy, University of Lower Silesia, Poland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SÚIL EILE – A different perspective on migration, language acquisition, belonging and multicultural society</strong> – Simon Warren, The University of Sheffield, England</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.30-17.45:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.45-18.30:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>December 3 2009</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.30-11.00:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thinking about citizenship and difference – Conference Room

**Belonging to be different: How can we use Critical Race Theory to improve adult education?** – Anita Franklin, The University of Sheffield, UK & Yvonne Channer, Sheffield Hallam University, England

**Ethnicity in the classroom. Between policy and teaching practices** Rozalia Ligus, Institute of Pedagogy, University of Lower Silesia, Poland

**Borders, Glass Floors and anti-racist Popular Adult Education** - John Grayson, AdEd Knowledge Company and Sheffield Hallam University

Thinking about community – Board Room

**Practices of narrative multiculturalism. Towards a more troubling conception of a multicultural community** – Joke Vandenabeele, Centre for Research on Lifelong Learning and Participation, University of Leuven, Belgium

**Institutional responses to a diversity of aged migrant groups: the challenges of social cohesion** - Estrella Gualda & Angeles Escriva, Social Centre for Research on Social Studies and Social Intervention, University of Huelva, Spain

**How people learn to live with a religious difference in Northern Ireland?** - Dragoljub Kaurin, University of Nottingham, UK

11.00-11.15: BREAK

11.15 – 13.00: Roundtable: Thinking about integration – Conference Room

**Adult education practices for immigrants: an analysis of civic integration in Flanders** - Dieter Gryp, Social Work and Welfare Studies, University of Ghent, Belgium

**Lifelong learning and the social integration agenda: is it fit for purpose?**
Linda Morrice, University of Sussex, Brighton, England

**What’s really behind Diversity? The rediscovery of difference as a challenge for the adult educational work**
Andreas Thiesen, Political Science, Leibniz University Hannover, Germany

13.00-14.00: Lunch

14.00-15.30: Plenary Session & Conference Closing: Setting the agenda for future research into adult education, migration, racism and xenophobia, and taking the work of the network forward. – Conference Room
Highly-Skilled Migrants: A case study of two Romanian Mathematics teachers in UK Schools

Alan Benson, London Metropolitan University

Abstract

This study is a pilot of part of a larger study which will focus on the experiences of migrants from both the European Union and elsewhere, during a Post Graduate Certificate of Education Course (PGCE). This course prepares them to become teachers of mathematics in UK schools. Research into the professional lives of teachers using a life history approach (Goodson 1991) has shown that teachers’ professional lives are affected by a number of factors including their own life history and current obligations outside the workplace, as well as matters specifically related to their work and professional training. Accordingly, this study will consider aspects of the participants’ lives prior to leaving Romania, as well as their experience as migrants in the UK before they became teachers of mathematics in UK schools. The study will also address methodological issues involved in conducting research where participants are from different countries. The author is English and a UK-based PGCE course leader.

Data collection and biographical background of participants

The data was collected in two semi-structured interviews after which participants were able to comment on the interview transcripts, and agreed to answer follow-up questions. The participants are both women, one of whom (Alicia) was trained as a mathematics teacher by
the author. The author met the other (Irena) at an academic seminar in 2008. Both work as mathematics teachers in London schools.

After gaining a good mathematics degree and completing teacher training, Irena achieved her long-held ambition of becoming a mathematics teacher in Romania in 1990 (just after the fall of the Ceausescu regime, and with it the end of communism in the country). In the meantime her husband had been allowed to leave the country to study mathematics in UK. Reluctantly Irena joined him in 1992 with the official status of a housewife. Before taking up her post as a school teacher, Irena gained post graduate academic qualifications in the UK.

Alicia gained a good mathematics degree from a Romanian university in 2005. She came to the UK in 2005. The UK in general (and London in particular) had, despite language difficulties and official restrictions placed on working, grown in popularity as a destination for Romanian migrants (Torre 2008). Alicia lives with her long-term partner. After working in the informal sector she was offered a place on a PGCE course in 2007, and she was entitled, as a European citizen, to all the financial assistance offered to UK citizens. She was the first of her PGCE cohort to be offered a teaching job, which she began in September 2009.

**Theoretical framework**

Both of the participants in this research have Romanian as a mother tongue and speak it daily, although not necessarily with members of their immediate family. They have frequent links with family members in Romania through telecommunications connections, and through the availability of cheap flights to Romania. In both these important aspects of their lives they experience a central theme of diasporas which Avtar Brah describes as
The concept of ‘home’ and ‘dispersion’ in creative tension inscribing a homing desire while simultaneously critiquing discourses of fixed origins.’ (Brah 1996:193)

These tensions are well captured by the non-essentialist view of identity described by Stuart Hall an academic who was himself born in Jamaica as

‘.. a construction, a process never completed –always in process’ (Hall 1997:2).

In the context of migration, the perspective of trans-nationalism (Vertovec,2001) emphasises the way this process of identity is carried on between countries, and will be used here as a framework for considering the practices of these two migrants from Romania. The theory of intersectionality acknowledges that ‘..who we are’ emerges from interactions with specific spatial contexts and specific biographic moments’ (Valentine 2007:18). I will attempt to describe these interactions by contrasting the positions of the respondents in the main themes I identified in the course of a thematic analysis of my interview data, to which I now turn.

**Memories of Romania and Reasons for Migration**

The families of both respondents had suffered directly under the communist regime. Alicià's grandfather had had land confiscated in 1948. Later, under the Ceausescu regime, Irena's family had been heavily fined and her parents forbidden to take up courses in higher education. There was a contrast in their experiences in Romania prior to their decision to migrate. Alicià's family were of Hungarian origin, and Alicià was from a village which meant that she would have been aware of the discriminatory practices against Magyrs taken by Ceausescu and the particular difficulties experienced in rural areas during the eighties. (Crampton, 2002). In the wake of the effects of such experiences, and their own divorce,
both of Alicia's parents worked abroad for periods to improve their income whilst maintaining the family farm. As a result of a teacher identifying her mathematical abilities, Alicia herself left home at twelve, to attend firstly city schools, and later university, where she supported herself and rarely returned home. She described her family as hating communism, and migratory practices were familiar to her family and herself. In contrast Irena’s family identified itself as Romanian and had always lived in the one city. Irena never wanted to leave her home town and after an education which she described as being at the best schools and best universities, she took the first opportunity to return to the city with which she had fallen in love. In her interview she only hints at life outside of Romania, when describing her husband's opportunity to study as ‘amazing’. Her references to living under the Ceausescu regime were limited to the personal in scope. For example the main effect of Decree 770 of 1966 (which banned abortion and the use of contraceptives, and which resulted in compulsory gynaecological examinations for women over 16) (Molloy, 2009) was recalled as the enlargement of class sizes in schools to an unprecedented number of forty two pupils. Her position of making no comment about the regime was in stark contrast to Alicia's. The sociologist Mirjana Morokvasic (2004) refers to women suffering from gendered power relationships in communist societies, both before and after the collapse of such regimes. One of Alicia's reasons for migrating was that she did not want ‘...to get married and have children like everyone else in the village’. Irena, by contrast, remained silent on general issues of gender in Romania. She nonetheless received the 'dreaded phone call' that her husband was to continue his academic studies in the UK beyond the initial period, and reluctantly decided to join him because ‘at the end of the day he was my husband.’ In contrast Alicia left Romania for London, soon after graduating, to a city where
she had no friends or contacts. She was, as a result of her personal and family history, no stranger either to migration or to the demands which it made upon migrants themselves.

In contrast to the memories which both women have of living in Romania, their memories of school life are remarkably similar. Both refer to a mathematics curriculum in which formal proof and what Irena referred to as 'rigour' were taught from the beginning of secondary school using Euclidean geometry. They were both in agreement that they felt that standards of mathematics in Romania were higher than in the UK, although both were aware that that the potential use of technology and calculators were ignored. They refer to classrooms in which teachers were respected and were powerful figures who for the most part delivered lessons through question and answer followed by practice with little or no interruption because of behavioural problems. Both women agreed that in Romania there had been little attempt to provide differentiation - the support for individuals - which they provided as teachers in England. Alicia commented 'I had never heard of differentiation until I came to England. In my country if you didn't get it you just didn't get it.' Both women participated in the national mathematics competitions which are an important part of school mathematics life in Romania. Both reached the regional level. Their reaction to this achievement betrayed a difference in confidence which is difficult to interpret but important to note: Alicia described this in a hushed almost apologetic tone whereas Irena proudly noted ‘..how good was I to have reached that level from an ordinary school and without any knowledge of private tutors?’ Issues of gender and confidence in mathematics have been much discussed in UK mathematics (Boaler 1997). That they should surface in the course of this research draws attention to the fact not only that it is an international issue, but also as a reminder
that beyond the memories constructed during the interview situation lie the complexities of lived emotions and their effects on two people as they were growing up.

**Arrival in England**

Both women arrived in UK under different circumstances: Irena as a tied migrant (Raghuram, 2004) dependent upon her husband’s student visa, and Alicia as a freely moving European citizen who ‘...wanted to see other places; see other people; know about other cultures’. Both women experienced this as a time of enormous stress, and for Irena this resulted in sleepless nights and guilt at the thought of leaving her family. Alicia returned to Romania after six months but elected to return having decided ‘I don’t give up that easily, and I’m going to try again and see if something comes up’. Coupled with this determination, both women’s accounts were laced with the humour and irony of survival - perhaps best summarised by Irena’s summary of her reason for arriving in the UK: ‘Well, to put it simply, he followed his dreams while I followed him.’ The resilience of both women enabled them to cope with the initial period of culture shock when, according to Agnieszka Bron’s studies and borne out in this research by both participants,

‘... a person is overwhelmed by the mass of goods, by impressions, sounds, technology etc. but most of all by different cultural, social and political values norms and habits.’ (Bron 2002:2)

**Learning a language: a space becomes a place**

This feeling of culture shock meant that the UK space to which the two participants of this research had migrated was a long way from being a place which they could call home. In this
section I will explore ways in which the two women experienced being positioned, both by their language ability and by a range of discourses in the UK.

Citizens of the first wave of Eastern European countries to join the EU in 2004 were able to work legitimately in UK but, in the wake of concerns about immigration, this was not extended to Romanian citizens on accession in 2006. Nonetheless on returning to London, Alicia was able, with relative ease, to find work informally in the service sector. This, together with reading newspapers, became part of an informed strategy of learning different uses of English ‘.. Like when I was working as a receptionist there were complaints. I wanted to be able to use the language appropriately to the circumstances. You know, to discuss to be like diplomat. I didn’t have that and because of that I always listened to other people.’ In the course of her work she gradually extended her acquaintances amongst English people and significantly met a former school teacher who became a mentor and played a key role in her applying to a PGCE course. It was only as part of her preparation for the PGCE that she attended a formal English language course in order to gain a qualification.

Irena’s arrival in the UK was considerably earlier than Alicia’s, and would have been extremely difficult without the visa she received as a tied migrant. She (Irena) insisted that her own further education be a condition of migrating, and in comparison with Alicia, her learning of English was more formal and largely limited to university audiences. From a very small budget she paid for ninety minutes of language tuition weekly, and was able to find work teaching mathematics to undergraduates, which linguistically she planned ‘right down to the tiniest detail’. She did not find an English mentor in the same way that Alicia did. In conversation she was surprised to hear that Alicia had felt herself to be at home in UK
relatively quickly, whereas it was only after about five years that she felt at ease linguistically.

Irena’s arrival in the UK coincided with an air of triumphalism in the West about the end of Communism which, for example, the philosopher Francis Fukuyama famously described as an ‘unabashed victory of economic and political liberalism’ (Financial Times, 051109). This, combined with widespread ignorance of the domestic policies of the Ceausescu period, meant that Irena’s identity as a Romanian was marginalised. Although Alicia has experienced a similar marginalisation, it is less significant for her. It is a marginalisation about which Irena feels passionately, and contrasts with a strong attachment to her family in Romania which is perhaps best shown by her declaration that ‘..it’s such a shame not to feel comfortable to say that ‘I am a Romanian’ because I know that immediately people say ‘Oh’. I remember the taxi driver, and that was a couple of years ago (who said) ‘So do you have TVs in Romania?’ (to which I replied) ‘Yes and we have electricity as well as water, and we have toilets as well.’”

In contrast, Alicia, with her work in the informal sector (as opposed to Irena’s long standing visa), has been more affected by the rise of immigration control as a political issue which led to headlines in the tabloid press at the time of Accession in 2006 such as

‘Hundreds of Romanians are poised to jet into Britain for as little as £4 after their country joins the EU on January 1. Cheap airline Wizz Air is expected to bring thousands on one-way tickets on a new route launched specially to cash in on the end of border controls. The mass influx into Luton Airport is fuelling fears that unregistered workers will simply vanish and that towns will be hit by crime’ waves’ The Sun 2006 in Torres(2008)
Although these fears proved exaggerated, both women were aware of debates about unemployment. Such a debate arose for example at the Lindsey oil refinery where British jobs were seemed to be threatened by the legal use of European contract labour. (Financial Times 300109). There were discussions about social cohesion following the decision by Romanian citizens who decided to return home after they were forced to leave their houses in Belfast (Financial Times 180609). Discourses of immigration and employment drawn upon by these national debates have served to marginalise European workers on the national stage. In London, a global city, where local discourses are not so openly threatening, both women have opted for a form of invisibility, made possible in part by the whiteness of their skin and the accent which their Romanian language gives to their English pronunciation. This accent allowed at least one local to believe that Alicia was Spanish. Irena has little contact with other Romanians and Alicia states her invisibility more boldly:

'I have always been aware that always and I have put this up front I do not want to take anyone’s position or job. I don’t want to be in conflict with anyone. If I should not be here let me know and I won't be here. I will step back.’

**Becoming a Mathematics Teacher**

Irena and Alicia have followed different paths to becoming mathematics teachers in UK schools. Irena was already a mathematics teacher when she arrived in UK and she has since extended her credibility in UK by gaining higher degrees including a doctorate. She has regained her status as a mathematics teacher and furthered her ambitions independently of her husband’s achievements. Becoming a mathematics teacher was intended to give credibility to her research, and now, after five years, she is looking to return to university
Alicia has, after working in the informal sector in jobs which like many Eastern European migrants (Drinkwater et al., 2009) did not match her academic achievements, has found a job which offers her happiness together with the opportunity to work as a recognised professional with employment rights. I will refer to this contrast as I draw out the main themes concerning both women becoming mathematics teachers.

For both Alicia and Irena, being a mathematics teacher is important. Already a qualified teacher in Romania, Irena was looking for new things when she arrived in a different country. She took early opportunities explore the use of graphics calculators which she found allowed her mathematical insights through visual displays, which had previously been unavailable to her through pencil and paper methods. Irena was eligible for teaching posts in universities because of her own postgraduate studies and professional networks. This represented independence, and satisfied professional ambitions. In reflecting upon a recent interview, when she failed narrowly to gain a position to which she aspired, Irena reflected ‘..so you see, although I am so well qualified I still find it difficult to break in.’ Mathematics seems to be a skill which is eminently transferable and to an extent this can be seen in Irena’s success in UK mathematics teaching. However, in her paper on Romanian graduates in London, Krisztina Csédo makes a clear case for social aspects of skill construction:

‘Rather than having a fixed or universal meaning across space and time, skills are relational and contextual, defined by the socio-cultural environment in which they need to be applied’ (Csédo 2008:820)

This raises the question of how highly-skilled migrants can best develop a portfolio of skills to allow them to realise their ambitions in a career path which might be possible for
comparable professionals born in the UK. At this point it is perhaps instructive to note that Alicia was the first person in her PGCE cohort to gain a teaching post and was praised during the interview for her work in the classroom. Both women raised concerns about behaviour management skills required of UK teachers which were in stark contrast to what was expected of teachers during their education in Romania. Whilst for Irena mathematics remained her overriding purpose which led at times to difficulties in managing pupils, Alicia emphasised the importance of using, indeed prioritising, other socio-cultural skills before her mathematical ones when she observed that

'When I was in class I thought they don’t learn maths when I was having problems with children. It was just that I was thinking maths, maths, maths. But then I went and worked with the SEN department. I worked with the EAL department; with other people like TAs. I have realised that it's a lot...first you start with that human side and then you get to maths. You have to make sure you get that first, and then you get to maths.'

This statement reflects a considerable reworking of the education that both women had described in Romania, particularly their comments about the provision for the needs of individuals ignored in their Romanian experience but central to the tradition of English education. This comparison raises questions for how to best facilitate such socio-cultural reworkings and the development of associated classroom practices for highly-skilled migrants in the field of education, to which I shall return in the conclusion.

**Methodology**

The process of doing this research brought with it issues to do with my own position as researcher, things which the participants did not refer to and about the clarity which it
brought to the concept of trans-nationalism which are particularly useful to describe further in the context of research with Eastern Europeans.

**Position of Researcher**

An interview is a co-construction. As such, I am aware of the influence that I, a white male in my late fifties, would have upon discussions which I held with the female respondents. It is particularly important in regard to these interviews and their interpretation, because of the way that I had been discursively positioned about Eastern Europe and because of the sources of my information about Romania.

I have read travelogues and memoirs about Eastern Europe, and I am aware of the problems associated with Western triumphalism, repression and security which have formed the dominant discourses of this reading. It is reflected in titles and headlines from 'Stasiland' (Funder 2003), to reference to the Romanian security service the Securitate in an article celebrating the 2009 award of the Nobel Prize for Literature to the Romanian writer Herta Muller (Guardian 101009). This made it difficult for me to hear and interpret stories of ordinary life - indeed there is a sense in which I was in a position of thinking that migrants somehow represented the fact that ordinary life was impossible in Romania. This seemed to be emphasised when I read about the post-war history of Romania in Crampton’s 'The Balkans' - a standard history of Romania and the region in general. Although this view matched some of Alicia’s account, it made it particularly difficult for me to interpret Irena’s memories of family life in Romania which are central to her biography. It was only through the social history represented by Molloy’s Lost World of Communism (2009) that I came to realise how, through ordinary events such as the famous Romanian comedy act Divertis, life
was possible. Furthermore through the first-hand testimonies of women who were gynaecologically examined in the pursuit of Decree 770, it exemplified aspects of gender discrimination which would not be referred to in the course of a 40 minute interview with a non-Romanian man. The possibility of growing up knowing ordinary happiness was echoed in Irena’s description of the difficulties for a woman out partying, of having to admit to being a mathematics student. This view of living and coping despite the strictures of life in Ceausescu’s Romania was given further authority in the context of migration by reading the academic work of Mirjana Morokvasic who had been brought up in the former Yugoslavia and described Eastern European migrants as

‘(using) their experience in circumventing the system during the communist period when travelling and consuming was a way of overcoming the uniformity and inadequacies of supply’ (Morokvasic 2004:17).

It was only when I read the restrictions on work possible for Romanian migrants in the UK after 2006 that I realised it was exactly these strengths that Alicia drew upon during her work in the informal sector and why the achievement of Qualified Teacher Status was so important to her.

**Discursive positionings and intersectionality**

The connection between identity and discourse was useful in organising my own thoughts and in offering a focus for analysis, but at the same time I am aware of the danger of oversimplification. Avtar Brah’s use of the word ‘entanglement’ to describe a sense of complex interconnectedness central to intersectionality is useful. Irena is in daily phone contact with her mother and although Irena only speaks to her children in English (as a
result of the language difficulties she experienced on first arriving in UK), she has been very pleased to note that her children show signs of understanding their grandparents who themselves only speak Romanian. Irena’s position in this entanglement was ‘totally, totally changed’ when her own children were born in UK. Her husband and children in UK then replaced her extended family in Romania in her affections. It is an example not only of the importance of emotion in discursive positionings but also the way in which discourses can be prioritised. It gives a clear insight into the lived importance of the idea of intersectionality. Concurrently I have read the memoir of life in the former Yugoslavia ‘Chernobyl Strawberries’(2005) by Vesna Goldsworthy and been struck by the resonances with stories told to me by my respondents especially Irena. It highlighted what an effective resource this form of writing is for approaching the idea of intersectionality and more generally as a resource for organising interviews and interpreting the subsequent data.

Trans-nationalism

The importance of the emphasis which trans-national theory (Vertovec, 2001) places on the ongoing interrelationship between the country of origin and the country of arrival is reflected in the lives of both these women. Alicia regularly travels back to the village where her mother still lives, and leaves her money at the end of each visit. Irena is in regular contact with her family in Romania using telephones and the internet. This emotional attachment, with its obvious ongoing immersion in interpersonal discussion, does not extend for either Alicia or Irena to an ongoing awareness of wider issues in Romania. Alicia is aware of how things might have changed since she lived there. Irena does not take advantage of satellite TV to watch Romanian stations relying on her family connections for information about Romania.
Both women are aware of the relative poverty of life in Romania in addition to other constraints to which I have referred. On an emotional level Alicia enjoys a sense of independence of life in UK, and Irena enjoys being able to use her own initiative. Their work as teachers of mathematics in the UK is important to them both. Alicia is happy to be using her mathematics background and Irena has, from the beginning, enjoyed the opportunity that technological innovation in education has given to both her teaching and her academic career. The particular demands of the national educational system does not seem to offer teachers the opportunity to circulate trans-nationally in the way that (Favell,2008) has described as the case for highly-skilled migrants in other sectors, particularly information technology.

Although there is a sense that both women now regard the UK as their home, this does not mean that they necessarily regard UK as their final destination. Irena has discussed the possibility of returning to Romania in the event of her husband's death and Alicia’s simple reference about ‘If I should not be here let me know and I won’t be here,’ evidences her willingness to remain mobile should it be necessary. They would appear to be aware of an ongoing sense negotiating the possibilities and possible costs of remaining in the UK although, as Irena’s case shows, over time and with the growth of emotional responsibility the centre of gravity in the trans-national entanglement has shifted towards the UK. This sense of making decisions in a trans-national space which may be affected by familial experience of migration in Alicia’s case as much as by her experience in the UK is well described by Morokvasic as
‘...a space of possibilities... [which] can only be understood through a detailed examination of what migrants may gain through their trans-national practices in the different sectors in which they work’ (Morokvasic 2004:77)

Whilst I hope that this case study has contributed to an understanding of the space of two highly-skilled Romanians in the UK, I will turn in conclusion to what I perceive as the implications of this study for the preparation of highly-skilled graduates to become mathematics teachers in UK schools.

**Conclusion**

The lives of both these women show the complex interrelationships that exist between being a schoolteacher and the other aspects of their lives. Both participants had to do a lot of work in order to negotiate the differences which they experienced between Romania and the UK in all aspects of their lives. The period of time spent at university during her PGCE course offered Alicia an environment where her own story was acknowledged and she was able to begin the negotiation of the differences which are important and relevant to her in becoming a mathematics teacher in the UK. Elsewhere both women felt that these differences were unacknowledged and although this offered the comfort of invisibility it left them to face the task of resolving them alone. The challenge of creating a training environment where highly skilled migrant teachers can be supported in the early stages of their careers in making the socio-cultural adaptations necessary to become UK mathematics teachers is one not only for their colleagues in mathematics departments. There is a challenge for the wider school community to recognise and celebrate the diversity that the European Union has brought amongst both teachers and pupils.
References


Financial Times (180609) Belfast Roma Families Flee Racist Attacks last accessed 121109 at www.ft.com/cms/s/0/5e316c38-5b9f-11de-be3f-00144feabdc0.html

Financial Times (300109) Oil Refinery Strike Spreads last accessed 121109 at www.ft.com/cms/s/0/3c08c7a0-eeb7-11dd-bbb5-0000779fd2ac.html

Financial Times (051109) Failure of Imagination last accessed 121109 at www.ft.com/cms/s/0/27f6ee9c-ca42-11de-a3a3-00144feabdc0.html#


Morokvasic, Mirjana (2004) ‘‘Settled in Mobility’: engendering post wall migration in Europe’

Guardian 101009 The winner of the Nobel prize for literature 2009 recalls her treatment by the Romanian Securitate last accessed 121109 at www.guardian.co.uk/books/2009/oct/10/herta-muller-nobel-laureate-memoir


The role of power relations in a community interaction project in a Visual Communication Design course

Elmarie Costandius
University of Stellenbosch

Intro
Reflection begins when a person experiences forms of discomfort, uneasiness or apprehension (Dewey in Bringle & Hatcher 1999). When one walks into a class and sees 99% white students at Stellenbosch University’s Visual Arts department it could leave one with a feeling of uneasiness, or it could look very ‘natural’ and go unnoticed. One would choose the latter when ones ingrained perception of what is ‘natural’ has been influenced strongly by what happened in ones past and by how much one had been exposed to realities other than ones own frame of reference. I could choose the former because I struggle with the guilt of working in an environment that is not inclusive of other cultures. It is possible for both scenarios to exist simultaneously in one person. The colonial/apartheid and post colonial/post apartheid past created contrasts in one’s mind that confuse and therefore are often silenced (Jansen 2009). The results of the silences often manifest in anger and a feeling of loss of power, or the opposite, of living in the illusion or fantasy that nothing has changed. In a classroom where students are not exposed to social or economic realities of the communities one kilometer away from the university campus, it is possible to continue the illusion that nothing has changed. This was the reason why the Community Interaction (CI) project has been introduced in the VCD course. After three years of running this CI project I suspect that not much change in perceptions has taken place. In this paper I look at the result of focus group interviews with 28 third year students. This paper forms part of my PhD, which also includes interviews with lecturers and the learners from Kayamandi high school who participated in the CI project.

Historical context
We cannot escape power relations. Foucault (1998) remarks that power often comes in a subtle form; one that is mobile and tenuous and that forms a dense web, with the potential to shift society, fracturing unites physically and mentally. The historical and broad context wherein this CI project exists, as part of the students’ curriculum, is the colonial and apartheid past. Investigating the colonial and apartheid past, and how that influences current views, perceptions and reactions towards other people, could be valuable. Giroux remarks (in Freire’s 1985:xxiv) that “a critical sensibility is an extension of a historical sensibility”. He stresses the significance of the historical by saying that “to understand the present, in both institutional and social terms, educators must place all pedagogical context in a historical context in order to see clearly their genesis and development”. Said (1994) emphasises the effects of the colonial expansion that was not only geographical but that also influenced and manipulated knowledge and culture. The identity constructions of the colonised and the coloniser were formed in the process. Hierarchy and typologies in society were formed between the coloniser and the colonised, and thus the concept of them and us formed. Smith (1999:23) also underlines the fact that colonisation brought fragmentation and often confusion because of the disruptions in cultures on both sides.

Education and the curriculum
All of South African life bears traces of the power relations and structures that are a legacy of the past. These traces are especially evident in South African tertiary education institutions. Historically Afrikaans institutions, like Stellenbosch University, seem to bear a heavier burden than their historically English counterparts, because of associations with the founding of the philosophical justification for apartheid on its campuses and the adulation of some of the architects of that system’s iniquities in its halls of power.

The education that students receive at such a burdened institution is never objective. Several authors emphasise the contextual demands of time and place. Giroux’s “new sociology of education” challenges the notion that

---

1 Community interaction or community engagement is the overall description for projects or interactions between the university and a community. Service-learning on the other hand is a formal module which is incorporated in the curriculum.
2 The current CI project involves 28 third year students and 22 grade eleven high school learners. They meet every Wednesday afternoon and work together on art projects.
3 My deduction is based on the content that students produce in their practical work. For instance one student completed a documentary about historical events in Stellenbosch and included only events that she could find documented in the museum and archive, not realising that only a fraction of the history was documented and what was documented was subjective.
4 Kayamandi is a suburb in Stellenbosch. Informal settlements such as Kayamandi are referred to as townships.
knowledge is objective, stating that it is rather a “particular representation of the dominant culture, one that was constructed through a selective process of emphasis and exclusions” (Giroux, 1985: xv). Weedon (1987) situates the education system “at the heart of the mechanism of power”, because it satisfies the demands of the dominant group, as exemplified in the values and preferences espoused by a specific educational institution. At such an institution even the textbooks are not void of cultural and political influences, as Apple (1979) argues when he says that educational texts are very often shaped to be political acceptable.

A curriculum is shaped in complex and subtle ways by cultural perceptions and political expectations. Barnett (2008) even postulates the existence of “a curriculum within a curriculum”. The curriculum in theory, and the way it is presented in practice, can be two very different animals. Barnett (2008) therefore advise looking beyond only the skills and knowledge that are developed by a curriculum, to focus also on the people who study and those who lecture. A curriculum is shaped by the attitudes, expectations and expediency of the decision-makers, who decide on inclusion or exclusion and the prominence of cultural values depicted in the examples, course material and projects that form part of the course.

For an example of the results of such decisions of inclusion and exclusion we do not have to cast our net very wide. The recorded history of colonialism started out as such an exercise. It left out the voices of the colonised. As a result, South African universities were established within the framework of Western knowledge production – a system that Tarc (2005) calls “an illusion of stability”. The illusion was unstable in the local context in part because it excluded African indigenous knowledge, and did not examine the legitimacy of the Western norm. This led to the formation of a fixed notion of knowledge that was deemed to be universally applicable. At least nowadays Stellenbosch University endorses critical thinking, but then it seems to happen very much within the Western framework.

Methodology
For this study I worked in two phases, first with the interpretive paradigm and then with a critical theory paradigm. The aim with the interpretive approach is to understand the context and qualities of a specific phenomenon. The interpretive approach requires reflection on the social construction of data, and sensitivity to contradictions, interpretations, distortions and biases of the narratives generated (Klein & Meyers, 1999). The agenda for critical theory in research is to change and empower. Critical theory in education, according to Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2007:27), seeks to establish how educational institutions maintain or reduce inequality that is again reproduced in society; how power is produced and reproduced through education; who benefits from this power; and how legitimate these preferences are. The aim of critical theory in education is transformative: to transform individuals to a democratic society. A case study research method was used for this study.

Data collection and discussion
Qualitative data was collected via focus group interviews with 28 third year students, two black\(^5\) students and 26 white students\(^6\), exploring their experience of the CI project. Jansen (2009) speaks of “knowledge in the blood” which is knowledge that is ingrained in the mind and exists across generations. For Jansen “knowledge in the blood” refers to and is embedded in the emotional, psychological, spiritual, social, economic and political facets of life. I have taken these themes, which I relate to power relations, as the framework for my interviews.

Because of the apartheid past and the residues of colonialism, the emotions involved when interacting with people who were until recently considered as the ‘enemy’ and ‘rooi gevaar’ (red danger)\(^7\) is surely present. One student said that “this is all I know” and “I react in a certain way because this is my reference”. Another student mentioned that “my sister was killed in a motor accident and it was four black men in the car that crashed into

\(^5\) I use the government classification of all people being disadvantaged in the past as being black. Black therefore now includes the previous regime’s categories of ‘coloured’ and ‘Indian’.

\(^6\) The disparity in the choice of 2 black students and 26 white students was due to the limited number of students (a total of 28 third year students) available for the study.

\(^7\) The rooi gevaar referred to the fear of communism that will infiltrate and destroy the nation, a fear that was created during apartheid in the media.
her car. It was very difficult not to jump to stereotypes when something like that happens”. The same student said that she is not angry about this incident but “I joined a charity group and in that way deal with my anger”.

Another student started the interview by saying that “I do not want to hear anything about apartheid, I did not create that system”. My reaction to that was that the black student sitting opposite him is still suffering the consequences of the past that he denies having any part in. For a moment their eyes met and there was a short silence. The white male student then said “I did not think about it in that way”. These emotions are present not because these students were experiencing apartheid themselves as such; they were six to seven years old when apartheid was demolished. These emotions have been transferred by the previous generations of parents (Jansen 2009).

The psychological aspects involved are complex and more difficult to pinpoint. Colonialism and apartheid formed and influenced both the oppressor and oppressed. The results are students with ingrained perceptions and stereotypes of each other. The perceptions and expectations of the other could also influence self-confidence. The one black student said “I wish I could be invisible”. The implication of that is that she is not comfortable with being black in her class situation. The difference between income groups can also affect relationships in a class situation. Money gives one confidence and power. The strong link between money and confidence, and the importance of this link in Western capitalism, means that the economically well-off still form the dominant group.

One of the black students said that “Stellenbosch is not inviting to black people, and black people are not prepared for this environment”. Saying that black people are not prepared for this environment implies that their realities are different and that there is not space for that difference in Stellenbosch. The student’s acceptance of the situation (“we should be prepared”, instead of “give us space for difference”) could be a result of the past power structure of white over black. It could also be a result of the minority position that these black students find themselves in. A black lecturer also said that “black students are not as demanding as white students, they respect older persons and accept structures because this is the system they are brought up in”.

A black student mentioned that “My black friends are now more racist than when they arrived here in Stellenbosch”. I then asked her what about herself and she answered “no I am not racist”. I could gather that this was said because of the power position that I was in at that moment. This brings into question the reliability of these interviews because of my perceived power relation position. One could then ask whether it would be possible to get to a deeper level of investigation when the relation is not equal. This is a limitation of a study such as this.

The students were rather non responsive when I put ‘white guilt’ on the table, except for one student who remarked that “God says that we should not live with guilt”. I then reacted by saying that you mentioned before (paragraph 2 of this section) that you joined a charity organization to deal with your anger, and could this then also deal with guilt? She then half-heartedly agreed. The student then pointed out that she worked very hard for the CI project, and added “I feel it is my Christian duty to do so”. The problem with the charity or missionary approach is that the person performing the charitable deed stays in the giving position, a situation that does not necessarily open up a space for equal interaction and learning from the other. The relationship stays one of providing to the needy. This hierarchy of whites who are seen as knowledgeable and blacks who are seen as needy can be entrenched as a result of artificial integration, even though it might have been done with the best of intentions. Biko (2004: 23) warns against the “vague satisfaction for the guilt-stricken whites” of exactly this kind of artificiality, the danger of which is quite evident when the racial statistics underlying this CI project are kept in mind: 90% of the students are white, 100% of the community they work in is black.

The reaction of students at the end of the interviews was that if they did have these conversations before the CI project, they would have experienced the project differently. A student also remarked that “we know it is a veneer” referring to the artificial way the CI happened. Another student mentioned that the tension in the group

---

8 The interview with Mlobo Jabezweni formed part of the data I collected for my Masters thesis in 2007.
9 The lecturer also stressed that this is mostly true of rural communal families where strong hierarchical systems are still evident, but nowadays that might not be valid any more of people living in cities. Russell (2004), in contrast, argues that traditional kinship continues in urban areas in South Africa in a similar way, with neighbours and friends as the extended family.
is so visible as they talk to ‘their group’ in different corners of the classroom. She also said that “it is good to talk about these issues” and bring these hidden obstacles to the forth. Jansen (2009) refers to the silence that exists in the Afrikaans community and the fear of talking about the apartheid past. The power of silence is that one is not exposed and one does not have to confront something that is might hurts.

**Suggested module**

The full impact or consequences of the actual interactions of the CI project have not been assessed or addressed in the past because it is very difficult to measure attitudes. Literature on CI and Service-Learning (SL) is often idealised and very little is written about what is not achieved by CI and SL; what is missing when interaction stays on the surface and when perceptions are perpetuated. With the results of the interviews the following adjustments to the current CI programme are suggested.

With the information gained from the focus group interviews, a new module for CI is proposed. It would become a module that is fully integrated in the curriculum. Instead of giving art projects to the group, learners and students will first decide themselves which need in the community they want to address. Not deciding on or controlling what the interaction will be then also adjusts my own power position from that of a lecturer to that of a facilitator. Freire (1975:143) refers to the effects of “banking education” where the student becomes the container and “adapt[s] to the world of oppression”.

An orientation session will be introduced where facilitators, learners and students can discuss silenced issues of the past which will provide opportunities for the module to have a deeper and lasting effect on all participants. Issues such as social justice, social change, human rights, common good, rights and responsibilities, participatory decision making, recognizing local or indigenous knowledge and democracy and diversity could be included as themes for discussion. Teaching methods such as in-depth dialogue or Socratic learning could be used to open up obstructions to learning in both facilitators, students and learners. Critical reflective exercises on interactions could be an effective way to reassess own perceptions and expectations. Ethical and legal risks as well as emotional risks will be discussed at the orientation session. The risk of perpetuating stereotypes and power relations will be debated because perceptions are socially constructed and pre-existing (Trope & Gaunt 2003:191). There is also the risk of uncontained emotions when opening up sensitive issues, and a psychologist could be employed as a facilitator to contain emotions in a class situation.

An introductory course in languages such as isiXhosa and Afrikaans could be introduced in the orientation weeks, because language and culture is connected. Brand (2004:27) argues for the inclusion of African languages in the educational curriculum in South Africa because languages, according to him, are not “neutral and interchangeable” and cannot be separated from knowledge and culture. African indigenous knowledge would follow naturally from the inclusion of African languages in a curriculum (Brand 2004).

Research should be integrated in the interaction and will contextualise incidents and issues theoretically and historically. Kowalewski (2004) refers to community-based research (CBR) that could be a form of action research and emphasises that CBR will help students develop critical thinking skills regarding structures of oppression and injustice. Gibbons (2005) emphasises the need for a contract between partners that does not only include outreach but also intensifies ‘in-reach’, that includes teaching and research connected with the interaction and for the benefit of the society. Gibbons (2005) also refers to socially robust knowledge where interaction and research is a joint production of knowledge. Boyer (2000:146) refers to Geertz who argues that “we need a new formulation, a new paradigm of knowledge, since the new questions don’t fit the old categories”.

**Conclusion**

I have come to the realisation that interaction with communities other than one’s own could be a way to come to terms with the past and build on a future, through real dialogue and critical reflection. In a class of 90% white students this interaction is not currently taking place for either the students or myself. A new module integrated

---

10 Reference was made to De Paul University Faculty Manual 2004.
11 Teaching the Afrikaans language could be problematic because during apartheid, language was used as a tool of oppression, and Afrikaans is still associated with oppression. English is considered as a neutral language and used as the mode of communication between learners and students.
in the curriculum is suggested that could create an environment where interaction on an equal basis could take place. Gibbons (2005) refers to a new type of contract between society and science where society has a voice and can speak back. Perceptions will not be challenged when they stay subconscious and when a notion such as charity is the motivation for the interaction.

One could argue that attitudes for social responsibility or good citizenship cannot be taught and students simply follow an example set by parents, family, community or lecturer. If a strict hierarchical structure is followed in class, that will be repeated in society. If students in class do not feel free to express opinions or differ from those expressed, this will be repeated in interactions with communities. With a history of apartheid and colonialism I believe an example is not enough to address emotional, psychological, social, economic and political issues. Without intentional and critical reflection the perception of what is ‘natural’ and what is ‘unnatural’ cannot be challenged.

Sources consulted


Tarc, MT. 2005. Education as humanism of the other. Educational Philosophy and theory. 37(6) 833-849.


Psychogeographic Mapping and Community Building

Gillian Cowell, The Stirling Institute of Education, Stirling UK (Gillian.Cowell@stir.ac.uk)
Gert Biesta, The Stirling Institute of Education, Stirling UK (Gert.Biesta@stir.ac.uk)

Q: How can we understand the role of adult education in processes of belonging and community formation?

Introduction

Social cohesion has emerged as a major theme in recent government policy (see, e.g., Green, Preston and Janmaat 2008). Many social problems are understood as the result of a lack of social cohesion so that a strengthening of community relations is seen as a solution for these problems. Whereas social ties can play an important role in individual and social well-being, the idea of social cohesion tends to refer to a notion of community based on commonality, common action, identity, and harmony, rather than plurality, difference and multiplicity. In this paper we report on a small pilot project in which we used psychogeographic mapping (Debord 1955) both as a research approach in understanding how community is enacted and as a tool for use within community education aimed at making connections across difference.

Background

This paper is based on a pilot project that centred around activities with four residents from an area of a large semi-rural town in Central Scotland. Two of the residents were relatively new to the area and two had been living there for a considerable length of time. The project consisted of three stages: (1) gathering data within a psychogeographic discussion group involving mapping exercises and historical imagery; (2) analysing the discussion group outputs which were then layered over ‘official’ maps; (3) interpreting how residents created their community at three levels (spatial, temporal and experiential) through the creation of a psychogeographic map, which also acted as the data presentation stage. The resulting map highlighted community as a spatial (physical) place which is experienced in very different ways and over very different periods of time. The map is also a way of presenting a ‘whole’ picture of the discussion which at the same time evidences the different ways that residents experience and use the community, historically and contemporarily. We argue that the psychogeographic mapping method of researching with residents of communities is both a valuable educational research instrument as well as a useful tool for use within community education practice.

Location of the Study

The study took place in the Greenhill area, a semi-rural ‘village’ located within a larger town in Central Scotland. Greenhill has recently expanded dramatically with a 62% increase in its population since 2001 as a result of a high number of private houses built around the traditional Greenhill council estate (Falkirk Council 2009). This has created a complex mix of new, expensive houses built on greenbelt directly across from a council estate, both ‘sides’ located in a post-industrial area. The residents of the ‘new’ neighbourhood are mostly from outside the town and have moved in to an area which has specific characteristics, histories, paths, routes and landmarks (hidden, present and absent) that make the environment a very unique place in which to live from the perspective of inclusionary and exclusionary space. The area itself was of economic importance until the 1970s, and has
experienced significant decline since then. In the project we encouraged, to use Arendt’s (1977) phrase, ‘newcomers’ and ‘oldtimers’ to come together to learn about their place from each other’s perspectives.

**Theoretical Framework: Psychogeographic Mapping**

We were interested in how the theory of psychogeographic mapping as a methodology could help us in understanding the different ways in which community is experienced and enacted. Its focus on the subjective, objective and intersubjective elements that make up individuals’ interactions with public spaces helped to develop a unique research methodology with inherent methods that could usefully be applied within community educational research situations.

The term ‘psychogeography’ is attributed to Guy Debord (1955), a prominent member of the Situationist International (1957-1972), a group active in attempting to overturn existing “practices of history, theory, politics, art, architecture, and everyday life” (Sadler 1999, p.1). Debord saw psychogeography as a methodology for transforming urban existence for increasingly political ends (Coverley 2006) and described it as “(t)he study of the specific effects of the geographical environment, consciously organised or not, on the emotions and behaviour of individuals” (Debord 1981, p.5). Originally, its development was a result of the Situationist agenda to disrupt the group nature of the ‘urban masses’ which they believed was directed by the capitalist making of ‘habits’ (MacFarlane 2005). Situationists thus developed concepts such as the ‘dérive’ (the drift) that encourages wandering in relation to what attracts you, encouraged to “(s)hed class and other allegiances and cultivate a sense of marginality” (Bassett 2004: 401). As MacFarlane (2005, p.1) highlights: “By forcing an arbitrariness of route, and insisting on pedestrianism, the dériveur was, in theory, brought to experience astonishment upon the terrain of familiarity, and was made more sensitive to the hidden histories and encrypted events of the city.” The potential of psychogeographic mapping is not limited to its use at an individual level. It is rather when individuals collectively engage in the construction of psychogeographic maps through conversation and interaction that the multiple, complex and often contradictory ways in which common spaces are inhabited can become visible.

In this way psychogeographic mapping has the potential to move away from the idea of community as commonality, which problematically signifies consensus, towards understanding plurality and difference. It does so predominantly by bringing the experiential into the spatial, thus troubling the idea of ‘objective space’ (Biesta 2006, chapter 2). Additionally, spatiality evokes a history that is included in the experiential – predominantly through historical memories of space and location, in traces and artefacts of time past. Consequently, psychogeographic mapping also has the ability to bring temporal dimensions into the space (Biesta & Cowell, in press). If we begin by assuming that community is not an objective phenomenon but exists in and through the ways in which individuals act and interact (‘community as enacted’), the ways in which such actions are intended and experienced (‘community as experienced’) and the ways in which these actions and experiences are located in space and time (‘community as inhabited’ and ‘community as lost and found in its past and present’), psychogeographic mapping thus materialises as a powerful tool for researching the enactment of community in its experiential, spatial and temporal complexity.

We will proceed with explaining how psychogeography involves the development of ‘strange maps’ as a way of evidencing place and space, and we will present the idea that such maps can be used within a community education setting to show the extent to which residents navigate and learn about their place and other places from different perspectives.
The Visual Psychogeographic Map

The psychogeographic tradition of map-making was undertaken most prominently in 1956 and 1957 by Debord and Jorn (in Sadler, 1999) who cut up maps of Paris, demarcating working class zones and communication and travel between these zones (Figure 1).

Figure 1: Debord and Jorn’s psychogeographic map

The visual representation of the psychogeographic map stems from the Situationist concern with the structuring of cities, the way that they are divided into quarters, based on class and occupation (Sadler 1999). Seeking ways of illustrating and visualising the ‘socio-logic’ of the city twinned with the ‘ordinary’ routine behaviour of residents was an important agenda for the Situationists. Debord and other Situationists considered that maps of Paris were too fixed. They asserted that such official maps encouraged navigation around specific areas predetermined by town planners and cartographers (Sadler 1999). They were therefore an impediment to creativity and to following one’s own path and the paths of others. The scattered pieces on the map and the arrows between the ’zones’ show the places of importance and the routes between the places. The distances between zones have no resemblance to physical distances. Thus it is possible for one zone that is miles apart from the other to be close together in a psychogeographic map as this depends upon the experienced connections between those zones for the individuals concerned.

We are concerned with the potential for a renewed definition for community education that takes into account the potential for meaningful and transformative community formation between resident and place through the application of psychogeographic mapping. Thus, fundamental questions concerning community engagement as an educational process bound up with residents’ interpretations of how they enact ‘community’ in their public sphere are of vital concern for research in this field, particularly where policy seeks to enhance this relationship through notions of citizenship and community cohesion. When the construction of psychogeographic maps is conducted collectively, it can make for rich interactions between residents about their usages and experiences of common spaces and places. This, in turn, can generate a kind of learning that not just reflects upon the multiplicity and complexity of common spaces and places but that, at the very same time, contributes to the construction and maintenance of such places and spaces. In this way psychogeographic mapping can engender forms of civic learning that are not orientated towards the construction of an overarching consensus but that rather allow for the presentation of and engagement with a plurality of perspectives in a way that is appropriate for those living in not looking at the place in question (see also Biesta in press).
**Psychogeographic Discussion Group**

We conducted one discussion group following psychogeographic principles, with four Greenhill residents: two residents who had moved to the area from outside Bonnybridge within the last ten years, and two who had lived in the area a considerable length of time. The group followed the format of a traditional focus group but the design was changed into an explicitly mapping-oriented discussion.

We utilised an interview guide to aid discussion, and within the group we included a contemporary map of the area for use within the discussion to encourage residents to weave in and out of spatial (the places and routes on the map) with the experiential and temporal (what a map cannot portray, nor what a cartographer can mark, as the place emerges through a personalised interaction). Historical photography was also utilised to move the conversation between spatial and temporal. Each resident was given a pack of stickers and a coloured pen and chose one colour for all mapping interactions. This assisted with analysis later to understand which areas were most used and known and how the colours interacted with each other. It was also important to identify residents by colour and not name.

The discussion group schedule was as follows:

1. Place a coloured dot where you live, and places you’ve lived in the area in the past.
2. Discuss Greenhill: what are your thoughts about it?
3. What do you think about it as a community?
4. Place a triangle at areas you visit.
   - What places do you go to within Greenhill and what do you know about them?
   - How do you get to these places?
   - What places do you stay away from and why?
   - Place coloured lines on paths you frequently take, and state whether by car or on foot.
5. Place happy and sad faces in areas with emotional significance and explain (if you want to).
6. Discuss something about Greenhill’s history that you want others to know about.
7. What major changes to Greenhill have you witnessed since you moved here?
8. Anything else?

It was important to encourage participants to share with each other:

1. The physical places they know about and use and in what ways, to provide an idea for the spatial (physical) place, how far it extends on a map and how it is experienced. This moves knowledge towards community-as-enacted.
2. The places that are of importance to them personally, and why, in order to build up an idea for the temporal dimension, or community as lost and found in its past and present.

Experiencing the community from the eyes and actions of others was a fundamental part of the study. The resulting map from the discussion session can be seen below.
Figure 2: results from mapping discussion session
Figure 3: Psychogeographic Map
Data Interpretation and Presentation: The Psychogeographic Map

The creation of the psychogeographic map, above, served as a way of building up the various ‘interaction zones’ we ‘visited’ within the discussion, the interactions between each zone and the experiences with each zone over various periods of time, past and present. Such a map is a visual representation of community formation and how each participant ‘belonged’ to the place they built. Derelict spaces and overgrown paths were experienced anew, taken out of private consciousness into becoming a public concern, for both new and old residents. Developing the concept of psychogeographic mapping into a data gathering tool widened the traditional focus group by involving a physical map, mapping exercises and historical visual prompts to aid discussion. The presence of the map focused the discussion on how residents use and experience the area over different points of time. It also encouraged residents to see the usually unseen and through conversation widen and further their ‘everyday’ use of the community’s spaces. The process of creating the psychogeographic map is first and foremost an attempt by us to visually interpret the knowledge sharing undertaken and a representation of the social and physical landscape formed by older and newer residents through mutual learning. We consider that the evidence of the significance of certain areas to its older and newer residents lies on objective (spatial), subjective (experiential) and intersubjective (formation of the area through understanding others’ conceptions of the place that are different from ourselves) levels. The point of the map is to show a shared world, not an individual world (but also not necessarily a common world), a world that is appreciated, known and used in very different ways but creates a picture that can still maintain that place’s important attributes and special sites. Therefore, the map is explicitly built from the data to evidence how people of difference perceive and experience the place, and how these were tested, expanded and contested by each other through conversation. The map is not agreement nor cohesion but rather disagreement and difference, both of experience and of use, and most importantly, over different times, thus adding back in forgotten places that have been lost from contemporary maps, buildings that have now gone, routes that are now overgrown but still navigable.

Based on the discussion with residents on the time periods they were referring to, we utilised paper maps from different decades, cutting and pasting the resulting ‘interaction zones’ to form a psychogeographic map. The known and used spaces of the old and new residents were thus represented. The map was a tentative step towards showing the use of psychogeographic mapping as a representation of the historical and present-day Greenhill, as seen through the eyes of its old residents as they engaged with new residents in learning from each other about the area. Once the interaction zones had been placed according to where residents discussed use and knowledge on each zone, we then positioned the zones according to how distant they are from each, and placed arrows of movement and flow between each zone. Thus, the placing of each zone and the distances between each are not physical representations of the community but rather perceived distances based on how the residents discussed using, experiencing and understanding the community. The resulting psychogeographic map created many different versions of the place to emerge as a whole picture, which is made up of different versions of physical space and community enactment. Each zone surfaced to create a ‘strange’ map created through the multitude of landmarks, pathways, people, signs, perceptions, experiences and knowledge of residents as they negotiated different meanings and uses of their shared common spaces. Relational elements between residents and spaces were also evidenced, as could be seen through the negotiation of meanings for local walking routes, places of significance and the old/new divide. New residents experienced the community as it had been from the 1930s onwards; older residents viewed the spaces of importance to new residents through contemporary eyes. We consider that the psychogeographic map shows this quite explicitly in the stark contrast between contemporary and historic map objects and how these fit to still allow for navigation within the difference.
The map explicitly shows the tension and perceived distance between the two housing ‘sides’ created by migration (old and new) on the map by creating coloured and black and white zones of housing. Greenhill Road separates both estates and we have thus placed both quite separate from each other, which although not the case spatially, is an interpretation of the distance and division discussed by all residents in their experiences of living in the place. In terms of what residents say about the spaces around them, on the psychogeographic map we have attempted to represent this by bringing in the industrial estate, Murnin Road and Allan and Moffat Places as close to each other and in colour mainly because these areas were places they explored together from a present-day point of view. Each resident’s knowledge was furthered through discussion with other different ways of exploring and knowing which can be seen on the map by the way that an old route will join a new route, or where older map ‘objects’ (or pieces of knowledge) are placed next to newer elements which form different versions of what can be ‘seen’ and experienced in the physical and social spaces. Use of the area by residents is evidenced in the way the map ‘flows’ through the inclusion of arrows, showing how residents moved around the places and routes of importance, where they stopped to ‘look’ (e.g. Lochgreen, Skipperton, Antonine Walls on both sides) and how this conversation over difference helped to develop a picture made up of diverse elements. Temporal elements were evident throughout the mapping conversation, and the inclusion of historical pieces of map within the psychogeographic map are an attempt to evidence historical areas that were lost and are now found through conversation and become a disruption to the visual. The map shows the history through placing these map objects near or far depending upon the conversation, and how ‘present’ residents felt the history to be and the effect it was still having on their lives in the area.

**Conclusion**

To us, psychogeography is an appropriate theory with relevant historical foundations that can make visible the layers of interaction between residents, and between residents and their place. Through harnessing the psychogeographic theoretical methodology we were able to present and engage with a plurality of perspectives in ways allowing for a more extensive engagement with place, rather than a superficial gaze. Psychogeographic mapping can both elicit data through discussion and negotiation and develop a physical ‘strange map’ to evidence the data.

The process was instrumental in encouraging residents’ eyes to wander across the topographical map according to routes and place names that were brought to their attention by the others. Residents (newcomers and oldtimers) were surprised at what they did not know about the area and discussed that the process has extended their spatial knowledge, and they intend to enact what they learned in the discussion session. Equally, sharing stories and experiences of the place enriched and enlivened the map, transforming it from a flat surface to a vibrant three-dimensional world. Through the process, residents discussed how they were unsure of specific pathways and where they went to; other residents helped to extend their knowledge of what lay beyond their experiential knowledge towards the unknown and residents were thus surprised to see how much further they could walk, and that they could utilise other paths that had previously been unknown. The restriction of being limited by an unknown landscape was markedly addressed within the discussion session, where residents were made aware of different ways of using and experiencing the landscape from the perspective of new and old residents. Older residents experienced the physical space anew with a contemporary outlook. Official knowledge, shown here perhaps in the form of the physical map, as seen to be restrictive or impersonal was not totally the case here. Our observations and evidence shows that the map actually helped to widen knowledge of physical spaces, and the discussion surrounding those spaces added the temporal and experiential layer to help make the place a rich and meaningful place to live daily life.
The map created within the discussion group shows how older and newer residents used places, the colours assigned to residents show their diverse usage of places and the knowledge exchange that occurred. Additionally, a common theme was that residents learned as they navigated the map with others, encouraged to develop their own meanings, uses and interactions over the course of the discussion session and beyond. The main purpose of this research was to discover whether it was possible to generate opportunities that encourage multiple ways of being and seeing in the area, and at the same time contribute to the construction and maintenance of the places and spaces discussed. The extent to which this has been accomplished can be seen in the psychogeographic map which represents the area from different perspectives whilst still allowing the viewer to see the importance of these spaces at an experiential level. The process helped to create a different engagement with place, community and togetherness, one that not necessarily strives towards commonality or identity, but rather builds connections across quite different experiences, perceptions, histories and interpretations. In this way it showed the potential of psychogeographic mapping as a tool in community education. At the same time the project helped us to see the potential of psychogeographic mapping as a method for gaining an understanding of the dynamics of community-in-difference.

References


ESREA Conference Paper

‘Belonging to be different: How can we use Critical Race Theory to improve adult education?’ by Anita Franklin and Yvonne Channer

How can we understand the role of education of adults in processes of belonging and community formation?

In this paper, two Black scholars from different institutions, teaching adults on two different work-based social science programmes investigate the ways in which Critical Race Theory (Gilborn, 2005) can alert us to the various levels of race bias in academic settings: for example - the classroom, curriculum, student services, administration, representation within the staff and student body.

In particular we theorize our experience of two courses, both unusually with a significant Black presence. The two courses, which focus on community development and social work, respectively, may show us how an appreciation of Critical Race Theory can improve Higher Education for all thereby contributing to the formation of a more equitable HE community.

In the case of teaching social work we will explore how ‘counter stories’ can be used to challenge raced assumptions about groups and individuals. In listening to their stories we hear how students express their yearning to be an integral part of the university culture. In relation to teaching community development we will examine the role of policy and education reform within the project to widen participation among under-represented groups in Higher Education. What we find here is that there are serious questions which need to be asked about how education policies skew community formation in particular ways.

We conclude that by viewing adult education through the lens of Critical Race Theory, educators and policy reformers could enrich the tertiary sector and include those groups within society which are still seen as marginalized through ‘race’ and or ethnicity.

In the first section of the paper I want to share with other educators some of the key ideas that constitute CRT and at the same time share how these ideas
have crystallized for me in the wake of my work as Course Leader for the Working With Communities Programme (WWC) at the University of Sheffield (Franklin 2010). Being the first foundation degree at this Yorkshire-based Russel Group University, and housed within one of the few remaining departments of adult education in the UK my colleagues and I have learned a great deal about the challenges of asking older institutions to behave in new ways.

**Critical Race Theory comes to the UK**

As first articulated by Matsuda, et al then re-conceptualised in relation to education (Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) before being translated into the British context by Gilborn (2005) there are 6 unifying themes that define the movement associated with Critical Race Theory. These are Matsuda, etal 1993: 6)

CRT recognizes that racism is endemic to American life (UK as well)

CRT Expresses scepticism toward dominant legal claims of neutrality, objectivity, colour blindness and meritocracy

CRT challenges ahistoricism and insists on contextual/historical analysis

CRT insists on recognition of the experiential knowledge of people of colours and communities of origin in analysing law and society

CRT is interdisciplinary

CRT works toward the elimination of racial oppression as part of the broader goal of ending all forms of oppression.

It is becoming widely acknowledged by educationalists such as Scott (1995), Trow (2000), and Martin (2003) that universities must change in deeply radical ways if they are to be seen as contributing to social and economic
sustainability. Race relations are an important part of Britain’s social fabric and even the THES is quick to point out that Race Equality isn’t just nice—it’s a duty (THES 8 July 2005). On the other hand, in the absence of political scandal connected with race and higher education, there appears to be no agenda for urgent reform let alone radical transformation. Indeed with student participation rates among black and minority ethnic groups at 13% of HE total as compared with BME groups constituting 6.5% of the population (Pathak 2000) HEIs have been content to allow the overall expansion in HE to address the issue of inclusion of BME groups. But there has been a problem and that problem is that more HE places has not resulted in narrowing the gaps between BME groups and white groups in relation to experience of and rewards associated with higher education but has actually exacerbated the gaps (Blanden and Machin, 2004). Indeed policies that widen participation have been much more helpful to middle class white groups than BME groups. This is an example of what CRT refers to as interest convergence. Studying instances and patterns of interest convergence in policies reveals how political accommodation or concessions won by BME groups do not only benefit BME groups, but are designed to benefit white groups primarily, resulting in a relative widening of gaps between groups. Another issue related to interest convergence is the way in which status around any particular societal good is massaged downwards as it becomes more available. So for example Foundation degrees allow for more people to have some experience of higher education while at the same time protecting and strengthening the traditional BA. Paul Gibb’s acerbic article, Who Deserves Foundation Degrees? offers a detailed critique of government policies which he argues has amounted to the creation of a second class status in relation to foundation degrees. And certainly a visit to the web sites of Russell Group universities indicates the
relative lack of foundation degrees in these institutions as opposed to the so called newer universities.

Russel Group institutions also remain the most white and middle class (Pathak, 2000). And both sets of universities continue to exclude BME staff particularly from middle and high levels of management (THES, 2005, Wright).

Policies in the tertiary sector have focussed on building partnerships with industry as envisaged in the government’s vision of foundation degrees (DfES, 2003), DFES (2004). Such policies have focussed some attention on how best to raise skills and aspirations among students who are not as academically prepared as those who come to us with the best A level qualifications. I wonder how many universities have also used these policies to enable them to create courses which serve a multitude of purposes while at the same time not addressing the overall character of the university culture. Particular courses and academics could be used in cynical and soul destroying ways to make universal claims that only one or two terribly vulnerable courses can justify.

If the UK is to meet the targets set out in the Leitch Review of Skills (2006) where by the year 2020, 40% of the adult population is in possession of Level 4 qualifications and above, significant changes in universities’ practices will need to be made. Our pedagogy and institutions will need to accommodate traditionally excluded populations and to inspire learning among those who have never found formal education inspiring before. If Universities are to become a part of regeneration and community development, not simply a body rewarding those who research about it, then higher education teaching will need to be given serious consideration and will need to rewarded fairly.

Increasingly universities will need to provide flexible courses to meet the needs of a student population who work full or part time. Part time study could become more of an option for students given the prospect of sharp increases in fees and the dark spectre of heavy loans. And we need to look at how to create a more inclusive university cultures. But more importantly we need to
be alert to the ways we are worsening gaps between groups. For example do foundation degrees (seen as widening participation) simply compound the problem of race and class privilege in HE?

I have also introduced a new method of learning about the student journey. This has come about via the use I make of a short research module to supplement my understanding of the students’ experiences of teaching and learning on the course.

The unit is titled Doing Projects That Make A Difference and it is taught at level 2 for 10 credits, and represents about 25 hours of contact time, in class and tutorials. By the time the students take this module they have been in the institution for about 2 years part time and as such will be well familiar with the course and the support services that are on offer. I use this module to assess students’ ability to practice various research skills that they have acquired within the course. At the same time I also ask that they use the module to find out about student experience of the course for the purpose of improving student experience of the course in future.

I have found this unit to be a more useful technique for improving the course than student evaluations, for example. In the case of Doing Projects That Make A Difference, students decide which questions to ask and therefore prioritize their own experiences, recurring issues and ideas for change.

In the end there were 3 main areas that were flagged up as a result of the research students did among themselves about their experience of the course. The overall issue they agreed to research among themselves related to barriers to higher education.

1. Students expressed the view that the main barrier was age. Friends and families in their communities often expressed the view that the learner was too old to be going to school, etc. As a result students felt that they had to be very circumspect talking to others about their studies and often had to let go of certain relationships that were not supportive.

2. The next barrier identified was lack of affordable and accessible childcare at the university. Learners who were mothers found the crèche full or too expensive to use. Forms for application for financial
assistance were seen to be demeaning and too intrusive personally. Students often helped each other to find suitable child care. My own observation was that issues around parental and elder care were much more difficult to surmount and that we lost students on account of these issues.

3. The third barrier was inadequate employer support. The vast majority of students are funding themselves and are not given much time from work to attend class and do the necessary study to support learning. Students have used their annual leave in order to attend classes, even though the course clearly related to the position the students held in their community organisations.

The issue of employers’ lack of support has been felt most strongly in the progression between Foundation Degree and BA degree. Studying the reasons successful Foundation degree graduates gave for not continuing their studies onto the level 3 BA part of the programme, most cited lack of employer support in relation to time. This small-scale finding is in keeping with other research about progression from Foundation to BA in the UK (Dodgson and Whitham 2003, Gorard, et al (2006).

In conversation with students after the module ended students also continued the conversation about barriers in smaller groups and with me. In smaller settings Black, Asian and mixed race students students raised racism as an issue and pointed to a number of instances where they were acutely aware of the course as being a race anomaly at Sheffield University.

The first point mentioned was the instance when the head of the social sciences faculty was brought in to the class by the HOD to see the group. The second was they way in which they were treated in the DES building initially, the third was the experiences they had with student services and other parts of the university. I asked students why they did not bring up these issues in class. Over and over again students said that they thought bringing up race would be divisive, embarrassing, and/or unproductive. ‘Our group has enough problems without going there’, said one student, alluding to some of the clique behaviour she had encountered In another words students understood among themselves that (even with a black tutor) it was not safe to talk race in the
fragile and artificially coloured world of WWC. Another student said that she was also concerned for me as Black person working in the university. A British Pakistani Muslim woman said to me, ‘You are a role model for us but it can’t be easy for you here. Isn’t it better in America?’

Indeed many black social scientists from the UK believe it is marginally better in the US for black academics, as indicated by the fact that according to the THES over 40% of black social scientists leave the UK, for other countries, such as the US.

If we are committed to inclusion and mass access to higher education these findings suggest that there remains a lot more work to do not only around the students experience but that of BME academics as well.

Of course this brings us to the issue of ethnicity in the labour market. Unlike white groups the relationship between education and employment is not straightforward. Education does not necessarily guarantee success in the labour market for ethnic minority people.

‘Members of ethnic minority groups take longer than whites to achieve the same level of qualification...the length of time spent for example by second generation ethnic minority men to achieve the qualification has a positive association with unemployment. Therefore the time spent by ethnic minorities to achieve qualifications is actually disadvantaging them in the labour market’. (Pathak, 2000: 11-12)

What this tells us is that many BME groups are caught in a terrible pincer movement. Excluded from many courses due to poor results, many BME learners turn to adult education to improve their education and their prospects in the labour market. The time taken to make such improvements is counted against them in the labour market. The adult education path to combine both work and study has been narrowed by government policy promoting foundation degrees. Foundation degrees themselves are incomplete Bas. Your employer may give you some time for the FdA but not for
the BA. The university will allow you to complete your BA, but only if you do so within 3 years of getting your FdA.

In conclusion to this section of the paper, promoting inclusion among BME adult learners in higher education is not in itself regarded as an urgent matter for concern. In spite of race relations legislation and HESA guidance universities’ status continues to be associated with research, exclusivity and elite culture. Credible undergraduate courses are BAs and their quality are rated according to the number of points (A Level grades) required to gain a place.

This section of the paper reflects on race bias in classrooms and the curriculum; how counter stories can be used to challenge ‘raced’ assumptions about groups and individuals; and finally how an appreciation of Critical Race Theory (CRT) can improve the learning experiences of Higher Education (HE) students.

A black American student stated:

“There comes a moment in every class when we have to discuss ‘The black issue’ and what is appropriate education for Black children. I tell you, I am tired of arguing with those White people, because they won’t listen. Well I don’t know if they really don’t listen or if they don’t believe you. It seems like if you can’t quote Vygotsky or something, then you don’t have any validity to speak about your own kids. Anyway, I’m not bothering with it anymore, now I’m just in it for a grade.” (Delpit, 1988)

A black British student stated:

“I think I made the wrong decision on the CQSW, (Certificate of Qualification in Social Work) that I spent more time hammering on about the black perspective on race, and that was detrimental to the academic stuff, and when I read back I thought there was too much emotion and not enough reading. So this time ... it (the course) felt like it was already a struggle and I already don’t have enough time to do it ... so just let me put down what they want. That affected how I felt about completing it.” (Channer and Doel, 2009)

CRT authors suggest that a factor contributing to the demoralization of marginalized groups is self-condemnation. ‘Members of minority groups internalize the stereotypic images that certain elements of society have constructed in order to maintain their power.’ Delpit (1988) argues that one of
the tragedies of education is the way in which the dialogue of people of color has been silenced.

The theme of ‘naming one's own reality or ‘voice’ is central to the idea of CRT authors. They regard the concept of ‘voice’ as a way to communicate the experience and realities of the oppressed. The ‘voice’ of the oppressed is integral to a thorough analysis of the education system and is the opening stride towards fairness.

Addressing socially constructed reality and the psychic preservation of marginalized groups are two of the reasons CRT scholars give for the importance of the focus on 'naming' one's own reality or 'voice'.

The above quotations are clear evidence that in many settings and even internationally, black students (BS) often do not have supportive learning experiences. Yet universities appear to be unaware or neglectful of responding to the needs of this student group.

A recent pilot project which aimed to permit BS to speak freely about the concerns referred to in the above quotes was thwarted by staff whose philosophy and social construction did not reflect student's views. The social work programme included a unit which aimed to inform students about how to offer help to social care users in the context of groups or groupings e.g. working with families, group care settings such as older people's homes or children's homes. The second dimension of the unit gave attention to the experience of being a group member. Following many complaints, over many years the unit staff agreed to a pilot project to give BS the opportunity to work together during the unit. Being in a black only group would give black students an opportunity to identify learning needs, which specifically relate to their professional practice as black practitioners.

It is fair to observe that black only groups are not 'typical' in British social work settings and therefore a concern could be raised about the extent to which working in racially separate groups could benefit black or white students. A response to counter this concern highlights the fact that this unit is only one-sixth of the whole year’s diet and within the unit students also work as a whole group.
The following section of the paper outlines the universities decision to cancel the project, their socially constructed story which is inevitably designed to keep them in power (Channer, 2006), is countered by BS views.

The unit began with 5-6 keynote lectures; these were delivered in a variety of styles e.g. didactic, interactive and experiential. All students were required to attend these sessions. At the start of the unit, staff members determined the membership and size of subgroups. The subgroups were usually randomly selected avoiding groups of students who may have in common professional or personal interests. Group size was between seven and nine students.

The subgroups met weekly and worked on a task, which culminated in a presentation at the end of the unit. Consultation times with tutors were written into the timetable. These sessions allowed students space to discuss unit content and group process issues with staff. At a midway point in the unit all subgroups met with tutors to assess the progress of the subgroups' activity. (Channer, 2006).

As justification for the cancellation of the project university managers argued that tension created when consideration is given to the learning needs of individuals and groups in terms of racial background, is not beneficial in the curriculum and class room setting. To counter this view BS said:

"Learning was different in that we were able to discuss issues with 'ease' – no fears of making people feel uncomfortable"
"We shared experiences and learnt from each other working together dealing with difference of opinion" (Channer, 2006).

The decision to cancel the programme seemed to ignore advice from learning style experts (Kolb 1984) that an emphasis on empowerment, feeling valid enhances learning experiences. In contrast the BS group said:

'Ve felt empowered as a group of black women and able to share feelings that we wouldn't have shared if white people were in the group' "As a black person, the learning experience changed giving me a feeling of empowerment"
"I had a feeling of empowerment as a black person in a majority white student group" (Channer, 2006).
Most universities appear to believe that they provide programmes which present/offer a relevant range of perspectives that appropriately connect with student lived experiences. To counter this ‘story’ the student said:

“The value of sharing experiences in an all black group was new. Different black perspectives – we are not a homogeneous group however collectively we do share similar experiences in relation to the black experience.”

“Being in a black group I learnt that others had experienced similar situations as me, which enabled me to relate and understand social exclusion more clearly. It was a real learning experience”

“I felt my group worked very well together as we were able to relate and share experiences that in turn resulted to a very positive outcome. It enabled me to discuss matters that would never have otherwise been addressed in a mixed group. Thank You!”

(Channer, 2006).

In summary, the BS views presented in this paper demonstrate their appreciation for the transforming experience permitted during a brief time while at university. The paper identifies pedagogically sound perspectives which appear to clash with political views from the ‘masterscript’ (Ladson-Billings, 2005).

How can the ideas examined in this venture be implemented elsewhere?

What factors could minimize the negative response of policy makers, managers and other staff in Higher education?
References


Guardian, ‘Things of Archaic Wonder they may be but a medieval outlook won’t pay’,
http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2009/jun/11/university-funding-fees-mandelson

http://www.publication.parliament.uk/pa/cm200708/cmselect/cmdius187/187.pdf


Solorzano, D. G., and Yasso, T. J. (2002) Critical Race methodology; Counter-Story Telling as an Analytical Framework for Education Research, Qualitative Inquiry 8; 23.

Times Higher Education Supplement, ‘Race Equality isn't just a nice idea, it’s a duty’ 8 July 2005


Responsive Approaches to Adult Education: 

Antithetical to Social Integration?

Lindsey Fraser, University of Leeds

Introduction

This paper arises out of debates in the UK about the concept of multiculturalism and its impact on social cohesion. As adult education practitioners who work in what Lemos terms ‘super-diverse’ neighbourhoods (communities that comprise of people from a wide variety of cultural and ethnic backgrounds as opposed to a ‘host community with a small number of identifiable minority groups’), we, in the Communities and Partnerships’ (C&P) team are constantly debating the most effective ways of reaching those communities that do not participate in adult learning. Through analysing aspects of our practice in relation to policy, this paper will explore whether adult education which targets particular minority ethnic communities contributes to alienated ghettos ‘which produce young men who commit mass murder against their fellow citizens’.

The C&P team in the Lifelong Learning Centre, University of Leeds, works with economically and socially deprived communities throughout West Yorkshire, in the north of England in order to encourage progression from non-participant groups to higher education. This University has a proud history of working class adult education and although the focus of outreach has changed and adapted over the years to respond to higher education policy and funding streams, the ethos of social purpose and social justice has remained constant. We have built a trusting and mutually beneficial relationship with a range of community-based partners, both in the voluntary and statutory sectors, who enable us to work with low-aspiring groups. Our practice adheres to what Veronica McGivney calls a ‘segmentation’ approach to recruitment, curriculum and delivery methods ‘specifically tailored to the characteristics, circumstances, priorities and norms’ of a small and clearly defined target group.

Multiculturalism

The concept of multiculturalism which has been developed changed and adapted in the UK since the 1970s has come under severe criticism in the 21st Century. The Salman Rushdie
affair, the bombings in New York, London and Madrid as well as riots in towns in the north of England has led to multiculturalism being blamed for a multitude of problems. ‘We are sleep-walking our way into segregation’ asserted Trevor Phillips, Chairman of Commission for Racial Equality. The former Home Secretary, David Blunkett blamed forced marriages within particular communities and female circumcision on multiculturalism. Multiculturalism was suddenly held responsible for a lack of national identity, segregation and lack of social cohesion.

In practice, there have always been different levels of multiculturalism from celebrating cultural festivals to the institutional challenging of structural equalities. There has been a much greater level of multicultural activities in geographical areas with diverse communities. Until recent migration trends, there had been little compunction for rural or affluent suburban areas to take on board multiculturalism.

Since 2001 there has been a continued questioning of what is Britishness, how social and community integration are addressed in the light of security threats, urban unrest and the new influx of new migrants, refugees and asylum seekers. The defenders of multiculturalism see ‘no incompatibility between multiculturalism and Britishness. According to Sir Bernard Crick, the UK has always been a multicultural society’ made up of a diverse range of cultures and identities and one that empathises the need for a continuous process of mutual engagement and learning about each other with respect, understanding and tolerance. However the influential Cantle report which paved the way for a new policy direction asserted that the separate cultural development, encouraged for decades, was to be subsumed to the demands of ‘community cohesion’. Arun Kundani describes the Cantle proposals as, ‘a set of core values to put limits on multiculturalism and black people are required to develop ‘a greater acceptance of the principal national institutions’. He then suggests that the report is stating that racism itself is to be understood as an outcome of cultural segregation, not its cause.

McNair surmises that the ‘backlash’ against multiculturalism ‘is often focused on those communities that do not integrate especially when they are perceived to have allegiances outside Britain which are in some way threatening to the host community. Any references to separate identities, segregation, parallel lives implicitly alludes to Muslim communities
Britain’s minority ethnic communities in general. The negativity against multiculturalism by politicians and commentators is usually coded commentary for anti-Islamic sentiment and blaming the Muslim community. An article written in 1992 by the former Conservative Chancellor of the Exchequer, Norman Lamont was entitled, ‘Down with multiculturalism, book-burning and fatwas’. Rod Liddle, a prolific commentator wrote a piece entitled, ‘How Islam has killed multiculturalism’. Particularly since 2001, the Muslim community has been conveyed by many in the media as being the ‘enemy within’ and this labelling seems to be common throughout Europe where the extreme right has been able to tap into a very rich vein of anti-Islamic sentiment. The case study below concentrates on work undertaken with the Muslim community.

**Adult Learning, Multiculturalism: Policy and Practice**

In this section I will look at how the debates around Multiculturalism have affected policy, particularly in relation to adult education. The government repeatedly endorses the UK as a multicultural society but seemingly with some regrets. A government minister in the Forward to the Community Cohesion Panel report, 2004, states ‘...even if we wanted to, we cannot turn the clock back, millions of people from minority backgrounds.. (see Britain) not only as their home but also their country of origin. However the report goes on to describe the negative impact of ‘parallel lives’ and recommends that, ‘we need a type of multiculturalism where everyone supports the values and laws of the nation, whilst keeping hold of their identity’.

Community cohesion, social cohesion and integration are the current policy goals. A manual published by the Department for Communities and Local Government gives guidance in how to build community cohesion. The Commission on Integration and Cohesion report, ‘Our Shared Future’ (2007) gives guidelines for greater integration between communities and recommends that state funding for community groups should not generally be given to a single ethnic or faith group.

However an outreach guide for public service engagement with communities, published in 2006, endorsed by the same department, recommends outreach approaches that target non-participant communities and that demonstrate ‘visible, tangible commitment to addressing specific needs of that community’. A recent guide from the National Institute of
Adult and Continuing Education (NIACE) on ‘Curriculum for Diversity’ (2007) with a forward written by a government minister makes a strong case for targeted provision especially given the exceedingly low participation rates in non-vocational adult learning by certain ethnic minorities. Many of the case studies that are cited describe practice by particular ethnic or cultural groups. Recent funding for informal learning has been distributed to a variety of groups and organisations. These have included single national and cultural groupings. A sizeable proportion of a reduced adult learning budget is allocated to English language and citizenship courses for migrants. Finally government funding which has been targeted at challenging extremism has been allocated to local communities which include faith and cultural groups.

Therefore there seem to be some contradictions between different policies and practice, on the one hand recommending funded activity for integrating communities but on the other, recognition that ‘hard-to-reach’ communities require differences of approach. In our experience there continues to be a lack of diversity amongst community groups with vested interests determined to keep the status quo. We see a plethora of groups that include settled minority groups such as Pakistani, Bangladeshi, Caribbean, Indian and Chinese communities and more recent clusters of migrants. Actual practice demonstrates the complexity of ensuring equity in an increasingly diverse society and this is not captured in the glib rhetoric of integration.

The remit of C&P incorporates work targeted at adults who are economically and socially disadvantaged as well as an outreach strategy that is inclusive of all communities under-represented in higher education. Our Islamic Studies programme is an example of adult education that is flexible and responsive to a particular community’s need. It provides academic and challenging curriculum, different to the usual provision of functional courses e.g. sewing and childcare courses for the women.

**Case Study: Community-based Islamic Studies Programme**

The Islamic Studies programme has been running since 1995 as a direct response to request from a local inner city Muslim community who expressed concerns about their lack of knowledge pertaining to religion and Islamic culture. This is an interdisciplinary secular programme which includes Arabic language, history, law, theology, art, cultural, political and
gender studies. The programme has grown from very small and local beginnings to now being delivered at 9 community locations throughout West Yorkshire with over 190 participants. The venues range from small community organisations, family learning centres, schools and local libraries. Requests for courses tend to come from community workers or centre managers and we cannot fulfil demand. New curriculum is developed in negotiation with the student cohort. There is a direct full-time progression route into the Arabic and Middle Eastern Studies Department at the University of Leeds. Inner city socially deprived areas are specifically targeted but the courses also attract a cross section of both Muslims and non-Muslims from a wide age range. A high proportion of students are women. The success of this programme in reaching people whose families have no experience of higher education is due to a number of factors:

- delivery in community settings and negotiation with groups on times, location etc;
- partnership working with local providers and organisations;
- staged progression delivered in the community by ourselves or partners;
- incremental familiarisation with the campus and facilities;
- additional support requirements e.g. childcare;
- ongoing impartial advice and guidance and tailor-made learner support.

**Commentary**

So, does our delivery of an Islamic Studies programme predominantly to British Muslims hinder the UK government’s goal of integration and community cohesion?

A focus group of tutors and in-depth interviews with a group of students have contributed to our analysis. The pool of eight tutors, men and women, come from a range of backgrounds. These include British Pakistani and Bangladeshi, Lebanese, Syrian, Palestinian, Egyptian, Sudanese and Pakistani. Tutors indicated that classes combining Muslims and non-Muslims are preferred to all Muslim groups. Mixed groups are seen as more challenging, more likely to be questioning and increase the level of criticality and academic analysis to the subject area, ‘it makes for a better teaching environment and promotes understanding’.
However tutors and students have also discussed how Muslims are living in a hostile environment where they are reminded daily by the media and politicians that their community is under scrutiny. Therefore it is crucial that the programme can take place in an atmosphere where students feel safe and secure and where discussion can take without fear of ridicule, racism and oppression.

All who are involved in this programme are keen to stress its uniqueness in enhancing the knowledge of a subject that both Muslims and non Muslims have little understanding of as well as providing a progression route for people who are traditionally unlikely to have connections with a University. Tutors feel that the university engagement is crucial, that they are not proselytising, not taking a particular Islamic ‘line’ but are opening up the subject area to rational and objective debate and that it is being taught and quality assured in the same way as any other university subject. Students travel large distances to attend this programme because local Islamic teaching may be partisan and is of varying quality.

Of importance to students is the opportunity to analyse the difference between their cultural practices and Islamic teachings as often they have been bounded by traditional practices and sectarianism within their communities. Again they require a safe space to reflect and explore their different identities without feeling that they might be stereotyped or condemned. Because of these fears, students often ‘self-censure’ and the tutors discussed how the media, foreign policy and the rise of the extreme right has an impact on the quality of analysis, critical thinking and wider perspectives.

**Student Voices**

Riffat: …they give a different view – when you change to these courses, they open a different door to it: What is the Qur’an and Hadith, what is faith?

Peter: My interest in doing the course was because I feel that we in Britain need to try to understand the profound changes which the future will bring, especially in West Yorkshire as we move into a true multifaith society.

Nadya: I always wanted to learn about my religion and I wanted to learn the way this course teaches – the wide view – not from one narrow point of view – the community we were living in and the religion we’ve been taught was just through a keyhole really…and then we came to this course and it’s helped me to look at religion in a wider range and there was nowhere else I could go…It opened other doors for me…I can see more places and more options…
Shazia: ...it’s an intellectual way of teaching. What we learn from mosques...it’s more practical. This helps because it goes into a more detailed, intellectual way of teaching...the tutor knows about this world [Britain] as well and then he explains about the other world...to compare and learn.

**Tutor’s Voice**

We are trying to give people a greater sense of identity and confidence and therefore belonging to both this society and to the Umma – the worldwide community of Muslim. The women are having to deal with racism and sexism, they are living in patriarchal cultures and have to deal with these oppressions... Muslims here have to reconcile Islam and identity with European values which they are told are in binary opposition – Islamic fundamentalism and the fundamentalism of capitalism, 'If you're not with us, you're against us'.

Students do have a radical change of attitude...they start to understand that they have a commonality of values. At the beginning of the course students, both Muslims and non-Muslims can be on the defensive, they can self-censure and they stereotype. There are very diverse opinions in Muslim communities but one thing they have in common is anger, they want to know why they are being portrayed as they are...The Iraqi war really affects the students. They feel a widening gap between them as Muslims and the rest. They want to know about Islam and are desperate to understand what is going on.

As indicated previously, programme staff, tutors and students see great merit in classes including both Muslims and non Muslims. However, in my opinion, more fundamental than mixed classes is the development of academic skills including critical thought and a questioning mentality, engendering curiosity about wider perspectives and environments. In our experience it is developing these skills and gaining an excitement about learning which encourages people to wish to look further than their own life experiences. Hence in one way the subject area is irrelevant, we are seeking to inculcate the joy of learning and acquisition of knowledge. With this particular community, religion and culture is our starting point.

**Conclusion**

So we return to the question whether responsive provision is detrimental to the aim of social integration. We would agree with McNair that adult education can help by, ‘providing everyone with accessible neutral territory where they can meet, interact, build trust and relationships with people of different backgrounds and overcome some of the myths about ‘outsider’. Higher education has a key role to play as a neutral, non partisan, inclusive player in adult learning. However as McNair also points out, the government agenda of
prioritising learning for work has eroded the community development learning undertaken with community groups by all educational providers.

Our discussions with colleagues and students lead us to believe that work with mono ethnic/cultural groups can support integration, if the curriculum is challenging and brings wider perspectives into that community. This is certainly not the case with curriculum targeted at minority ethnic groups. White and Weaver describe such provision as ‘mainly falling under the umbrella of arts and crafts, with titles like, ‘Scratch your way to success’, ‘Learn how to become a DJ’ (both probably targeted at African Caribbean young men), Hat-making for the over-60s (aim at Caribbean women) and ‘A stitch in time – make your own sari’.

The Islamic Studies programme, on the other hand is negotiated curriculum, using people’s lives, experiences and interests, to provide academic input to a community which has become increasingly separate. The religious link has been crucial to being able connect with and educationally progress people who would not normally have any engagement with higher education. Moreover, we are as keen to work with white working class communities where the far right has increasing influence, and although we undertake outreach and non formal provision, we have yet to find curriculum that has the same amount of leverage as Islamic Studies with the local Muslim population.

We have seen how the state contradicts itself in policy and practice. On the one hand foregrounding integration and on the other recognising that in order for public services, including lifelong learning to be utilised equitably, there needs to be targeting of non participant communities. ‘Target courses precisely at specific communities or groups within groups – particularly beneficial in trying to attract women from (some) Asian communities.’ This is one of White and Weaver’s recommendations in promoting adult learning best practice work with minority ethnic groups. Working with diverse communities is a complex business where all will agree with the value of mixed provision, however there is also a need for engagement with alienated communities. We would go back to first principles of community learning - tailor provision to group and individual needs.
There are a number of areas that I am conscious this study will need to address in future - a) the debates around multiculturalism having diverted attention away from issues of class inequalities and institutional racism b) the discourse on integration, assimilation and acculturation and c) multiple identities and cultural relativism.

The final thought on multiculturalism, I leave to Lord Parekh:

‘Multiculturalism basically means that no culture is perfect or represents the best life and that it can therefore benefit from a critical dialogue with other cultures. In this sense multiculturalism requires that all cultures should be open, self-critical, and interactive in their relations with each other’

Endnotes


ii Brown, A. (2002) Do We Need Mass Immigration? The economic, demographic, environmental, social and developmental arguments against large-scale net immigration to Britain, London: Civitas Institute for the Study of Civil Society


Op cit

Op cit

Op cit
References


Brown, A. (2002) Do We Need Mass Immigration? The economic, demographic, environmental, social and developmental arguments against large-scale net immigration to Britain, London: Civitas Institute for the Study of Civil Society


Accessed 27 November 2009


Lindsey Fraser,
Communities and Partnerships
Lifelong Learning Centre
University of Leeds
l.fraser@leeds.ac.uk

November 2009
Borders, Glass Floors and anti-racist Popular Adult Education in South Yorkshire U.K.

John Grayson
AdEd Knowledge Company and Sheffield Hallam University

The paper reflects the views and practice of the author, but also in the ‘we’ and ‘our’ sections the valuable work and analysis of colleagues, and in particular Marion Horton. I am of course wholly responsible for the text and any errors it may contain. A much earlier version of the paper will appear in Annette J. and Mayo M. 2010 ‘Taking Part: active learning for active citizenship’ Leicester: NIACE

The Context:
South Yorkshire is a classic example of a UK subregion devastated by deindustrialisation in the 1980’s and 1990’s with the virtual disappearance of coalmining and steel. Despite European ‘structural fund’ programmes and a range of state ‘Regeneration’ and ‘Neighbourhood Renewal’ initiatives many parts of the area continued to be amongst the poorest areas in the North of England. By 2003 it was clear that South Yorkshire was changing rapidly again, this was not surprising. Europe has rapidly become a test bed for ‘business rule’ (or neo-Liberalism), and a headlong retreat from the Welfare state values of post war social democracy or reformed communism. This headlong rush to bring back the crude and unregulated market to economic and social life has been led by the Blair government in the U.K. In South Yorkshire the impacts of privatisation and continued loss of manufacturing jobs has created a low paid economy with ‘trash’ jobs (see Lash and Urry) in the service and communication sectors. This rapid change has created an atmosphere of personal and family, job and economic, insecurities. It has fostered neighbourhood anxieties and fear of ‘crime’ and ‘disorder’. Globalisation of labour markets has rapidly increased flows of migrant workers and ‘illegal’ migrants. In the U.K, particularly in the old industrial areas, like South Yorkshire it is linked to a politics and media more and more proclaiming bigotry and intolerance, and mindless nationalism, typical of, a country, actually at war – at war with ‘Terror’, and the peoples of Iraq, and Afghanistan.
Common Sense Racism?

Political and media discourses, within which popular adult education operates, by 2003 had forefronted the manufacture of fear in communities, with the demonising of the migrant, and the ‘asylum seeker’ as the root of social ills. The Northern riots in the former textile towns of Bradford, Burnley and Oldham, 9/11 the Iraq War in 2003 and the London Bombs in 2005 further heightened tensions. As Sivanandan has put it we faced ‘a politics of prejudice and fear to create a culture of xeno-racism and Islamaphobia; the asylum seeker at the gate and the shadowy Muslim within’ (Sivanandan 2006 see also Kundnani 2007).

The result was the generalising of a ‘common sense racism’ infecting debates and political practice. Symptomatic of this was the rise of the Fascist Right, the BNP (British National Party). Yorkshire became the fastest growing region for racist parties, and election of BNP councillors. By May 2004 126,000 people voted for the BNP in European and Local elections in Yorkshire and the Humber region, in 2009 a BNP MEP was elected for the region. In Barnsley, the BNP were able to field 14 candidates in 2006 and 18 candidates and garner 8,000 votes in May 2007 and 21 candidates in 2008.

To a large extent this resurgence of a dormant racism in British popular culture and politics, what Paul Gilroy has called ‘postcolonial melancholia’ (see Gilroy 2004, Gilroy 2006) has been fuelled by a moral panic on migration and rapid changes in the ethnic makeup of the population of Britain. The last ten years and particularly since 2004 with enlargement of the EU there has been a migration of workers and refugees to the U.K. on a scale greater than the migration of workforces from the West Indies and the Indian subcontinent, and Africa in the 1950’s to the 1970’s.

Citizens, Refugees and now ‘Illegals’

Recent legislation and events in the U.K. have gradually redefined citizens and the very meanings of citizenship. Asylum seekers and refugees, and migrant workers ‘without papers’ are simply seen as ‘illegal’. Being born in a country no longer always gives one citizenship, nor does marriage. Citizenship in the UK has to be earned through language tests and history quizzes. ‘Illegals’ are not people who have committed illegal acts: stripped of their rights, their very person, their identity is illegal. The UK Audit Commission estimated in 2006 that there were 285,000 ‘failed’
asylum seekers who have no legal status or state support, and are being pursued for deportation (Narey 2006 p.32). In 2009 hundreds of destitute asylum seekers have been identified in cities like Leeds and Sheffield. (see Lewis, Crosthwaite and Grayson). Steve Cohen has memorably described their Orwellian treatment in his book ‘Deportation is Freedom’ (Cohen 2006).

Media languages betray the insidious process of labelling which begins to redefine politics (see Fairclough). The emergence of a category called ‘illegals’ is a fundamentally new twist to state racism. The spectre of a Nazi-type legal world looms with people without any rights, who can be abused and detained without recourse to any legal protection. A recent LSE study of ‘irregular residents’ (migrants and their children) estimated their number at 863,000 in the U.K. (see Lavalette and Ferguson 2007). A wider category of ‘Illegals’ in the U.K. who include ‘failed’ asylum seekers and undocumented migrant workers number anything between one million and two million people. Millions more live in E.U. countries, twelve million in the U.S.A. (See Legrain 2006). Thus citizenship in Europe is now about both ‘inclusion’ and ‘exclusion’, and internal ‘borders’ are now as important as frontiers. (See Balibar 2004). Judith Shklar describes ‘a symbolic glass floor - citizens exist above the floor and can look down on those beneath who are excluded from citizenship and are thus the most deprived in society’ (quoted in Lavalette and Ferguson 2007 p 118).

Cosmopolitan communities have literally been conjured up almost overnight. Rural areas in Yorkshire have a labour force dominated by migrant workers. In what was the steel and coal heartlands of the U.K. where a few African Caribbean and British Asian people came to work in the 1970’s. Some of our housing research in 2006 discovered a Slovakian and Czech Roma community in Rotherham and Sheffield of around 1500 people. (Grayson, Horton and Petrie 2007). Their presence has gone unreported, and they already outnumber ‘indigenous’ Romany Gypsies in the area. Sheffield is one of the UK’s main centres for Somali settlement contributing nationally to the largest Somali community in the world outside Somalia. In the 2001 census Sheffield had 8% of its residents from BME (Black and Ethnic Minority) origins. In 2007 30% of births in the city were from migrant families. (Sheffield City Council) The global has certainly become local. As Paul Mason has put it ‘A culture that took 200 years to build was torn apart in 20…Today in place of a static local workforce working in the factories and drinking in the pubs their grandfathers worked and drank in, a truly global working class is being created’ (Mason 2007 p xi)
Beyond Rights to Responsibilisation

U.K. Justice Secretary and former Home Secretary Jack Straw has recently restated a central theme of UK public policy over the past few years a process of ‘responsibilisation’:

*There has been considerable progress in the development of a legal and social architecture of rights internationally and at home – the strengthening of the status of the individual, if you will. But what has been the effect? It has led to an imbalance whereby the importance placed on our responsibilities has not developed commensurate to the expressions of - and the understanding of - our rights.* (Straw 2009)

The rapidly changing cosmopolitan face of South Yorkshire acted as a crucial backdrop to anti-racist work. The popular adult education programme was developed against an equally important backdrop of new discourses around disputed definitions of active citizenship and civil liberties.

By 2003 there had been a drift into a world of state social policy dominated by the ideas of the conservative communitarians of the U.S. (see Etzioni, Fukuyama, Putnam) In this world citizens already have gained their rights. What they have to share with governments and political elites are responsibilities. In this world it is not the wealthy that have to develop ‘responsibilisation’, but the poor and the socially excluded.

Community workers and adult education ‘trainers’ are told local communities, particularly poor and working class communities, need ‘capacity building’, and more ‘social capital’ to exercise these responsibilities. They have to take responsibility for their own poverty, for crime and ‘community safety’, and now British Asian ‘communities’ are told they have to take responsibility for ethnic divisions, even ‘terror’. The UK government’s ‘Prevent’ programme calls for the ‘targeted capacity building of Muslim communities’ (Kundnani 2009 p.6).

‘Active’ citizens in their positive roles according to the New Labour definitions should restrict their activism and work in partnerships with the local and national state, or follow the middle classes and become volunteers, consumer lobbyists, and givers to charities and media ‘appeals’. 
The Problem of ‘Order’

In the U.K. in recent years public discourses around racism, active citizens and community ‘engagement’ are often combined with an overpowering emphasis on social order and punitive policing at local levels, and a very negative social and political image for young people allegedly the main perpetrators of ‘anti-social behaviour’ (ASB). This is a serious issue for popular adult education because often the active citizens who emerge in this climate are those demanding a ‘law and order’ quick fix from government. (See Thompson) We already have more surveillance cameras in the UK than anywhere in Europe (4.2 million, 1 for every 14 citizens) and yet community activists demand even more. Community activists are invited to join ‘the police family’ as neighbourhood wardens with some police powers, and volunteers working in police stations. The UK (excluding Scotland) has now the largest data base of DNA in Europe with one third of young Black British men represented there. The European Court has recently demanded that it is reduced. A nation of citizens is becoming a nation of ‘suspects’. The Labour government has introduced around 3,000 new criminal offences and a whole raft of ‘anti-terror’ legislation, during its time in office. The results of these trends have led to a dramatic attack on the ‘civil liberties’ of minorities, activists and young people. (see Atkins, Bee and Sutton). England and Wales with a record 82,100 citizens in prison in January 2009 (Ministry of Justice p.4), probably the largest prison population in the EU, had in 2006, 3,350 young people (under 18) in custody, and has prosecuted 210,000 young people for criminal offences. England and Wales lock up 23 children per 100, 00 population France 6, Spain 2 and Finland 0.2 (Campbell 2007). A nation of citizens is also rapidly becoming a ‘custodial democracy’.

The U.K.’s support for the ‘War on Terror’ and the effects of the London bombings of July 2005 has added the notion of ‘secure communities’ and ‘anti-terror design’ for public spaces. New programmes from the government emphasise this agenda of Preventing Violent Extremism (PVE) linking police intelligence gathering to local youth work, adult education and ‘community development.’ Community cohesion programmes are now ‘Prevent’ programmes

‘There is strong evidence that a significant part of the Prevent programme involves the embedding of counter-terrorism police officers within the delivery of local services, the purpose of which seems to be to gather intelligence on Muslim
communities, to identify areas, groups and individuals that are ‘at risk’ and to then facilitate interventions’ (Kundnani 2009 p.6).

**Theorising and clarifying anti-racist Popular Adult Education.**

Popular adult education work needs to be rigorously theorised and self–reflective to give confidence to practitioners and coherence to programmes. There is also a need for an interrogation of theory. With this conflictual context for anti-racist popular adult education in the UK it is important to interrogate and critique ideologies, theories and shifting concepts which underpin public policy which can then be translated into ‘really useful knowledge’ for both the work, and information and resources used in the work for developing critical consciousness.

In the UK context anti-racist practice needs to be distinguished from the dominant depoliticised notion of ‘diversity training’. As Lentin points out

‘An anti racism that seeks to relate racist practices to the disciplinary constitution of modern states, by means particularly of an emphasis on violence and institutionalised discrimination, is often thwarted by a depoliticised discourse that culturalises, psychologises and individualises them so as to relegate them to the societal margins. Policies created to combat racism during the post -war era in Europe, most notably both the assimilatory and the multicultural models as well as much of the anti-racism of progressive social movements, have contributed to the development of a view of racism as disconnected from public political culture if not also the practices of the democratic state’ (Lentin p.36)

It is important to see Popular Adult Education as a *political project*. We draw on socialist traditions of adult education critiquing and contesting ‘common sense’ and developing critical consciousness. (see the work of Raymond Williams, and Edward Thompson, Williams 1989). We see our work as providing ‘really useful knowledge’, linking to political action in a traditional popular education way This involves and demands contesting official public political culture and discourses often articulated in media images often ‘in and against the state’. We work with methods aimed at ‘myth busting’ and media critiques.

Following Gramsci we would argue for developing ‘organic intellectuals’ contesting hegemonic ‘business rule’ and values we see around us. Popular adult education
should facilitate and support political debate and political contestation. Michael Newman has recently described this as ‘teaching defiance’ (Newman 2006)

Popular adult education has a directly political and mobilisation agenda to build an egalitarian, just, ‘social’ democracy and therefore has to be realistic about its relationship to the State, educational institutions and governments. We have set out to work with and in solidarity with social movements, and our methods are influenced by feminism and ‘transformative’ theories like those of Freire (see Mayo 1999). We see popular adult education as fusing current theories in radical adult education and radical ‘community development’ (see Popple, Ledwith, Horton 2007). We also see popular adult education as emerging from engaged ‘community’, social and political research (Horton 2004 and Horton 2007)

**Popular adult education praxis**

Between 2003 and 2006 a programme of anti-racist popular adult education was developed at the Northern College. The college was founded in 1979, as a residential adult education college on the fringes of the state system in the UK, with a history and practice echoing folk high school practices in Sweden, Highlander’s approach in the USA, and the traditions of trade union education at Ruskin College, Oxford. (see Ball and Hampton). Northern College was distinctive in being rooted in its local work in the coalfields’ villages and industrial and steel communities devastated by the industrial destruction of the 1980’s and 1990’s. (see Grayson and Jackson) Developing anti racist models at the college involved tutors engaging with the wideranging debate which had begun in the UK on multiculturalism, identity, and cosmopolitanism

‘at the same time as ‘community cohesion’ and ‘integration’ policies signalled the death of multiculturalism’ (Kundnani 2007 p.7)

The work was based on what Paul Gilroy calls ‘a reworked and politicised multiculturalism’ (see Gilroy 2004 and Gilroy 2006). We instinctively felt that multiculturalism and a pluralistic integration of people and traditions had to recognise conflict and open debate. We felt, like Tariq Modood, (Modood 2004) and Darcus Howe¹.

¹ See his column in the *New Statesman* weekly for a consistent argument on this theme.
it was the emergence of social movements, and political struggles around anti-racism that
had been, in the past, the creative force for building a multicultural society.

It seemed to us that to create and to develop adult education initiatives which argued for
this through anti-racist materials and content, and through methods which gave ourselves
and students a framework and process to facilitate and support ‘political debate and
political contestation’, might be our creative response to the new racism around us.

We set out to work in solidarity with anti-racist community organisations and social
movements of refugees and migrant workers, organising around local anti racist
campaigning. Our practice was aimed at developing critical consciousness and providing
‘really useful knowledge’, linking to political action in a traditional popular education way.

Between 2003 and 2006 we organised at the Northern College a programme of
residential short courses of two or three days, called ‘Combating Racism’ to discuss and
develop our approaches with workers and activists in voluntary and community
organisations. We were not offering ‘Diversity Training’, we were recruiting from, and
resourcing anti-racist organisations in Yorkshire to develop anti-racist working,
solidarity, and strategies. This residential programme included ‘Kicking Out Racism in
Your Community’, ‘Challenging Racism for Community Trainers’ and ‘Divided We Fall:
Resolving Conflict in Communities’. We confronted media distortions with ‘Minorities,
Myths and the Media’. Working with asylum seekers and refugees, we developed a
residential version of the refugee led course ‘Living in the UK’, and a course for RCOs
(Refugee Community Organisations): ‘How to Organise RCOs’.

**Research and anti-racist popular Adult Education**

Much of our anti-racist adult education practice was developed from a research
perspective. This seems to us crucial in a world where quantitative research on ‘numbers’
of ‘illegals’ or migrants defines issues. Contesting racist data and projections we felt was
an important starting point for anti-racist work. uncontested. We actively researched
information and relevant reports and summarised them and made them available in
handouts as ‘really useful knowledge’. There has never been a more important period to
make available alternative and academic sources unreported in mainstream media. We
used materials developed by campaigning research organisations like ‘Searchlight’ for
their own educational work and campaign training.

This approach became important in work with workers and activists in the summer of
2005 after the ‘7/7’ bombs, in communities (Huddersfield and Dewsbury) from which the
London bombers originated and where the leader of the bombers was a youth worker. (See Mycroft, Weatherby, and Grayson 2005).

Participative, community based research is often a key starting point for much of our work. The methodology is important in committed research linked to popular adult education initiatives. A good example would be the work of Marion Horton whose work with Gypsy and Traveller people and organisations has been developed in part from methods of ‘close contact qualitative research’ (see Horton 2004, Horton 2007).

Here in research on health, caravan sites and housing, methods were developed emphasising solidarity and equal, respectful, culturally sensitive and trusting approaches. In research work with Gypsies and Travellers, simply shedding light on a way of life almost unknown in society as a whole, and using her findings in adult education ‘awareness raising’ sessions counters the almost universal ‘common sense’ racism against them. (see Clark and Greenfields). These research methods were used also in housing and caravan site research with Gypsies and Travellers, European Roma, and Travelling Showpeople in South Yorkshire with the ‘researched’ being involved as researchers, and the research made available to organisations and social movements for campaigns. (see Grayson, Horton and Petrie)

Using these approaches, and the networks generated by the research, Gypsy and Traveller students were attracted to the anti-racist programme.

Local research working in our practice is always put into a wider historical and political context beyond the particular group or community. This provides in particular rich historical material for anti-racist work. In Barnsley in 2007 and 2008 in a major programme of exhibitions and adult education commemorating the abolition of the Slave Trade and exposing local connections to the Trade, anti racist workshops were organised on ‘modern slavery’ and trafficking, and workshops with Roma and Gypsies and Travellers whose own history of slavery was little known to themselves or the local community. The workshops were held with a backdrop of the BNP fielding 21 candidates in local elections in May 2008. The steering group for the programme decided to confront this with an anti-racist workshop, with local refugees, artists, students, and politicians which launched a One Barnsley Charter signed over the coming months by over a thousand local people, local politicians, trade unionists, activists, and church members pledging themselves to anti-racist political values and tolerance.

Much of the local research we have undertaken is thus engaged or committed research to be ‘owned’ and used by social movements. This ‘activist research’ is continuing in a programme of interviews and research with anti-deportation campaign
organisations and antiracist organisations in South Yorkshire. (See Crosthwaite and Grayson)

**Safe Spaces working In and Against the State**

The descent of state policies to the level of a new racist authoritarianism, and ‘nativism’ (See Kundnani 2007), when dealing with asylum seekers and ‘illegals’, has produced a backlash from those working on the frontline of state services. Voluntary organisations have emerged to give ‘safe houses’ and food parcels to destitute asylum seekers. There is almost a ‘guerrilla’ mentality about in these sectors (Barnes and Prior)

Part of the Northern College popular adult education anti-racist work was to develop ‘safe’ environments and spaces for front line community workers, paid and unpaid, in the field of anti-racist community development. Thus gatherings of workers with asylum seekers and refugees were organised. In 2004 a regular workshop and support meeting for workers with Gypsy and Traveller groups was created.

Allied to these initiatives was the development of ‘awareness raising’ workshops for workers and voluntary organisations about the actual experience of asylum seekers. The work was linked to work already being developed by RCO’s and in a different context Gypsy and Traveller organisations.

**A Glocal approach**

Anti racist practice has to confront the contexts beyond the local. Working with Roma, refugees, and anti-racist community organisations and social movements, global migration and European wide public racism (see Fekete) dominate debates. Regular international people to people programmes are crucially important, and in 2005/6 we organised study visits for refugees and workers to Sweden, and Gypsies and Travellers and workers to link to Roma organisations and projects in Hungary. In September 2008 with other adult educators we organised a large and popular workshop ‘adult education to change the world’ at the European Social Forum in Malmo, Sweden.
A future for anti-racist popular adult education?

For many years socialists and those on the Left in general who have been involved in popular adult education within the publicly funded sector have been working on developing ‘spaces’ within the system. I suggested at a Sheffield workshop in 2005 that perhaps we were actually in ‘holding pens’ waiting for our demise. The central problem of course remains that in a period of ‘business rule’ rather than a ‘social’ democracy, state and government priorities are determined by the needs of the market. Vocational and ‘skills’ based programmes predominate.

Perhaps on the other hand popular adult education with its directly political and mobilisation agenda to build an egalitarian ‘social’ democracy should be realistic about its relationship to the State, educational institutions and governments. There are clearly, challenges, contradictions, even spaces still to be created within these relationships with the State, but there are also possibilities ‘beyond State funding’ in civil society in general – networks to be built with social movements, trades unions and campaigners, and new radical popular adult education provision to be created.

References and Bibliography

Balibar E. 2004 ‘We, the People of Europe? Reflections on Transnational Citizenship’ Oxford: Princeton University Press
Ball M. and Hampton W. eds ‘The Northern College: twenty five years of adult learning’ Leicester: NIACE
Clark C. and Greenfields M. 2006 ‘Here to Stay: the Gypsies and Travellers of Britain’ Hatfield: University of Hertfordshire Press
Cohen S. 2006 ‘Deportation is Freedom: the Orwellian world of immigration controls’ London: Jessica Kinsley


Fukuyama F. ‘Trust: The Social Virtues and the Creation of Prosperity’ London: Hamilton

Gilroy P. 2006 ‘Multiculture in Times of War’ Lecture at the London School of Economics May 10th


Grayson J. and Jackson K. 2004 ‘Engagement with the Community: some significant aspects of the Short Course programme’ in Ball M. and Hampton W. eds ‘The Northern College: twenty five years of adult learning’ Leicester: NIACE pp 112-130


Kundnani A. 2009 ‘Spooked: how not to prevent violent extremism’ London: Institute of Race Relations


Legrain P. 2006 ‘Immigrants: your country needs them’ London: Little, Brown
Lewis H. 2009 ‘Still Destitute: a worsening problem for refused asylum seekers’ York:
Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust
Mason P. 2007 ‘Live working or die fighting’ London: Harvill Secker
Mayo P.1999 ‘Gramsci, Freire and adult education: possibilities for transformation’
London: Zed Books
Ministry of Justice 2009 ‘Story of the prison population 1995 – 2009’ Ministry of
Justice Statistics Bulletin July London: HMSO
Modood T 2004 ‘Multiculturalism or Britishness: a false debate’ in Catalyst Winter
2004/5
Mycroft L., Weatherby J. and Grayson J. 2005 ‘After the Bombs….’ In Adults
Learning vol 17 no 1 September
Narey M. 2006 ‘Moral Outrage’ New Statesman 13th November pp 30-32
Popple K. 1995 ‘Analysing Community Work – its Theory and Practice’ Buckingham:
Open University Press 1995
Sheffield City Council 2007 Report to the Chief Executive, Community Cohesion;
Developing a new strategy June
Sivanandan A. 2006 ‘Race, Terror and Civil Society’ in Race and Class vol 47 no 3
Straw J 2009 speech at Institute of Human Rights Annual Conference Jan 28th
Thompson J. 2000 ‘When active citizenship becomes ‘mob rule’ in Adults Learning
September
Williams R.1989 ‘Resources of Hope’ London: Verso
Adult education practices for immigrants in Flanders

An analysis of the concept ‘citizenisation’

Dieter Gryp (University College Ghent, Phd-candidate)
Patrick Loobuyck (University Ghent, University Antwerp)
Griet Verschelden (University College Ghent)

Corresponding Author:
Dieter Gryp
Faculty of Social Work and Welfare Studies
University College of Ghent - Building D - 1.05
Voskenslaan 362
9000 Ghent - Belgium
T. 00 32 9 243 26 69
F. 00 32 9 243 87 93
dieter.gryp@hogent.be

1 Introduction

Despite the facts and figures on migration, a zero-immigration discourse, with the main focus on immigration restrictions, border control and closure, has dominated the debates and policy initiatives in several European countries and the EU. The discourse is also popular in Flanders and Belgium, and is used especially, but not only, by the extreme rightwing and anti-migrant party ‘Vlaams Belang’. In every discussion concerning asylum seekers, family migration and the regularisation of undocumented migrants, the discourse appears and is used to show that the Belgian immigration policy is much too open and goes in the wrong direction.

The zero-immigration discourse is not realistic. Europe is an ‘immigration society’ (Niessen, Schibell et al. 2003) and the same is true for Belgium and Flanders (Loobuyck and Jacobs, 2009a). This means that Europeans not only have to be aware that they live in a multicultural society with several migrant communities; they also have to realise that they live in a society in which newcomers and a first generation of migrants with a different culture, religion and language, are a normal part of society. Knowing immigration will not stop, implicates that there are lasting structural measures needed to cope with immigration (a policy with fair, just and transparent procedures) and integration (a policy which focuses on equal citizenship and optimal participation). Since 2003 the Flemish Community has formalised an integration policy for newcomers. This so-called ‘citizenisation’ (inburgering) has an ambitious and ambiguous goal: living together in diversity. This paper gives an analysis of how the policy of citizenisation tries to establish its goal and how the concept of citizenisation is formalised in decrees and policy notes.

2 Multi-level governance in Belgium

After several state reforms, Belgium has a peculiar and complex system of federalism that reflects a mix of territorial and cultural autonomy (Farrell and van Langenhove, 2005). Belgium is built out of three Communities (Dutch, French and German speaking Communities) and three Regions (Flanders, Wallonia and Brussels-Capital). The Regions have jurisdiction over ‘space-bounded’ matters, the
Communities over ‘person-related’ matters. In this complex multinational state, there is also a division of labour on jurisdiction over migration and integration policies. The Belgian government is responsible for immigration, anti-discrimination and the nationality law. The integration policy is mainly a local competence of the Communities, Regions and cities. Education, integration, language, housing, and matters pertaining to the religion of migrants, are all competences handled at the level of the Regions and/or Communities. This division of labour is also clear when we look at the list of ministers on the different political levels: on the Belgian level there is since 2008 a coordinating minister of migration (since July 2009, this is the prime minister himself), while in the Flemish governments (2004-9, 2009-14) there is a minister of so-called ‘civic integration’ who has the central and final responsibility for the entire minority policy.

In line with other European countries, Belgium has chosen for ‘integration’ as a central concept within the immigration policy. Integration is seen as the insertion of migrants into Belgian society according to three guiding principles: (i) assimilation where the public order demands this; (ii) consistent promotion of the best possible fit in accordance with the orientating social principles which support the culture of the host society and which are related to ‘modernity’, ‘emancipation’ and ‘true pluralism’ – as understood by a modern Western state; and (iii) unambiguous respect for the cultural diversity as mutual enrichment in all other areas. Furthermore, integration also entails promotion of structural involvement of minorities in the activities and aims of the government (KCM 1989; KCM 1993). This concept of integration has been criticized for its vagueness on the underlying model of society. Some critics argue that the concept is too much in line with the prevailing Flemish orthodoxy concerning multiculturalism (Martiniello, 1995: 140), other critics argue that the Belgian policy and integration discourse is ethnocentric and results in assimilation and ‘homogeneism’ – a fundamental non-acceptance of diversity (Blommaert and Verschueren, 1991, 1994, 1998). Moreover, and maybe most important, due to the state reforms, Belgium has little power over integration issues, except for the nationality legislation and the anti-discrimination law. Since the state reforms of 1980, the Communities have autonomous jurisdiction over the reception and integration policies of migrants. This makes it possible for the different Communities to put some specific accents in their approach to migrant policy and to tailor their minority policy in accordance with the national history and sensitivities (Loobuyck and Jacobs, 2009b&c; Martiniello, 2007).

3 The Flemish Integration Policy

3.1 The Flemish Minority Policy

The first policy statement on migrant policy was accepted by the Flemish government in March 1989. This policy was inspired by the Anglo-Saxon and (former) Dutch multicultural model. The main aim of the policy was ‘a multicultural society with intercultural exchange’, through the creation and enlargement of a categorical integration sector. In the course of the 1990’s the categorical vision was replaced by an inclusive one, with the possibility of temporary categorical measures. In 1998, the Flemish government further formalised this through the acceptance of the ‘Minority Decree’. In line with the ambitious ‘strategic plan for minority policy’ (Flemish Government, 2004), the Flemish parliament accepted a new decree on integration in April 2009 (amendment April 30, 2009).

The key concepts in this updated decree are: emancipation and equal participation of certain target groups, accessibility of regular services, and living together in diversity. It is striking that the decree
does not only have the immigrant population as subject, but also the whole society. One of the main aims for the near future is to promote the coexistence in diversity by all citizens and to further the intercultural competence of political and social institutions. Living together in a diversified society is every citizen’s responsibility. The minority decrees focuses on three levels: an emancipation policy for target groups, a social policy on the domains of welfare, health care and education, and a reception policy for newcomers. The latter is specific for Flanders (because absent in the French Community) and was formalised with the citizenisation decree in 2003.

3.2 Citizenisation (inburgering) in Flanders
Since the end of the 1990’s, there have been various local experiments and projects related to reception policy in Flanders. However, we had to wait until February 2003 for the acceptance of the official legislation about the so-called citizenisation trajectories. The citizenisation trajectories, consisting out of two main parts, are compulsory for a target group and set up under de guidance of adult educators. The primary trajectory consists out of three pillars: acquiring Dutch as a second language (Nederlands als tweede taal - NT2), orientation in the Flemish/Belgian society (Maatschappelijke Oriëntering - MO) and orientation in the labour market (Loopbaanoriëntatie - LO). In the secondary trajectory the newcomer is referred to regular social services.

The idea of ‘citizenisation’ (inburgering) is copied from the Netherlands but has provoked a lot of discussion. Most of the time, the political discussion was about the compulsory character of the trajectories. Right-liberals, nationalists and conservatives stressed the importance of ‘obligation’ and ‘sanctions’, while more progressive politicians said that obligation is only fair when there is sufficient availability of tuition and when the waiting lists for lessons have been eliminated. Citizenisation was also controversial in the migrant communities, because people usually discussed that policy in terms of ‘assimilation’ and ‘obligations’, while that policy could actually be legitimised in terms of qualification, empowerment, emancipation and capabilities. Although much has been said about the obligation, it is worth mentioning that the target group is much larger than the group that is obliged to undertake tuition. The target group has been broadened and further specified by amendments in 2006 and 2008. Most remarkable is the fact that the citizenisation policy does not longer only aims at ‘newcomers’, but so-called ‘oldcomers’ are included too. In this target group, five priority groups can be distinguished, which are entitled to a primary trajectory. All have an equal right to a qualitative citizenisation trajectory, one group is obliged.

4 Conceptual analysis of ‘citizenisation’
In what follows, citizenisation will be discussed, using the decrees, explanatory memoranda (EM) and policy notes as a starting point. The central decree is the Flemish citizenisation decree (B.S.8.V.2003, changed by B.S.9.XI.2006 and B.S.21.II.2008). Another decree of importance, is the earlier mentioned

---

1 (i) People younger than 65, established more than a year, and living of an income provided by social services; (ii) parents of school going children; (iii) candidates for social housing (Flemish Community); (iv) newcomers; (v) asylum seekers, who filed their request more than four months ago.
2 This group can be further divided into four categories: newcomers, ministers of recognised religions from non-EU countries (especially imams)(since 2007), newcomers with the Belgian nationality (established less than a year) and unemployed ‘oldcomers’ (established more than a year) (not yet into operation).
3 This paper is part of a doctoral research on citizenship in immigration societies, which started November 1st, 2009. This research will focus on central concepts used in citizenship-debates and will take experiences and ideas of adult educators in citizenisation trajectories (Flanders) into account.
Minority Decree (B.S.19.VI.1998, changed by the decree of April 30, 2009, see 3.1). The two available policy notes are from the former minister of civic integration, Marino Keulen (Keulen, 2004), and the present one, Geert Bourgeois (Bourgeois, 2009).

The definition of citizenisation, as stated in the citizenisation decree (Flemish Government, 2003, art. 2), will be used as a framework in this conceptual analysis.

An interactive process, in which the government provides a specific program to migrants4, that, on the one hand, gives them the opportunity to empower, and on the other hand contributes to the recognition of those persons as full citizens of the society, with the objective of a full, active participation and a shared citizenship of each one and the creation of social cohesion.

Central concepts in this definition are citizenisation as an interactive process (see 4.1), which offers a specific program aiming at empowerment and recognition (see 4.3). This will be analysed and discussed, to get a clearer picture of what measures are used to reach the objective: active and shared citizenship. In the conclusion, the concept of citizenship as it is intended within the Flemish citizenisation decree, will be analysed and discussed.

4.1 Citizenisation as an interactive process

Citizenisation is an interactive and reflective process and works in two directions: both the interests of the target group as of the host society are taken into account. It is a learning process in which all parties can learn from each other. But it is also a negotiation process to which everyone, individual or on the different levels of group associations, can give its own realization, provided that the fundamental rights and duties, established democratically and part of the constitution, are not negotiable (Flemish Government, 2003 – EM, p. 6).

In the policy notes there is attention for interactivity on different levels: between ‘newcomers’ and ‘oldcomers’ (in the MO-course), between ‘newcomers’ and regular services, concerning accessibility (to facilitate the communication5) and interculturalisation of these services, and between ‘newcomer’ and society. For the latter part, the Flemish Minority Centra (VMC) functions as a participating organization and works in two directions. It has to inform the public opinion correctly about integration issues and the diversity in society and, at the same time, ensure active, public participation of the allochtonous society when co-operating at shaping the integration policy.

In the most recent policy note, the current minister of citizenisation Bourgeois, announces the organization of a States General of Citizenisation and Integration in 2010, a debate that will try to discuss the problems of a multi-cultural society. It has the purpose to discuss and to find answers to cope with this complex reality, and this without further polarization between ‘us’ and ‘them’. To stimulate interactivity, the Minister also intends to increase the civil effect of the citizenisation certificate.

4 The decree of 2006 changes the term ‘foreigners’ to migrants, with the purpose of also including ‘oldcomers’ (established migrants, with or without the Belgian nationality).
5 Responsibility of the ‘Babel Tolkentelefoon’, a social interpretation service.
Discussion
The decrees and policy notes are vague concerning the distinction between interactivity and negotiation. Most of the proposed initiatives seem to narrow this down to interactivity as a mutual learning process. On the one hand both the newcomer and the host society have to realize that diversity can be an enrichment, but that it can also cause problems. On the other hand the newcomer gets informed about his new environment, while the government ensures that the regular services are accessible and prepared for the newcomer (interculturalisation). The role of the VMC can be seen as interactive (informing), but also as the creation of negotiation space for minorities, when taking part in the shaping of the integration policy. It will be interesting to look if the creation of negotiation spaces makes a sporadic democracy possible (Biesta, 2009). This discussion has similarities with the discussion over the difference between empowerment and emancipation (see 4.2).

A second point of discussion is about the group that joins this interactive process. The citizenisation decree aims at a certain target group, but research has shown that the government does not succeed in this goal (Lamberts, De Cuyper et al., 2007). The report states that (in the period 2004 – 2006) 60% of the target group, who arrives at a city, finds its way to the reception office. 70% of that group actually engages in a trajectory, from which 60% eventually finishes the primary trajectory. This creates a rather large group of new citizens who is not included in this process.

4.2 A specific program: citizenisation trajectories
The primary trajectory in the citizenisation process is designed to increase empowerment. The three parts of the trajectory (MO, NT2 en LO) all contribute to this, by supporting newcomers in the construction of a 'life career' (levensloopbaan) and providing in a basic knowledge of the Dutch language. The citizenisation decree distinguishes three dimensions of empowerment: a social, professional and educational dimension. The primary trajectory of citizenisation gives priority to the educational and professional perspective and offers a basic social empowerment, which is situated in MO. The means to achieve this goal are through education and work, but the decree also stresses the importance of socio-cultural participation in the spare time and the creation of social networks (Flemish Government, 2003 – EM, p. 9; Bourgeois, 2009). The primary trajectory is custom made and set up under the guidance of an adult educator, who works with an integral approach (a simultaneous focus on education, welfare, culture and employment, in line with the earlier mentioned 'life career'). The final responsibility of the primary trajectory lies with the reception offices (categorical), connected to a network of regular (inclusive) services.

The secondary trajectory logically aims at the finality the citizenisation decree (i.e. full participation). In this trajectory there is a transfer to the regular services, which also entails a shift from a

---

6 Biesta looks closer to the relationship between democracy and inclusion. The deliberative turn in democracy (overcomes ‘external inclusion’) and the work of Iris Young (overcomes ‘internal exclusions’) are laudable, but still based on a colonial conception of democratization, where the ones inside a certain sphere include the ones outside. For Biesta democracy is rather ‘a claim of equality’. It is not simply the inclusion of a group, it is also the creation of new, political identities. This creates opportunities for the democratisation of education that lie beyond the inclusion of excluded people into the existing democratic order.

7 The entire trajectory that an individual, natural person may go through during his life and in with different roles such as among others child, student, citizen, working, leisure man, spouse, family caregiver, parent or retired, can alternately be covered (Depreitere, 2008).
categorical to an inclusive approach. The adult educator, in cooperation with the integration sector\(^a\), has the duty to ensure a ‘warm transition’ (warme overgang): the trajectory has to be custom made as well and follow-up on the primary trajectory as best as possible. The policy notes acknowledge the fact that the secondary trajectory has a well developed professional perspective, but only a minimal educational perspective and completely no social perspective.

However, the decree stated a two-folded mission for the citizenisation trajectories: not only does citizenisation offer greater empowerment, it also aims at recognition of the persons, undertaking the trajectory, as full citizens of society. In the new policy note, this is called ‘the civil effect of citizenisation’. The main focus is the valorization of the citizenisation trajectory with a ‘citizenisation certificate’. Nowadays, this is granted for made efforts; in the future this has to evolve to the achievement of certain results. Therefore, the VMC is developing an integrative objective framework. This will also be used to create an intake test, as an aid for more custom made trajectories. Other initiatives concern the visibility of citizenisation in the public space.

**Discussion**

An interesting point of discussion is the analysis of the concepts ‘emancipation’ and ‘empowerment’. The citizenisation decree considers itself as an ‘emancipatory’ policy. The strategic plan for Minorities defines emancipation as (i) fortifying available competences and (ii) influencing structures and taking the own responsibility (Flemish Government, 2004). This interpretation is vague and has an overlap with how empowerment is shaped in the citizenisation decree. Much clearer is the distinction offered by Tom Inglis (Inglis, 1997):

> Empowerment involves people developing capacities to act successfully within the existing system and structures of power, while emancipation concerns critically analyzing, resisting and challenging structures of power. (…) Education and training for empowerment center on helping individuals attain greater economic, political and social power. This form of learning is a classical example of what Freire terms ‘banking education’; people making greater commitments and investments as a means towards obtaining greater rewards. Despite Freire’s hopes and expectations, most people may want to learn to read and write as a means of getting on in the world, rather than changing it.

Empowerment, as defined in the citizenisation decree, can be seen as ‘banking education’. The steps taken towards the valorization of the citizenisation certificate and the development of a uniform manual for MO, seem to confirm this. Still, the citizenisation process also stresses the importance of interactivity and negotiation (see 4.1). The question remains if this is enough to label citizenisation as emancipatory\(^9\) and not just as a policy that helps to empower individuals. Of course, and this is important to note, the overarching Minorities decree also aims at emancipation, so this is not solely the responsibility of the citizenisation. The adult educators are said to be the central actors in

---

\(^a\) Especially since the citizenisation sector now has its own rules that are no longer included in the legislation on the integration sector, (…) the coordination of the secondary integration policy is assigned to the integration sector. By being responsible for a smooth transfer between the primary and the regular services, the integration sector continues to keep a task within the reception policy (Flemish Government, 1998)

\(^9\) Important to note is that the overarching Minorities Decree also aims at emancipation, so this is not solely the responsibility of the citizenisation.
reaching empowerment and emancipation: in building up the custom made trajectories, they have to take actual competences and personal preferences into account. This individualization seems to acknowledge the fact that emancipation is narrowed down to individual empowerment. To reach emancipation however, there will have to be a strong focus on structures and not only on individuals.

An additional aid to further personalize the trajectory, is the development of an objectives mainframe. Reaching these objectives will be honored with a certificate. This recognition is positive, although research has shown that only 60% of the persons who start a trajectory, successfully finishes it (Lamberts, De Cuyper et al., 2007), which creates a large group of drop-outs that have ‘failed’.

Another point of attention is the secondary trajectory. The central concept in this trajectory is lifelong learning and therefore covers an unlimited period. The main problem here is the lack of educational and social perspective and a strong focus on labour.

5 Conclusion and discussion: what kind of citizenship?

It is generally accepted that all models of integration depict the acquisition of citizenship as a crucial step for individuals who enter and wish to be integrated in a society. The same is true for the Flemish integration policy. In general we can notice a shift from a collective idea of integration towards an individual one, where the responsibility to integrate lies with the minorities, combined with a more compulsory approach. Originally citizenisation was seen as a process with mutual rights and obligations, between the government, which has the duty to provide a qualititative citizenisation trajectory, and the newcomer, who agrees to an active participation. Nowadays, this has changed into a policy that focuses on empowerment, as a base principle for social emancipation.

*Shared and active citizenship implies taking up individual responsibility, showing loyalty and solidarity to the Flemish society and thus implies an active involvement in the organization of society. It presupposes participating in society with respect for others, contributing to welfare by work and own effort, showing respect for fundamental rights and not exclude or discriminate against people because of their ethnic, religious or cultural background. More participation is to leverage the emancipation, fighting discrimination is just not enough: all citizens must work together* (Keulen, 2004).

A two-fold metaphor to look at conceptions of citizenship in integration can be useful: citizenship as tool or as reward (Jurado, 2008; Kymlicka, 2003; Bauböck, 2006). In the assimilationist integration model, citizenship is viewed as a reward, handed to citizens who have ‘proven’ their loyalty to the state. Citizenship as a tool is used in multicultural models, where rights and responsibilities are a factor encouraging further integration.

We could say that Flanders has combined a rather multicultural Minorities Decree, with a rather assimilationist citizenisation decree. To become a new Flemish citizen, immigrants must learn the language and agree with the ‘Flemish’ values of pluralism, democracy, the rule of law, freedom, equality, solidarity, respect and citizenship. Cultural distinctiveness, in particular language, serves as a relatively straightforward criterion for defining the Flemish national community, that is, for
specifying who should be included and excluded. Together with the formalisation through the integrative objectives mainframe and the uniform manual for MO, one could conclude that citizenship in the Flemish integration policy can be seen as a reward. However, this is not entirely true, because there is no such thing as a Flemish nationality: the nationality legislation remains a federal policy, as an instrument to stimulate political participation. This is an example of the multi-level governance in Belgium and the difficulties it causes. While Belgium leans towards an approach of citizenship as a tool, Flanders goes into the direction of citizenship as reward. Another problem is that Communities have to provide in the reception and integration of migrants (also financially), but have no control over immigration, which is a federal issue. In the recent policy note for example, the Flemish minister of civic integration criticizes the federal policy concerning migration and refers to marriage migration. He argues that this is one of the most common forms of migration to our country, but at the same time it is also largely responsible for a vicious circle of social deprivation and exclusion.

Both accounts of citizenship can pose challenges for adult educators who guide citizenisation trajectories. If citizenship is used as a reward, they have to be aware of the risk that adult education is reduced to a technical profession to produce a desired outcome. Citizenship as a tool offers the challenge to see citizenship as an open concept with unpredictable outcomes and so becoming a public sphere and a cultural forum to express, experience and exchange.

6 References

6.1 Policy documents

Decrees


Policy notes


Strategic plan

6.2 Other references


Dreaming the Success: Educational and Occupational Aspirations and Expectations among diverse Second Generation Immigrants
Estrella Gualda Caballero. Universidad de Huelva (estrella@uhu.es)

1. Introduction

The study of social integration processes of teenagers and young immigrants is of great interest in old countries of immigration, as United States, Germany, France, United Kingdom and others (Portes & Rumbaut, 2001, 2006; Alba & Nee, 2003; Alba, 2005; Crul & Pásztor, 2008; Crul & Vermeulen, 2003; Levitt & Water, 2002; Simon, 2003; Simon, 2005; Thomson & Crul, 2007; Terkessidis, 2006; Schramkowski, 2007; Strelitz, 2004; Fielding, 1995). Spain is not known as an old country of immigration, but today is characterised at the same time by the progressive increase of the enrolled population of foreign origin in schools (first generation immigrants) and the increase of the second generation, those already born in Spain. Among the trajectories of these minors, we can find educational success, but also some of them confront failure and some of them drop out of school (Carrasco, 2003; García et al., 2008). At the same time, adults immigrants are having frequent difficulties to find a good job (or even a job), in a Spanish labour market where immigrants occupy not very good positions (Cachón, 2009, Pajares, 2009, Gualda, 2007).

In this document we want to describe labour and educational aspirations and expectations of adolescent and young immigrants. We want to know if there are connections between aspirations and expectations, and what kinds of factors are associated to them (as, for instance, personal traits, family structure, social capital, etc.).

If aspirations and expectations somehow show social status and dreamed occupational prestige for their future, we could approach to desires and hopes of adolescents and young immigrants and children of immigrants in the province of Huelva (Spain). So, if our data do not examine the concrete educational and occupational achievement, they have information about dreams and hopes of achievement, and these aspects, as international bibliography reports, are normally keys as predictors of future success (Portes y Rumbaut, 2001; Portes y Rumbaut, 2006; Portes y Zhou, 1993; Zhou y otros, 2008).

Knowing children of immigrants’ aspirations and expectations of achievement is an important task to do, and it is also important differentiate them by factors that push towards social success, or make it difficult. With this information social intervention in the area of young immigrants, could be more precise. Our data could also be useful for other researchers that study recent migration processes, new migration contexts, in contexts where social protection can play an important role. In a parallel way, knowing what
variables are more connected with dreamed and hoped occupational prestige is interesting as a first step in order to formulate new hypothesis to advance in new works.

2. Occupational prestige on the route to dreams and hopes of success

Investigation on occupational achievement began decades ago, following the theoretical and methodological steps that Blau and Duncan (1967) developed in the U.S. From this, it has been of great interest to investigate about the links between success and failure and personal traits, and ascribed and acquired characteristics of immigrants (intelligence, motivation, familiar origin, ethnicity, gender, etc.) (Kerbo, 1998).

The majority of studies about mobility and achievement are based in measures of occupational prestige, following the steps given by the sociological functionalism, but not necessarily with the same theoretical approach. Some works from the ‘Wisconsin School’, written subsequent the Blau and Duncan’s impetus, included new socio psychological variables in their models. For instance, it was analysed the contribution of elements as educational and occupational aspirations of children, the influence of significant others to shape these aspirations, the mental capacity or intelligence, and the academic performance (Sewell and Hauser, 1975; Wilson and Portes, 1975).

As Kerbo explained (1998) ascribed and acquired achievement elements have been combined to explain educational and occupational achievement. For some experts, parents origin influence children aspirations through significant others, and aspirations have direct consequences on educational and occupational achievement. At the same time, it was detected that educational achievement, if studies have been finished, is what more affect to occupational achievement, from here the importance of obtaining a university degree. Nevertheless, though some authors think education plays a mediator role in the process of status achievement and reproduction of inequalities, they also argue that education is not going to explain everything, and also refer to the importance of familiar origins (Jencks, 1979).

Knowing these theoretical precedents, in direct connection to our data, it is interesting to recover some ideas, based on previous findings, and apply them –updated- on the research about first and second generation of immigrant’s integration1. For instance, it is known that educational and labour aspirations and expectations for future usually affect future educational and occupational achievement (Haller and Portes, 1973; Kao and Tienda, 1995, Griffin and Alexander, 1978; Portes and Rumbaut, 2001; Portes and Rumbaut, 2006).

One important discovering stressed by the last contributions to this debate, in the sociological arena, is that it is not very opportune to argue about exclusive causes and consequences. This means that, even when there are repetitive phenomena in the ways followed to achieve success or failure, it is necessary to pay attention to other ‘atypical’ trajectories that as well drive to success (see, for instance, The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, published in 2008, monographic about

1 We refer here to the research on adolescents and young immigrants.

Approaches centered on life histories or focused on the subject, as it is the case described by Zhou et al. (2008), give us new ideas to the comprehension of the varied trajectories to success, of special interest between those coming from disadvantaged situations (Portes y Fernández-Kelly, 2008). Key factors that shape immigrants biographies include extra familiar elements, as mentors or people that play an important role as advisers. All of them play as the “really significant other” (Portes y Fernández-Kelly, 2008), already suggested as key factor in classical models about status achievement (Kerbo, 1998).

Without counting the diversity of factors that drive to success, it was not possible to explain, for instance, why different brothers in the same family experience very different outcomes (Escribá, 2006; Portes and Fernández-Kelly, 2008). This makes then very difficult, and at the same time it is a challenge, the understanding and explanation of prestige and social success, as it is defined by the adolescents and young, as protagonists of the integration process.

3. Methodology and sources

This paper shows the results of a research carried out in the province of Huelva\(^2\) (Andalusia, Spain), based on qualitative interviews, focal groups and the application of a survey to a representative sample of adolescents and young immigrants (413 cases on the sample). The interviewed, men and females, aged 14 years old (as mean), were enrolled in 35 different schools and high schools in this province. The pre-test and final questionnaire was designed ‘ad hoc’, and enriched after the consultation of instruments used in other investigations on the same issues. Particularly, it must be stressed the CILS study by Portes and Rumbaut (2006, 2001), the European Social Survey\(^3\), Bellón and others (1996), Barrera (1980) and Pascuals (2007).

For getting a measure of educational and occupational aspirations and expectations, we asked four qualitative questions\(^4\) to adolescents and young. We also had information about the current (destination country) and previous (origin countries) jobs of fathers and mothers\(^5\). These answers were afterwards codified to carry out the quantitative analysis. To do that we used the codes included on the National (Spanish) Classification of Occupations, CNO-94, published on Carabaña and Gómez (1996). The aim was describing the ideal (aspirations) and real (expectations) faces of dreaming and hoping success. We did an

\(^2\) Thanks to the Regional Government in Andalusia, Junta de Andalucía, for their financial support (Projects Ref.: 2006/176 and 2008/131; by the Regional Ministry of Interior; and Ref. 521-2005-21-000067, by the Regional Ministry for Equity and Social Welfare:

http://europeansocialsurvey.org

\(^3\) http://europeansocialsurvey.org

\(^4\) What is the maximum degree you would like to achieve?; And, what is the maximum degree you believe you are going to achieve?; In which occupation would you like to work in the future? And, if you are realistic, what kind of work do you think you are going to achieve?

\(^5\) Occupational aspirations and expectations. Mothers’ and fathers’ jobs in the origin and in the destination country.
additional codification with all the questions in the questionnaires concerning occupations transforming occupations into their occupational prestige scores following the scale for Spain elaborated by Carabaña and Gómez (1996) where every occupation is accompanied of prestige scores (PRESCA2C scale).

4. Educational and Occupational Aspirations and Expectations and Occupational Prestige

The majority of interviewed (69%) declared that they wanted to achieve a University degree. But while dreams were mainly university dreams, this did not happen at the same level with expectations (56,6%). This result is a little superior to what can be found in the recent surveys carried out in Madrid and Barcelona (Portes, Aparicio and Haller, 2009a, 2009b), and pretty similar to the result in Portes y Rumbaut (2001) for 1995-96. In any case, adolescents and young immigrants and children of immigrants in Huelva seem to be very ambitious regarding their educational future.

The range of occupations cited by these minors was very wide, as they cited more than sixty different ones, and even 20,3 per cent of immigrants manifested their doubts (regarding aspirations), and 45 per cent said “I do not know” (about expectations). These doubts were common in the studies above cited, and normal if we considered the youth of some of our minors (aged 12-17).

We also found that the responses were divided in three main groups, around 40 per cent with high aspirations, 30 per cent low ones, and 25 per cent were don’t know, don’t answer responses. Few cases chose intermediate occupations in our sample. In comparison with their parents, we observed an upward mobility of their children, as the majority of parents were in low occupations in both countries (origin and destination).

We also have some information about prestige of occupations dreamed and hoped by adolescents and young immigrants. The occupational prestige scores of cited occupations was very wide: from ‘cleaning jobs’ (with low prestige, 57,54 points) to ‘fiscal’ (251,19 prestige score) (the minimum in the scale was 23,58, and the maximum 323,59), of a total of 113 different occupations cited by these minors. The mean of prestige in occupational aspirations was 142,9 (std.desv. 47,1) and in occupational expectations almost the same (142,1, stand.desv.of 49,2). The median for both variables was 138,0.

Table 1. Educational and Occupational Aspirations and Expectations. Bivariate correlation coefficients (Spearman’s rho).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Educational Aspirations</th>
<th>Educational Expectations</th>
<th>Occupational Aspirations</th>
<th>Occupational Expectations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Educational Aspirations</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>.588(**)</td>
<td>.339(**)</td>
<td>.418(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Expectations</td>
<td>.588(**)</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>.327(**)</td>
<td>.440(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational Aspirations</td>
<td>.339(**)</td>
<td>.327(**)</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>.758(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational Expectations</td>
<td>.418(**)</td>
<td>.440(**)</td>
<td>.758(**)</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data from the HIJAI Study, 2007 (in Gualda et alii, 2008).

** Correlation significative at 0,01 (bilateral).
5. Occupational Prestige and explanatory factors

To delimit the importance of different factors in dreamed and hoped aspirations and expectations, the occupational prestige of dreamed and hoped professions of interviewed immigrants was considered as dependent variables. We calculated a comparison of means, ANOVA, and the statistical tests F and Eta. As main results (showed in Chart 1), we got factors that were relevant to explain dreamed and hoped occupational prestige.

Some characteristics of adscription, as the combination of gender and country of origin or ethnic, as well as the positive perception that was going to be possible achieve a university degree, the parents’ human capital, the parents’ and minors’ cultural-linguistic capital were the factors more associated to prestige of dreamed and hoped occupations. Nevertheless, other factors, that usually are important to study integration, or particular things as the social construction of identities in first, one-half and second generation, seem not to have relevance regarding occupational prestige.

Chart 1. Associated and non-associated factors to dreamed and hoped Occupational Prestige

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non associated</th>
<th>Associated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age, duration of the stay in Spain, generation, curse, country of residence, marital status, legal status</td>
<td>Sociodemographics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lenguage spoken at home, preferred language to educate their children</td>
<td>Gender/ Country of origin, continent, number of people living at home, step family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of opportunities to reach housing, a grant, or job</td>
<td>Perceptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of discrimination and rejection</td>
<td>Perception of opportunities to achieve a university degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic integration and life conditions</td>
<td>Educational and Occupational Aspirations and Expectations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Territorial identification</td>
<td>Parents’ Human Capital: Degrees, mother’s and father’s current and previous jobs (in destination and countries of origin)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attachment to traditions</td>
<td>Linguistic Capital: Knowledge of Spanish, mother’s and father’s knowledge of Spanish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return Intentions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological Well-being, Happiness degree and self-reported vital satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of their integration in Spain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpersonal Trust, Social Capital and Social and Personal Networks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contacts in the place of origin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data from the HIJAI Study, 2007 (in Gualda et alii, 2008).

6. Routes to walk and conclusions

The interest of this work is that it is one of the few made in Spain concentrated in a representative sample of minors immigrants in a complete province (rural and urban areas), with enough quantitative information to test some of the hypothesis that international experts usually consider in other places.

The context of reception is a key element in helping to explain integration processes of immigrants, and it is undeniable that the incorporation to work usually plays an important
role on their incorporation into society. Nevertheless, the results of this work, directed to
delimit the factors that influence the degree of prestige of dreamed occupations (desired
and hoped), seems to stress the relevance of some demographic traits, and of some elements
that have to be more with parents’ human capital, cultural and linguistic capital, as well as
the optimistic perception that it is possible for them to achieve university degrees. It was
also remarkable the relevance of immigrants’ mothers in the way of dreaming and hoping
success.

We also observed that dreams and hopes of success were not uniform, and that interviewed
were fragmented in three groups where extreme values were prevalent (high and low
aspirations and expectations, more than intermediate ones). Though in this work we are
unable to establish a temporal sequence (as data come from a punctual cross-sectional
survey), next explorations should advance in the explanatory importance of these factors
through a longitudinal approach, as we pretend to do a longitudinal follow-up.

Discovering the multifaceted ways that drive to social success is also encouraging other
approaches that go in depth in life stories and trajectories, from qualitative perspectives and
a focus on subject (Zhou and others, 2008). Knowing factors that try to explain recurrent
phenomena as well as diversity are keys to confront interventions and to promote a better
incorporation.

7. References

Alba, R. (2005) “Bright vs. blurred boundaries: Second-generation assimilation and
exclusion in France, Germany, and the United States”, Ethnic & Racial Studies, January,
vol. 28, 1, pp.20-49.
Contemporary Immigration, Harvard University Press.
Bellón Sameño, J.A.; Delgado Sánchez, A.; Luna del Castillo, J. de Dios y Lardelli Claret,
Atención Primaria, nº18, 4, pp. 153-163.
Wiley & Sons.
Cachón Rodríguez, L. (2009): La «España inmigrante»: marco discriminatorio, mercado
de trabajo y políticas de integración, Barcelona, Anthropos Editorial.
Centro de Investigaciones Sociológicas.
Carrasco Pons, S. (2003): “La escolarización de los hijos e hijas de inmigrantes y de
differences in the Dutch context. A contribution to the segmented assimilation debate”, The
Immigrant Second Generation in Europe and the United States, Bellagio Conference, Italy.


INSTITUTIONAL RESPONSES TO A DIVERSITY OF AGED MIGRANT GROUPS:
THE CHALLENGES OF SOCIAL COHESION

Estrella Gualda (estrella@uhu.es)
Angeles Escriva (angeles.escriva@dstso.uhu.es)
University of Huelva

1. Introduction

This paper presents some results of an ongoing research based in two different research projects: Growing older in an international migration context\(^1\), and Social Care Necessities and Integration of Spanish population returned to Andalusia\(^2\). Both studies use primary and secondary data, including qualitative and quantitative material. Primary data has been collected in the Spanish regions of Andalusia, Madrid and Barcelona, as well as in several countries of emigration in Europe and Latin America.

An important source of secondary data have been Spanish institutions as the Ministry of Labour and Immigration, with its specifics policies towards the Spanish communities abroad\(^3\), and in the Andalusian Region\(^4\), the actions carried out by the Department of the Interior. Likewise, we reviewed some specific journals published by Spanish nationals living abroad, as Carta a los Padres and/or Carta de España.

The paper aims at presenting a selection of the different responses given by Spanish governmental and non governmental institutions at different geographical scales to the needs of aged migrants. We focus on two different groups of migrants at their old age: Spanish-origin Returnees living in Spain and Spanish-origin Emigrants currently staying abroad. We are interested in analyzing how these responses evolved depending on the group, the needs detected and demands expressed, and the institutional capacity for intervention. We encounter significant differences among groups in welfare provisions, integration and quality of life. This evidence could help to develop more effective and proactive policies towards the ageing populations of non-Spanish origin who are settling in the country more recently.

\(^1\) Envejecer en un contexto de migración internacional, supported by the Spanish Ministry for Science and Innovation for the R&D project: Ref. SEJ2005-08415, lead by Angeles Escriva.

\(^2\) Necesidades de atención social e integración de la población española retornada a Andalucía, supported by the Junta de Andalucía, Regional Ministry for Well Being and Social Equality, lead by Estrella Gualda, Ref. 03/03 E.R.

\(^3\) http://www.ciudadaniaexterior.mtin.es/.

We will, first, describe these two groups, second, set our theoretical framework, and third, sumarize immigrants’ and emigrant’ needs and account for the demands they have addressed to the institutions. Following this we expose the institutional measures and experiences provided to help aged migrants achieving integration, quality of life and welfare abroad (when staying in different European and non-European countries) and in Spain (after returning). Among these experiences we will refer especially to social policies in the field of health, economic support, cultural promotion, and social and political participation. As an advance of results, we distinguish between general/ specific institutional responses, and find few measures specifically directed to senior migrants, and not specifically adapted to the diversity of aged Spanish migrants (returnees and emigrants in Europe).

2. Older migrants groups: Spanish Emigrants abroad and Returnees

Up until not so long ago Spain was considered a country of emigrants. During most of the contemporary Spanish history, but in particular the 1960s and 1970s are known for the numerous waves of migrant workers towards western and central Europe under a climate of structural unemployment (Arango 1999; Beltrán 1992; Criado 2001). According to the censuses of 1960-1970, which include data for aided emigration, 834,100 emigrants left Spain: 492,991 between 1971 and 1980; 195,944 from 1981 to 1990; and only 27,683 between 1991 and 2000. The trend is clearly a downward one (Ministerio de Trabajo y Asuntos Sociales 1988 and 2002). The sharpest decrease occurred in the 1980s and 1990s, coinciding with an increase in foreign immigration into Spain.

In the 1960s Spanish aided emigration was directed above all towards Europe, as opposed to previous periods where the majority emigrated to America, or even Africa. In contrast to this transatlantic emigration, continental emigration, when Franco’s “development” period was in full swing, was approved and even encouraged by the authorities through incentives (Fernández 2009). It was seen as a necessary escape valve for unemployment and, at the same time, an important catalyst for activating the emergent Spanish economy. Thus, agreements with several European countries were made in order to regulate this worker migration, at first on a temporary basis, and later leading to state aided programmes with the aim of maintaining links with Spain from the exterior.

As a result of the finalisation of the migration projects and the strong links maintained with the origin, in parallel with ongoing emigration some semi-planned return occurred throughout the 1970s. This coincided with the winds of change in Spain at that time. However, the definitive return pattern to the town or village was not consolidated until well into the 1980s. More recently, in the last decade, we observed an important increase of returns from Latin America (peaking in 2002-2003), coinciding with economic and political crisis there (Argentina, Venezuela, etc). But, looking at the complete decade (Table 1), we could observe that return from Europe and Latin America persists, and in similar numbers, with around 13,000-15,000 returnees on average each year from 1999 till now.
Despite the important numbers of returness, there is still a large Spanish population living abroad. The Spanish Statistics Institute (INE) has recently published the Register of Spaniards Resident Abroad (PERE) (Ine, 2009). This administrative register offers statistical data about Spaniards that are permanently living abroad. These data is collected by each Consular Office or Consular Section of the Diplomatic Missions.

According to the 2009 Register, more than 1.47 million Spaniards are residing abroad. Argentina, France and Venezuela are the foreign countries in which most persons of Spanish nationality are resident (Ine, 2009). Detailing some additional data, “51% of these emigrants are female, and 49 were male. By continent, 59% of the registered affixed residence in America, and 38.1% in Europe… Considering age, 13.6% of those included in the Register are under 16 years old, 61.3% are between 16 and 64 years old, and 25.1% are aged 65 or older. It is worth noting that 71.2% of all persons aged 65 or older live in the American continent” (Ine, 2009: 1-2).

### 3. Theoretical frame: the determinants of institutional response

As research on Spanish emigrants and returnees show, migrants experience different material and social conditions and wellbeing degrees, however, they all have in common that include an increasing number of people for whom special consideration is needed, given their age-related problematic, migratory history and their life trajectory divided between two or more nation-states (Martínez, 2000; Gualda and Escriva, 2010).

In the case of returnees, despite the diversity of situations and the differences between those returning from Europe and those from Latin America, in spite of the time lapse, many go to local government offices to claim benefits and rights accrued for their work abroad (Ministry of Labour and Immigration, 2009). At the same time, with the
expansion of the welfare system in Spain some policies have been directed to the aged and to the (aged) migrants, not only in the Spanish territory (towards returnees) but also to those still abroad and their descendants.

Public and private welfare institutions have developed a series of responses to the needs of different groups of aged migrants. We argue here that these responses vary depending on the degree of recognition of the group, the specific needs detected and the capacity for intervention. The degree of recognition of the group depends on social and cultural factors constraining and enabling public policy (Bobrow, 2006). These affect people’s capacity for organization and express their concerns, as much as the capacity and will of social and institutional actors to identify people’s specific characteristics and needs. One example of lack of recognition of the group is the absence of the immigrant elderly as a specific target group in social services in Spain. They may receive general services for the elderly; however their special needs may not be satisfied. Since the dominant discourse maintains that immigrants are overwhelmingly young and therefore contribute to the rejuvenation of the Spanish population pyramid, no so much attention is given to other age groups who are invisible to most citizens. Another reason to the lack of recognition from a given state is a restrictive notion of citizenship, in that institutions refrain from taking over certain responsibilities when the elderly reside out of the national territory or hold a foreign nationality.

A further question is how needs are detected or identified as such and consequently become a motive enough for intervention. As Zapata (2005) points out with reference to migration and governance, public policy can be proactive or reactive. Some elderly or non-elderly, individually or in groups, may call for attention on the poor economic and social wellbeing of all or certain migrant elderly. This includes lack of income or housing, absence of family support or social exclusion. However, the identification of elderly needs may respond not only to demands but it may be also a proactive strategy that intends, for example, by showing that the state is willing to expand the welfare state beyond the national territory and build a more inclusive citizenship, to win more political legitimacy internally or prestige in international relations.

Moreover, a broad understanding of needs satisfaction involves considering not only delivering services but also enhancing the capabilities of people that may be hindered by personal (economic situation, legal status, family and friendship support, cultural traits) or societal factors (racism and discrimination, lack of opportunities, lack of active-ageing policies, ageism) (Sen, 1985).

Finally, institutional responses are conditioned by the capacity for intervention that these institutions have in specific contexts and situations. Whereas the needs may be detected in local contexts, the executing agents may be local or not, depending on the level of political scope and on the existence of a transnational dimension. In this sense, responses may involve transnational arrangements at the state level and therefore be very much dependent upon inter-state relations as Phillipson has noted (2009). This requires a comprehensive and transnational understanding of the migration phenomenon as much as of an inclusive citizenship. So, other limitations may be cultural or idiomatic, the lack of experience or resources. According to this, stronger administrations and organizations are the ones who often operate, regardless of how far or how foreign these elderly populations are, as the cases of the Spanish state providing services in Latin America or the British in Andalusia exemplify.
4. Institutional responses to the needs of Spanish Emigrants abroad and Returnees

4.1. Different starting points

In the period 1999-2008, as presented by the Residence Variation Statistics (Ine, 2009), main groups of returnees from Europe were coming from France (29,441), Switzerland (27,969), Germany (26,220) and United Kingdom (18,711). The proximity to Europe and the reduction of the cost of travelling to Spain, gives older Spanish returnees from neighbouring European countries the possibility of living between two places, travelling back and forth, especially if they maintain family and social networks in the destination country.

On the contrary, the Spanish community settled in Latin America has often maintained weaker ties to the motherland as a result of the distance and communication and travelling costs, as well as emigrants’ limited economic resources, given that they often became less rich in the new world than expected (Rueda, 2000). It is from the 1980s onwards that the desire of some emigrants to return to Spain (at a time when Latin Americans started to see Spain as a destination country) and a more proactive Spanish politics towards Latin America uncovered a range of needs among the older emigrants. Actually, in the period 1999-2008 (Ine, 2009) main figures of Spanish returnees are from Venezuela (44,019) and Argentine (36,597).

4.2. Problems and Necessities

Emigrants and returnees’ needs and demands had been only partially attended until the middle 1980s when immigration appears in the national agenda and there is a restructuring of the welfare state. From then on Spanish migrants will request that every immigration policy should be followed by policies towards the emigrants. The consultation committees around the incumbent consulates organised after a law implemented in the early nineties, set themselves up in the main claimants of the emigrants rights.

According to the Ministry of Labour and Immigration (2009), emigrants’ main concern, has to do with the demand of provisions as: pensions for the older and the unable to work (including the extension of non-contributory pensions to the non-resident Spaniards), health care coverage, assistance with paperwork and information on helps derived from returning, on how much are they going to earn at their return or if their pension is compatible with other pension. In addition, some of them with young children are interested in study and work support. Other demands include social and cultural services to the community through the Spanish consulates and emigrants organisations, and the extension of political, mainly voting rights, so that emigrants in turn can address their demands not only to the central but also to the regional government according to their place of birth.

In addition to official sources of information, data on necessities and problems of Spanish abroad and of returnees can be collected asking migrants and their associations directly. A survey to returnees in Andalusia was applied, with the purpose of registering
their problems and needs abroad and at returning, help demanded and received from NGOs, and type of help that they considered it was necessary to be provided by the governments (national, regional, local). We briefly report some of the most important results here.

Problems and necessities were different depending on the profile of return (Table 1), and if they returned at old age or before. Needs and problems are basically connected with pensions, formalities/paperwork, employment, and cultural adaptation back in Spain. So, if they are older, they normally say that they would need better pensions, better provisions or economic aid, better health attention (if they conceived that Spanish system is running worse than abroad), some of them need finding or buying a house, being supported in doing formalities (especially for pensions or subsidies, or being registered with the Social Security), being informed for their (re) integration and (re) adaptation. Even some of them declare that they need finding new friends, and if they were staying abroad for a long time, they even yearn for the country of emigration. More specifically and less frequently some returnees express their desire to be offered cultural activities, the promotion of the associationism of returnees, and to achieve their rights guaranteed.

4.3. Institutional development at the service of emigrants and returnees

The Spanish Government (and the Andalusian Regional Government), looking for social integration, quality of life and welfare for older (and other) migrants, have stipulated different institutional measures and experiences. We refer briefly to them.

Support and defense of Spanish citizenship abroad are the main aim of the Spanish Citizenship Abroad Head Office. Some of the main actions are the procurement of retirement pensions, pensions for “Spanish civil war children”, and other supplementary income to help emigrants. At the same time, there are funds for federations, associations and other organizations if they promote the integration of these migrants. The Government also develops functions for the promotion of culture, education and work for Spanish communities abroad, and their families; and also the social attention and encouragement of labour integration of returnees to Spain. All of these provisions are currently provided in collaboration with other administrations and entities, though (?) social programs and financial support. Chart 1 shows the main programs for the elderly.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>BENEFICIARY</th>
<th>OBJECT/ ACTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROVISIONS FOR RESIDENTS ABROAD AND RETURNEES</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disabilities or necessities</td>
<td>Older than 65 or permanent disabled residents abroad</td>
<td>Provisions by reason of necessity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish abroad and family with extraordinary expenses</td>
<td>Assistance helps for extraordinary expenses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish-origin returnees with a situation of necessity</td>
<td>Extraordinary provisions for returnees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish civil war children</td>
<td>Economic assistance complementary to other income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SUBSIDIES FOR SPANISH ABROAD AND RETURNEES</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elders and dependents</td>
<td>Social centres, Senior citizens day centres, old people's home, institutions</td>
<td>Aids for helping and caring elders and dependents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish citizens residents abroad older than 60 – 65</td>
<td>Aids for journeys to Spain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return</td>
<td>Bodies and Spanish or foreign institutions</td>
<td>Aids for information and advice to returnees</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Others similar programs are developed in Regions, Federations, Associations, Trade Unions, and also carried out by local authorities (city councils). This help is offered to emigrants abroad or returnees to Spain, and are more frequently offered in the county town, or in towns with a migratory past. When offered as administrative helps, most of them are supported by Social Services programs, included in the area of Social Policies.

4.4. The limitations of policies and measures towards aged emigrants and returnees

All these demands have been attended and satisfied in some cases better than others. Today many Spaniards abroad (1.4 millions, Ine -2009-) enjoy a non-contributory pension, given that they show proof of bad economic situation. The Offices of the Labour Attaches in main consulate jurisdictions have grown and diversified the range of issues they run, becoming a main pillar of the state reach in foreign soil. However, one must say that emigrants and some returnees consider not enough, and being payed some times very late, the provisions and subsidies at their disposal. This is very important, because, for example, we found at least one out of four of our interviewees in Andalusia reporting (economic) problems at their return.

Outside the consulates but often monitored by them, emigrants organisations as the national and regional houses in main places of concentration (capital cities and sometimes also smaller locations) are obtaining funds from Spain to run information and social and cultural programmes for their younger and older members. However funds are contingent and run out sooner or later. Violeta is a Peruvian social worker in Barcelona we met volunteering in the Peruvian consulate to guide their country fellows through the social services procedures in Spain. Yet, prior to her migration to Spain she had been working for the Casa de España in Lima in a programme for the Spanish elderly that included leisure and cultural activities, health promotion and preparing emigrants for their return. The programme came shortly to an end and she admits that not only her but many associates felt strongly disappointed.

Returnees´ diverse experiences are presented here in three concrete cases. Bernardo, Maria and Gracia are three Spaniards we interviewed after their return from Latin America: Brazil, Argentina and Peru respectively. More successful stories are those of Bernardo and Gracia who were living in state older homes when we met. They both had applied at the consular attaché for a place to stay at their return to Spain and have been assigned a room in a nursing home in the city where they were born. Gracia visited the place once before fully returning, so she could prepare herself and choose the most suitable accommodation. Bernardo did not visit the place in advanced and therefore was less prepared at his arrival but he lively explained us how he learnt about the programme during a visit of the Spanish minister for social affairs to Brazil. He assured them that emigrants would be given priority in older homes in Spain if they were planning to return and so it was. On the opposite, Maria moved back to Spain outside from a state support scheme. She had become a widow in Argentina and lost her last job while being already in her late fifties. A relative in Spain encouraged her to travel and look for a new placement as domestic help, but once in the motherland she had experienced labour discrimination, ageism and hard working conditions. Finally, exhausted and frustrated, she was but only waiting for her 65 birthday to apply for a non-contributory pension.
As it regards to non-contributory Spanish pensions, these are frequent among emigrants and returnees from Latin America, since very few people pay and receive a pension in those countries and even the monthly allowances are derisory. This is different from the situation of many Spanish emigrants in - and returnees from - other European countries who contributed and receive pensions from their work abroad. Transnational agreements have been developed to provide migrants with a set of possibilities and guarantees that are shared and protected by both/all signatory states. Problems arise when migrants are out of the legal categories foreseen because they are undocumented or have not been working officially or not paying social security. Their entitlements may not be extensive to all their dependants and also may encounter some restrictions to movement. In fact, some differences are already being done between the so called Spaniards of origin and the naturalized Spaniards of foreign birth (many immigrants while they age), the latter experiencing more objections to family reunion or to social benefits if they settle out of Spain (especially if they move back to their country of origin).

5. What policies for aged immigrants in Spain?

Recent migration flows to Spain pose new challenges to institutions who have acquired only limited experience in the management of diversity and old age needs. Any attempt to better address these challenges will need the construction of a more inclusive citizenship both at the local, regional and transnational levels.

Connecting the previous with the current situation of immigration in Spain, and the institutional measures disposed for the new group of older immigrants, we wonder for the future of immigration in Spain and especially for social policies towards older migrants in this country (returnees, emigrants and immigrants, including European pensioners, …-). In this sense we would like to finish with reflexions, suggestions and questions which can be useful for the research about old migrants in other European countries. Connecting Diversity of Migrants and experiences of interventions to promote Social Cohesion, we also discuss about the efficiency of these policies, the pertinence for different types of migrants, if they are or not enough to confront a scenario of ageing of migrants in next decades in Spain, etc. We also focus on questions as: How to articulate social policies directed to Spanish older migrants with Immigrants in Spain who are getting older? Experiencing the transit from being an emigrant to a immigrant country, how to articulate -in terms od Social Policy- this Diversity of old migrants in the way of Social Cohesion?, and How multiculturality is affecting our way of learning, making interventions and interacting in a complex scenario where old Spanish migrants and old non-Spanish migrants in Spain are demanding the state and NGOs intervention?

8. References


How people learn to live with a religious difference in Northern Ireland?

Dragoljub Kaurin*, University of Nottingham, UK
2nd Year Phd Student, School of Education

Abstract: This short piece depicts religious differences in Northern Ireland as well as aims to see how Catholic and Protestant communities live together in contemporary society. What is more, an obvious line of inquiry within this paper is to examine the potential contribution of the Lifelong Learning discourse to the alleviation of conflict as well as co-existence. Consequently, notions of citizenship, mutuality, civil society and democracy play an important role in peace education. I argue that, while ideologically widely accepted, we need to take stronger care in order to ensure that these notions are applied empirically. I also argue that should this task be successfully accomplished, this could contribute greatly to the conflict resolution within religiously divided societies.

Keywords: Northern Ireland, Protestants, Catholics, citizenship, democracy, civil society, mutuality, lifelong learning

Introduction

1. General Importance of Religion and religious differences

Samuel Huntington identified religion as a means of social conflict in his still classic book on the Clash of Civilizations. He argued that Christian culture of the West was pervaded with peace and conviviality. Huntington’s main argument essentially was that conflicts in the realm of politics, economics do not have such a strong impact as those in the sphere of religion. Durkheim (1965) in his still essential study Elementary forms of religious life argued that the essence of religion can be identified in the collective exultation it produces within the religious ceremonies.
Most of the authors within sociology of religion agree upon the assumption that sacred and profane remain two categories that are intrinsically opposed to each other (Otto 1958; Eliade 1959). Christianity, as Ernst Troeltsch argues strongly, is in every moment in history not more than a historical phenomenon, which is subject to all of the limitations to which any individual historical phenomenon is vulnerable (Troeltsch 1972:85). Perry Anderson, a historian, argues that the main characteristic of the postmodern condition is the loss of credibility of the meta-narratives (Anderson 1998:25). Religious differences are perennial issues within social sciences. Social scientists, the media and the general public play an important role in contributing to the development of this picture. For an example, the case of Anglican believers moving further towards Rome is indeed becoming a question of importance for social scientists and the press.

The next section looks briefly on how people live with a religious difference in contemporary Northern Ireland. Historically and sociologically, this is a very peculiar and interesting phenomenon.

2. How people learn to live with a difference in Northern Ireland?

If somebody would venture to argue that Christianity is a relative phenomenon, there is no reason to oppose this as all matters historical are relative at the same time (Troeltsch 1972:85). Within the Northern Irish context conflicts have been many and frequent. Current historical constellation does not reinforce this view as the number of clashes has diminished over the recent years. Within this statelet, the clash between Catholics and Protestants remains one of the most important issues on the agenda. This process has very deep historical roots. The differences between Catholics and Protestants in Northern Ireland can be identified in Cromwell’s time, although it is quite difficult to guess the importance of religion within Cromwell’s era (Fulton 1991:2).

Fulton, for an example, argues that the main cause of the conflict in Northern Ireland is the fact that there is an opposition within both material and spiritual sphere, for two groups that live confined by the same boundaries, and these are protestants-loyalists and catholics-nationalists (Fulton 1991:2). Fulton’s basic argument is that religion remains a key axis of the difference and division within Northern Irish society (Fulton 1991:2). These differences have been perceived as difficult to surmount and both sets of agents developed their own mythologies that differentiate them from each other. For an example Protestants remember the battle of the Boyne, the victory of the protestant William of Orange over James the Second as the cornerstone of their collective memory.

Within contemporary Northern Irish society, differences still persevere, but there are examples that significant efforts are made to bring the two communities together.
3. Contemporary concerns and perspectives

However, during the twentieth century, the Northern Irish state became wholly dominated by the Protestants and loyalists who became quite coercive in dealing with the still substantial Catholic and nationalist remnant within the borders (Fulton 1991:89). Outbursts of intolerance and collective violence were not rare and minor. Foreign media and press often reported of the incidents. The two alliances succeeded in making the hegemony for a number of years (Fulton 1991:90).

However, over the recent years, the efforts to incorporate both communities so that they can live together have been many and successful. There is also overlap in cultural areas. There are strong relations in inter family and inter-gender relations. Some habits are also quite similar (Fulton 1991:98-99). Other issues on the agenda sometimes help in surmounting the culture of peace and togetherness and to overcome religious differences. Public events sometimes reinforce this view, for an example, within recent efforts of both groups to abolish the criminalization of the homosexuality (Fulton 1991:99).

Recent trends towards globalization and the reinforcement of global capitalism sometimes bring the culture of peace within religiously divided societies quite involuntarily. The advent of entrepreneurship and joint-ventures also contributes to the blurring of these boundaries as it crosses both Catholic and Protestant communities (Fulton 1991:98). There is also something that could be labelled as the spirit of togetherness. What this essentially means is that both Catholic and Protestant communities work together on the organization of a number of public events. In Holland, for an example, there is a vast array of institutions like schools, cultural organizations, public schools, welfare services and hospitals are duplicated where both religious sets take part. In Ulster, there is a panoply of institutions that emerged from the church’s concern for its people, and the Northern Ireland’s discrimination of Catholics (…) Catholics also have an array of organizations as for an example schools, Gaelic learning sessions, voluntary organizations (Fulton 1991:99-100). However, it is interesting to point out to the fact that Protestants still reinforce favouritism in the employment patterns (Fulton 1991:100).

The systems of education and schooling also give incentive for the development of divide and jeopardize mutuality. In Northern Ireland, the sector of Catholic schools is provided by the state funds, but remains fully in control of the of the local clergy and is assisted by the members of the laity and educationalists (…) The parish priest is normally the chairman of the board (…) On the other hand Protestant schools reinforce loyalist sentiments because Protestant teachers teach Protestant children (Fulton 1991:176). Fulton reinforces these considerations by saying that divisions are highlighted in the systems of schooling because Protestant children are sent to one set of
schools, whereas catholic children frequent the other set of educational institutions which are distinguished by their ethos (Fulton 1991:179-180).

However, there is evidence that the initiative to introduce ‘lifelong learning’ within the specific Northern Irish context is indeed being taken very seriously. There are obvious examples of community education within the Ulster People’s College. These programmes have enabled individuals to explore the issues which divided them. These initiatives have developed the campaigns in relation to the pressing issues which have affected working communities (Lovett et al 1994, quoted in Mayo 1997:9). What is more the Ulster People college has enabled individuals to learn in communities, to reflect on their common problem, to learn from their experiences and discuss political and social differences. This college has been influenced by the radical Highlander tradition as well as radical adult education (Lovett 1995, quoted in, Mayo 1997:128).

The efforts to make integrated schooling in Northern Ireland encounter some significant barriers. For an example, protestants oppose this solution because they see this problem as being equal to the catholic infiltration and want nothing but Bible Protestantism in state schools (Fulton 1991:184). However, the dual system of schools reinforces sectarianism and bigotry, and is an essential part of the vicious circle in Northern Ireland (Fulton 1991:187). The UK government, for an example, has stressed that citizenship education provides a unique opportunity to promote coexistence in a diverse society by sharing the basic common values. This is stressed by the official UK government papers (Home Office 1999, quoted in, Osler and Starkey 2009:90). However, religion proves to be quite a powerful tool for social division. For an example, some pertinent research points out to the fact that half of the respondents point out to the religious or ethnic group as the strongest factor for belonging (Starkey and Osler 2009:99).

The next section looks briefly on the contemporary shift in the lifelong learning towards active participation in political discourse and asks on how it might help communities to live together with a difference.

The Role of Adult Education in the Processes of Belonging and Community Formation: a potential precept for Northern Ireland?

Lifelong Learning and Lifelong Education are contemporary fields of practice within social sciences. These are not social sciences in the fullest sense of the word, but remain fields of practice.

My main argument to be developed here is that ‘Lifelong Learning’ discourse in general, and especially its modern forms that involve the notions of global citizenship, democratization and mutuality can play an important role in bringing the culture of
peace within religiously divided societies, as Northern Irish for an example. This shift should be done on the ideological level. It is essentially what Freire’s classic book *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (1996) has to teach us. Let us see what the pertinent literature has to say on this subject.

Citizenship is thus a subject that draws from many disciplines as sociology, philosophy, political science and law (Starkey and Osler 2005:2). As Ahier, Beck and More argue in their analysis, the fact that from 1960s onwards there has been a system where one third of the school leavers go on to the Higher Education, contributes greatly to the citizenship awareness (Ahier, Beck and Moore 2003:62).

Peter Jarvis, an internationally recognized expert on lifelong learning argues that: “Lifelong Learning has emerged in this context and many societies have introduced policy and legislation for lifelong learning” (Jarvis 2008:28).

Policy on lifelong learning essentially implies that individual citizens take up the role of becoming active citizens, to become informed and take societal affairs as their own. Many European countries have introduced this legislation. Within the particular context in Northern Ireland, lifelong learning agenda could play an important role in overcoming the sectarianism, bigotry and closed-mindedness that is still present as an inherent part of their society. Jarvis further argues that: “It was defined in the second volume as *every opportunity made available by any social institution for, and every process by which, an individual can acquire knowledge, skills, attitudes values, emotions, beliefs and senses within global society*” (Jarvis 2008:28).

Lifelong learning essentially means becoming informed and knowledgeable with the contents of all of the societal subsystems of which religion is an important part. Basically, this means that the introduction of this legislation should contribute to the conviviality. As Jarvis points out with certainty citizenship is the central feature in the documents on lifelong learning, but these documents also recognize that fewer people are willing to play that role than in the past (Jarvis 2008:47).

On the ideological level, there is much talk of the need for integration, but having said that practically we do need stronger results. Bearing this in mind, there is a threat that lifelong learning value system will be respected on the discursive level, whereas sectarianism and bigotry still prevail at an empirical level. Within the lifelong learning as a discipline the relation between lifelong learning and employability is strictly downplayed and the central concerns now seem to be personal fulfilment, active citizenship social inclusion and adaptability (Jarvis 2008:47).

What this basically means it the fact that lifelong learning will witness a shift towards a policy level. Initially, this discipline was created as a means of adapting the workforce towards the emerging neoliberal capitalism. What is more, some authors have seen this discipline as a tool in making the workforce adaptable to global capitalism. For an example Gelpi argues forcefully that lifelong education can be used to manipulate and tame providing useful knowledge, in the sense that employers think that workers should
have the knowledge in question (Mayo 1997:28). The EU policy on lifelong learning indeed gives incentive for the development of active citizenship, but that said, some documents, like Delors Report (1996) has four pillars: to be, to know, to work and live together (Jarvis 2008:149).

The Parekh Report (2000) for an example, the introduction of citizenship and lifelong learning in Britain, situates this process within multicultural Britain in a globalized and nationally diverse Europe (Osler and Starkey 2005:89). Northern Irish society could benefit greatly if the lifelong learning was introduced as a key policy issue.

The key issue is solving the sociological Rubik’s cube in order to apply the theoretical ideals to practice. Some progress has already been made with the development of community orientated schools.

Conclusions

The main purpose of this article was to explore how people live with a religious difference in Northern Ireland. While there are still tensions, we have evidence that the sector is progressing.

Ideologically speaking, there is much talk over the notions of citizenship, conviviality and mutualism within the lifelong learning agenda. Britain and Northern Ireland, for an example, is not an exception to this general rule. However, I argue that attention needs to be paid on how we apply these notions to practice.

Here are some precepts on how we could apply these ideas to practice. For an example, developing an active citizenship curriculum within both catholic-nationalist and protestant-loyalist schools is one path conducive to the attainment of having a more informed and tolerant population from both sets of agents.

It would be also useful to diminish the influence of nationalist historiography in the schools of both sets of religious groups. National historiography has the faculty of strengthening religious feelings and exclusion towards “otherness”.

Some merging of both sets of educational institutions, in my opinion, would help greatly in living with a difference. Although some attempts with this direction have proved to be unsuccessful, a joint curriculum would be beneficial.

Empirically speaking, I believe that little attention is paid on how we apply this value system to practice. If greater attention is paid, I firmly believe that this could become a powerful tool for overcoming the problems of divisions and help to develop the sense of community (or Gemeinschaft, as the Germans would say) within areas where ethnic and religious groups live with a difference.
References:


Ethnicity and diversity in the classroom.
Between policy and teaching practices

Introduction
In this paper I am going to present the new approach to ethnicity described by Steve Fenton (2003)\(^1\). I would like to connect it with Kris D. Gutiérrez’s\(^2\) and Barbara Rogoff\(^3\) (2003) research which is focused on some tensions in education which grow from the discussion between the power of the traits or/and the wisdom of individuals’ and groups’ histories of engagement in cultural practices which are worth recognizing for including that knowledge into educational practices; how the stereotypical thinking about ethnicity (and ‘ethnic groups’) influences the educational practices in the classroom. How cultural stereotypes and the professional knowledge about learning styles often dominates teachers’ mind while they are arranging learning environments. The paper will be focused on theoretical discourse on current meaning of ethnicity and then is going to refresh some Clifford Geertz’s (1994) ideas on uses of diversity in contrast to dealing with ethnocentrism. Then I will try to make a general review of current ‘ethnicity trends’ which Central Europe as well as Poland experience along with the political transformation. Finally I would like to discuss the Polish attitude toward the ‘coming diversity’ especially in the context of education.

Around the ‘ethnicity’
In the book titled ‘Ethnicity’ (2003) S. Fenton establishes the framework for thinking about that term within the context of ‘modernity’ or even ‘late capitalist modernity’ with the respect to important debates around the current meaning of the term mentioned above. What I find very useful is Fenton’s idea of the ‘late capitalism modernity’ while talking about ethnicity as inclusion of global migrations, local and global inequalities, the strength of the state, the theme of individualism and the question of national identity and majority ethnicity. According to Fenton’s introduction he describes his work as an attempt to resituate ethnicity

---


within much broader sociological and anthropological canvas than traditionally the ethnicity has been introduced in seventies of the XX century⁴. …there cannot be theory of ethnicity, nor can ethnicity be regarded as theory. Rather there can be a theory of the modern social world, as the material and cultural context for the expressions of ethnic identities. This is to reject all separation of ‘ethnicity’ or ‘racism’ or ‘national identity’ from the social theoretical mainstream. It is to re-position the interest in ethnicity within the central domain of the sociological imagination – the structuring of the modern world, class formation and class cultures, and the tensions between private lives, cultures, and the cohesion of communal and public life’ (2003:2).

As ethnicity does not live separately without the other key words as race, nation/nationality and/or minority so it is necessary to explain not only the notion of ethnicity but also the ‘family of words’ which are linked to descent or ancestry and closely related to the idea of culture. Thus Fenton starts his analysis from trying to look at the terms of ‘race, ethnic (group) and nation’ through the etymological history, which has been recorded in some dictionaries⁵. According to his enquiry all three notions mentioned above has got the core idea which is the idea of an ‘ancestry group’ as well as have got the connotation which is peculiar to the individual word – a core of shared meaning and some words associations which are not shared (2003: 24). The third thing Fenton points out is the fact that despite the deep and rich historical descriptions of race, ethnic (group) and nation the meanings of the words have changed and new meanings have been ‘relatively recently acquired’. What is really worth analyzing is the fact that actual meaning of the words is found to be different in different societies. In different cultures and contexts, the import⁶ of the words varies accordingly (2003: 24). The examples of different social construction and the meaning of the words race and ethnicity Fenton takes from his studies on ethnicity, racism, class and culture in the USA, the UK and Malaysia⁷.

To define ethnicity Fenton suggests that it refers to social identities, which are deployed in certain conditions, to social construction of descent and culture, the social mobilization of social and culture an the meaning and implications of classification system built around them. As Fenton claims People just don’t posses cultures or share ancestry; they elaborate these into the idea of a community founded upon these attributes (2003: 3).

The discourse about the present construction of ethnicity is a question of social inclusion and social action for development. In that background author poses some question as for instance: How important are ethnic groups thus defined and in what sense is ‘ethnicity’ a casual factor in societies and social action? ‘How casual is ethnicity’ could be rephrased as ‘do this identities and social attachments which we call ethnic play an independent part, even a leading part, in social action?’ If people assume an ethnic identity, does it in any sense become a real guide to action? How important are markers of ethnic difference in social transactions? (2003: 6). The answer is multilayered because in some societies the social order is established according to people boundaries but in other societies the same boundaries can be trivial, unimportant and barely surviving (2003: 7). What is quite stressed by the author that is the common simplicity, that one of the most often thinking is that it has been a rule that ‘ethnic groups’ are the source of conflict and social relations are primarily determined or

---

⁴ S. Fenton presents the definition of Compact Oxford English Dictionary, 1993: Ethnic (adj.) not Christian; pertaining to a race or nation; having common racial, cultural, religious or linguistic characteristics, especially designating a racial or other group within a larger system (2003:14).


⁶ By ‘import of the words’ – the author means the force of meaning which the term carries, the emphasis and importance contained within the term (Fenton, 2003: 24).

‘driven by ethnicity’ (2003: 6). The ways of thinking about the ethnicity are often the ways we think about the society. On one hand, sentiments, ties and obligations and an unquestioned sense of identity which are embedded in the individual on the other hand a contrasted view of ethnicity as a matter of circumstance, convenience and calculation – a kind of Serbian when it benefits me (2003: 6).

Ethnic groups are not simply groups of people who share a culture and have a shared ancestry. Rather, ideas of descent and culture are mobilized, used and drawn upon to give force to a sense of community, of ‘group-ness’ and a hared destiny (2003: 7).

In the face of the process of social construction the more detailed question is ‘who exactly does the construction?’ That is not rather the people themselves who belong to the group, because the idea of the group is not constructed by ‘us’ but constructed ‘for us by others’. Or the building of the group identity may be not so much the work of all members of the group as of elite within it, or party and organizational leaders. And thirdly groups are formed as a consequence of state actions, power and administrative fiat. In that case often the competition theory is used to explain the action which is seen as being ethnically motivated. That is always the matter of ‘ruler makers’ and ‘power holders’ (Geertz: 1994; Fenton, 2003) as well as the strength of cultural stereotypes which have been historically acquired.

Between ethnicity and culture

The caution: Beware: culture an ethnicity are not the same (Fenton 2003: 20), focuses our attention on understanding the difference between the belief in common descent which help to create the feeling (and believes) of belonging to one of the races, nations or ethnicities. But because nations and ‘ethnic groups’ are not ‘culture groups’ as Fenton claims, so the boundaries of some cultures coterminous with the boundaries of the nation of ethnic group.

Cultures can be seen either wider or narrower than nations. The example can be the comparison between cultures and religion. The first one deal with custom and practice and the second refers to a community of faith. The religion can go beyond the nations and cultures but on the other hand the cultures can be narrower than the nations. Culture is an open project ...[but] since culture is necessarily based on tradition and continuity, it is often confused with ethnicity (Converse 2000: 134-5; in Fenton 2003: 21).

Following the Fenton’s analysis the current description of ‘ethnic group’ concerns three aspects: the group is a kind of sub-set within a nation-state; the point of reference is typically culture but not the physical appearance; often that group referred to is ‘other’ (foreign, exotic, minority) to some majority who are presumed not to be ‘ethnic’.

The proposed ‘definition’ will be probably interpreted differently in different societies. However, it seems to be important from the perspective of educational institutions. Those institutions are responsible for creating the learning environment which often does not go beyond a widespread assumption that general traits of individuals are attributable categorically to ethnic group membership (Gutiérrez & Rogoff 2003: 19). In the following paragraph I will shortly introduce the polemic between those who study cultural variation in approaches to learning and are for/against the assuming that regularities are static and does not go beyond the traits of individuals who belong to any of the ethnic groups. What Gutiérrez & Rogoff suggest that cultural-historical approach can be used to help move beyond this

---

8 Fenton recalls the interpretation of intense conflict in former Yugoslavia in 1990s, which was often called ‘ethnic conflict’ with the more or less clear assumption that the differences and dislikes between the groups were the causes of the conflict. But Fenton, supports M. Banton’s (2000) claim, that danger with the term ‘ethnic conflict’ is that we assume that the conflict referred to is primarily ‘ethnic’ in nature and cause. Often it is not. (2000: 7). The other example of similar conflicts in the USA are called ‘racial or segregation conflicts’. Despite the fact in different circumstances in Yugoslavia and America there is no obvious reason, in describing these conflicts, why one is ethnic and the other racial (2003: 8).
assumption by focusing researchers' and practitioners' attention on variations in individuals' and groups' histories of engagement in cultural practices because the variations reside not as traits of individuals or collections of individuals, but as proclivities of people with certain histories of engagement with specific cultural activities (2003: 19).

Ethnicity within the educational space

Educational institutions are one of the social spaces where cultural variations meet each other and different ethnicities are involved in the process of acting together. Thus, individuals' and groups' experience in activities - not their traits - becomes the focus. In Gutierréz & Rogoff opinion cultural-historical work needs to devote more attention to researching regularities in the variations among cultural communities in order to bring these ideas to fruition. In research and practice, often happens that the partial information is used. But in the context of education it is a need to consider the implications for research and educational practice when only a little cultural information is available (2003: 22).

The authors advise some tips to follow:

- When talking about cultural styles is much better to talk about differences rather than deficits
- Helping students learn it is not labeled them with a 'style’ but knowing about their participation in social practices
- To avoid overgeneralization it is better not to treat cultural differences as individual traits
- Participating in cultural practices in a community is a dynamic process which influences the individual ways of learning.

Treating cultural differences as traits makes it harder to understand the relation of individual learning and the practices of cultural communities, and this in turn sometimes hinders effective assistance to student learning. According to data the teachers’ practices in the classroom are still focusing on unconscious cooperation with majorities and very often the minorities feels discriminated in multicultural groups. For instance, in the year 2008 (!), Gail Thompson’s research on practices in the classroom (California) resulted with the set of notes directed to the teachers. They sound as if they were written a century ago and points that ‘no one seems to be color blind’. For Thompson the most important teachers’ self questioning should give the honest answers to themselves: Do I truly believe that all students, regardless of race, ethnicity, gender, or socioeconomic background, are capable of being academically successful? Do I have beliefs about their home lives or community that prevent me from lowering their academic potential? Do I treat students how I want my own children to be treated by their teacher? When Thompson surveyed an under-performing school in California, black students were twice as likely as white students to believe that ‘most of their teachers didn’t like them’, even though nearly all the teachers answered that they cared about their students’ welfare. According to several studies, white adults tend to engage in ‘adultification’ of black children, especially of boys, instead of viewing black students’ behavior as that of children. He notes that some teachers may blame students' academic problems on bad parenting: Most African-American parents do care about their children's education, but they may express caring differently from how white middle-class and upper-class parents do. Black parents, ask about school, listen to their children read, and express interest in grades, but are less likely to help with homework. Working-class parents and single parents may also be less likely to attend parents' nights and parent-teacher conferences, not because they care less about education, but because to attend might present a major inconvenience or financial hardship.

Teaching about diversity and respect for others is a challenging task for educators all over the world. Despite the fact that socio-cultural and historical background differ much
from one another but in the face of predicting the XXI century as the time of world migration which will be inevitable part of the life in a “post-post modern” world (Bauman: 2000), the meaning and understanding of diversity seems to be important for rethinking again and again.

The debate over the living with/in/within diversity and at the same time understanding the positives of ethnocentrism has been developing since 50s of XX century, but it is as dynamic as socially constructed meaning for those terms. As Geertz claims, he is not against ethnocentrism but he is not afraid of living in diversity as well: The image of a world full of people so passionately fond of each other’s culture that they aspire only to celebrate one another does not seem to me a clear and present danger; the image of one full of people happily apotheosizing their heroes and diabolizing their enemies alas does. It is not necessary to chose, indeed it is necessary not to choose [my emphasis] between cosmopolitanism without content and parochialism without tears. Neither are of use for living in a collage (1994: 465). The collage which Geertz described in mid 90s, has been changing it’s shape in Central Europe especially according to the policy regulations of European Union.

Social participation and inclusion at policy level in Central Europe – overview draft

In Central Europe the post-modern developmental trends carry contradictory elements – on the one hand, after the Cold War, a tendency towards globalization and internalization and at the same time, the intensification of the nationalistic proclivity incites wars and brings to the forefront plenty of questions, among which the minority wrights figures prominently. Despite the fact that there have been established some documents for minority rights protection and non discrimination protection the social practices at different levels seems not to be familiar with some of the documents mentioned below as for instance Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, UN Declaration in 1948; Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief and UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education and the UN Convention on The Rights of Child in 1960.

As Geertz concludes (1994: 465) apart from the documents living in diversity, which he calls metaphorically a collage is possible under condition when one must in first place render oneself capable of sorting out its elements, determining what they are (which usually involves determining where they come from and what they amounted to when they were there) and how, practically, they relate to one another, without at the same time blurring one’s own sense of one’s own location and one’s identity within it.

The ability to live in a collage is a process and takes time as well as lots of personal experiences and reflection. That is probably the reason why lots of official declarations need ages to come true. As one of the examples is the process that term ‘minority’ has passed since late 70s to 90s. As Patrick Thornberry (1993) elaborates that the states recognition or non-recognitio of the existence of minorities, (ethnic groups) cannot be a decisive factor in making international law because belonging to a minority group, is a matter of a ‘delicate balance between self-identification and acceptence by the group’ (Fenton: 2003; Thornberry 1993, in: Nikoleva, 2003).

9 In C. Geertz article ‘The uses of diversity’ (1994), there has been a short introduction of the development of the two terms ‘diversity’ versus ‘ethnocentrism’. Lévi-Strauss’, Rorty’s and Geert’s explanations of those terms in the context of 50s, 70s, and 90s.

10 In 1978 The Human Rights Commission established a Working Group to prepare the draft of declaration and up to 1984 the Sub-Commission was defining the term ‘minority’. By the year 1990 the first draft was ready and in 1992 General Assembly Resolution was voted upon and the Declaration became adopted. The next was United Nations, with the declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities 1992; In November 1994 The Framework Convention was adopted by the Committee of Ministers of The Council of Europe and after being ratified by 12 member state, it entered into force in 1998 (Nikoleva, 2000).
Ethnicity and diversity within educational system in Poland - is there any?

The issue of ethnicity is described in Poland very well at the policy level but is not concerned so much at everyday practices at schools or in local communities. Poland used to be multietnic country before the war (At the beginning of the last century one third of Polish inhabitants did not use Polish as their mother tongue). In second half of XX century most of the ethnicities were suppressed by political reasons. At the beginning of a XXI age (the change of political system into democratic one, the membership in European Union etc.) the issue of ethnicity has become more and more present in social life. What is more there has been seen at least two tendencies. First the step by step reactivation of the suppressed minorities and second the (e)migration movements inside and outside the country, what on the other hand has become one of the usual ways of living a life by people all over the world. Anyway, those transitions evoke thinking of what, how, where etc. is bringing to educational space especially in face to face meeting with ethnicity in school classroom or at local community level. The theoretical background of that research is concerned with cultural-historical approach (J. Bruner, L. Wygotski, M. Cole, B. Rogoff and others) and as the above authors suggest in a current world there has been a need to focus on reconceptualizing ethnicity in cultural approaches to learning. In that quite broad frame of thinking of ethnicity the countries of Central Europe appears as the territory which has to take into consideration the established documents and to develop the social consciousness of living together in a multicultural Europe. However the legislative texts already adopted and ratified by many countries are just wishful thinking on the part of the international community and a substitute for genuine minority rights protection (Nikoleva, 2000; Robotycki, 2000). That evokes the follow up questions of quality of lives and social inclusion which can be only seen and spotted looking from the people’s perspective, from the bottom of their everyday practices not from the top of legislations. The model of multicultural education neither has been elaborated nor implemented so far however it seems to be quite important if schools have the ambition ‘to be updated’ especially in the light of the evidence collected in Poland where has appeared that teachers themselves are not much interested in intercultural education. There has been the debate that teachers’ training should involve space for preparing teachers either for multicultural communities but also for intercultural education (Chromiec, 2004; Lewowicki, 2000, Ogrodnika-Mazur, 2000; Mróz 2004; Szczurek-Boruta, 2000).

From my point of view and as some concluding ideas the projects on social multicultural cohesion in Poland can be the parallel actions taken up at the same time from the top to the bottom and the other way round. The schools can be more conscious of their multicultural surroundings and can look for the partners nearby to develop their intercultural competences. At the same time the teachers and the social leaders can get much more support from their academic protectors to involve not only teachers of foreign languages to international cooperation but think how to inspire and encourage the teachers of different backgrounds to benefit from the multicultural shifts which are inevitable part of our life in XXI century. The challenge is that we must learn to gras what we cannot embrace (Geertz 1994:465). For educators of all backgrounds it is in this, strengthening the power of our imaginations to grasp what is in front of us, that the uses of diversity, and of the study of diversity, lie (ibid.).

References:
Bauman Z., 2000, Globalization, the Human Consequences, PIW, Warszawa
Chromiec E., 2004, *A Child toward the culture of the other*, (Dziecko wobec obcości kulturowej), GWP, Gdańsk;
Fenton S., 2003, *Ethnicity*, Published by Polity Press,
1. Introduction

Considering recent changes in modern societies as well as the impacts of the global financial and economic crises, diversity is becoming not only more prevalent in modern societies; it also appears to be an aspect of social inequality which produces different everyday living conditions. It is apparent that unemployment is increasing in Europe, and it’s also clear that some groups of people are more affected than others. In addition, economic researchers, not only in Austria, predict that the peak level of unemployment has yet to be reached and that the current trend toward increasing unemployment will continue until the end of 2009. In view of these likely eventualities, a higher level qualifications as well as connections and membership in social networks become more and more relevant. Adult education, especially vocational training, can be seen as an important key to better living conditions and an improved employment outlook. For example in Austria, with its complex regulatory framework, a high number of migrants are condemned to low paying jobs (cf. Gächter 2006). One of the reasons is the fact that the qualifications, skills and experience gained in their home countries are often not recognised by the Austrian government. Apart from the necessity for the governmental recognition of skills and an anti-discriminatory labour policy, adult education could help to make the immigrants’ skills more compatible with the needs of the labour market.

Looking at the challenge of adult education in a more and more diverging society, two aspects must first be pointed out. On the one hand adult education can be seen as a space where people focus on issues of diversity as a content of learning processes. They might be sensitised to diversity in society or their institutions. In Austria the contents of such programs, courses or workshops vary widely and they are highly influenced by the discourses of diversity on which they are based. For instance issues of diversity can be focused on the improvement of communication and relationships in a company in order to gain a competitive advantage. In this context, it can be observed that concepts of cultural differences often enforce cultural stereotypes and questions about social inequality might be excluded. In other areas, policies against discrimination and racism are more at the centre, which includes reflection on personal practises; furthermore, a critical analysis of institutional structure effects can be part of the discussion. Accordingly the other aspect of the role of adult education can be seen in the involvement of adult education in processes of inclusion and exclusion (and the ability to analyse own structure effects). If diversity is understood as a cross-sectional task, providers of adult education and vocational training should critically analyse their own structures, staffing and target group policy with the objective of breaking open mechanisms of social exclusion and removing barriers to participation. In the following sections, important background information about the situation of migrants in Austria and the labour market will be given. Furthermore the research project “Access to Vocational Training for Skilled Immigrants” and some of the research results will be presented.
2. **Austrian labour market**

In the year 2008, the unemployment rate of autochthonous Austrians was 5.5% while the unemployment rate of migrants in Austria was 8.1%. Generally in 2008 the rate of unemployment in Austria fell; between 2007 and 2008 the unemployment of autochthonous Austrians decreased by 4.8% and the unemployment of migrants fell by 3.3% (cf. AMS 2008). Thus it appears that migrants in Austria were more strongly affected by job cuts in 2008, furthermore they did not benefit from the decrease in unemployment to the same extent as the autochthonous Austrians.

In view of the economic crisis, unemployment in Styria is increasing dramatically. For instance between September 2008 and September 2009 the unemployment rose by 29.7% (40.7% for men and 18.5% for women), the rate of unemployment has risen by 6.5% (Eurostat unemployment rate 4.7%). At the same time, between September 2008 and September 2009, new job offers decreased by 6.9% (cf. AMS 2009a). The unemployment data show that in September 2009, 4,237 migrants in Styria were affected by unemployment; this means that there has been an increase in unemployment by 29.3% compared to September 2008 (cf. AMS 2009b, p. 1). Nonetheless in comparison to other EU member states, unemployment data from the EU show that the rate of unemployment in Austria is still quiet low (cf. AMS 2009c, p. 2).

3. **Migrants in the labour market**

*Austria – an immigration country?*

The Austrian government continues to insist that Austria is not a significant immigration country, nevertheless demographical facts show that there has been more immigration than emigration ever since the 1960s (cf. Fassmann 2007). Labour migration as well as the movement of refugees has certainly impacted Austrian society. About 10% of the population are non-Austrian citizens and about 17% have a so-called migration background (foreign citizens or persons born in a foreign country). Looking at the countries of origin, more than 40% of the immigrants come from former Yugoslavian region. The second largest group is Germans followed by Turkish people. In the last 20 years immigration from Eastern Europe has increased. Although legal restrictions aim to reduce new immigration, the mobility of people, especially from the new EU member states or dependants of naturalised citizens cannot be stopped. Nevertheless political debates still focus more on how to close the borders than on developing strategies for improving integration and participation. The Migrant Integration Policy Index (MIPEX), a scale that measures integration policies related to migrants in 25 EU Member States and 3 non-EU countries, shows that the integration indicators for Austria are below average in most cases. Labour market integration activities are very unfavourable in Austria. Concerning the equality of access to vocational training and study grants, the index for Austria is 1 whereas the MIPEX-average is 1.8 (on a scale from 1-3). The MIPEX rating leads to the conclusion that migrants who want to get their qualifications recognised or upgrade

---

1. The unemployment rate calculation method used by the Austrian government differs from that of the EU, for example the Austrian data exclude self-employed workers, meaning that a direct comparison of the data is not valid.
their skills are blocked by complicated bureaucratic regulations and unequal access to vocational training and study grants (cf. http://www.integrationindex.eu/).

Skills of migrants

Migrants from former Yugoslavia and Turkey are concentrated in only a few segments of the labour market (e.g. manufacturing, agriculture and food service). About 75% of them are labourers while migrants from the EU-15 represent a broader variety of fields which are associated with higher wages and greater prestige (cf. Fassmann and Reeger 2007, p. 192ff.).

Migrants are mostly perceived by the public to be low in skill. Recently there have been more discussions about the “invisible” skills of this population group due to the realisation of the loss of potential for the national economy if skilled migrants are not working according to their actual competences. In fact, a large group of migrants has low qualifications, but there are also a high percentage who are highly skilled; this especially applies to more recent immigration. While only 25% of those who arrived in Austria up to 1998 were highly skilled (high school with A-level or university diploma), this number rose to 40% in the following years (cf. Gächter 2007, p. 246).

The downgrading of qualifications

Nevertheless, many skilled migrants cannot find adequate jobs. While 19% of autochthonous Austrians work below their qualifications, 39% of foreign-born people do so. There are significant differences dependent on the country of origin and the legal status which influences access to the labour market considerably (cf. Gächter 2006). Employment in the unskilled labour sector often leads to a permanent downgrading of qualifications. An interesting topic to be discussed is the question as to whether adult education could help immigrants to successfully adapt their knowledge and skills to labour market expectations, but we should also consider whether or not such training will actually help those looking for work to be hired for the positions for which they are qualified.

Skilled immigrants’ access to vocational training

Despite the fact that there are not many solid statistics concerning the participation of migrants in adult education, some statistics show that foreign citizens are less likely to take part in continuing education courses than Austrians (cf. Hammer et al. 2003). The study “Lifelong Learning in Austria 2003” pointed out that 17% of foreigners and 22% of Austrians participate in non-formal continuing education. Several group such as migrants from Turkey (13%) and migrants from former Yugoslavia (12%) are distinctly underrepresented. It should be noted that those figures also include language courses attendance.

In general the reasons for this disparity are factors such as one’s position in the labour market or within a company, unemployment, present qualifications and former educational background. Specifically for migrants, the knowledge of the German language, legal restrictions and non-recognition of qualifications as well as economic factors are crucial factors defining the difficulty in upgrading one’s skills through coursework. Many migrants have already had bad experiences in courses; they may have felt uncomfortable because of not being able to follow the lessons (e.g. because
the instructor spoke too fast) or they could not represent themselves as competent in a group of learners. Some of them have also experienced discrimination from other participants or even from the teachers (cf. Sprung 2008). An important barrier for migrants in attending courses is the lack of information about the adult education market and their fear of exams (cf. Schmidt and Tippelt 2006, p. 36f.) We should also mention the institutions of vocational training which are adapting their structures and offers to the new needs of specific target groups such as migrants are generally making very slow progress.

4. Research project

The research project “Skilled Immigrants’ Access to Vocational Training” investigates the access conditions of vocational training for migrants in Styria, a federal state in the south-west of Austria. The characteristics of providers of vocational training in Styria, their structures and involvement in processes of social inclusion and exclusion are also an important part of the research interest as successful strategies of migrants to participate in vocational training. The key research questions involve, for example: Do these providers aim at skilled migrants as a target group? Which kind of discriminatory structures exist in the adult education sector? In which way do didactics have to be re-evaluated in order to meet the immigrants’ needs in the labour market? Which strategies do skilled immigrants develop?

According to grounded theory methodology, the research design is based on empirical analysis in order to generate theoretical assumptions. Qualitative methods as well as quantitative methods were used. An online survey of 50 vocational trainers should give us an overview of the providers of vocational training, rates of migrant participation, existing barriers, established diversity management activities, challenges for trainers, etc. The second part of the research activity is the analysis of 12 narrative interviews which were conducted with highly skilled immigrants from former Yugoslavia. Mainly the research interest focuses on strategies to deal with processes of social exclusion in order to gain access to vocational training. Social conditions, biographical backgrounds and experiences with providers of vocational training are also of interest.

Online survey

In Styria, 35 of 50 polled vocational training providers completed our questionnaire. Most training providers (27 out of 35) reported that between zero and 20% of participants have an immigrant background at their institutions. The prevalent countries of origin are the former Yugoslavian states (with the exception of Slovenia), Turkey and the new European Union countries (e.g. Romania).

When asked about the highest educational achievement of their migrant participants, most Styrian vocational training providers document or estimate that between zero and 25% have an A-level degree or a university degree of some sort (mentioned 30 times). Of the institution managers asked, 22 responded that between zero and 25% of their immigrant participants have no school degree whatsoever or only a compulsory school degree, and 12 stated that the highest qualification of participants of non-Austrian origin is usually from an apprenticeship or a vocational school. The
picture created here tells us that immigrants who take part in vocational training are primarily either highly qualified or unskilled, and also that qualifications of immigrants living in Austria are extremely heterogeneous; this is quite different than the typical stereotype of immigrants that is held by the general population.

When we look at which courses these immigrants most likely participate in, the majority of vocational training providers note the following: occupational assessment and career application management (21 institutions) and soft skills (19 institutions). The other most frequently attended courses are basic vocation-specific courses, advanced vocation-specific courses and computer classes (15 institutions). In contrast to our expectations, the numbers for German courses turned out to be quite low. Only 13 institutions reported that their migrant participants attend German language courses. However, four of these providers indicated that more than 75% of their participants take this kind of courses which implies that these four institutions specialised in immigrants as target group.

Another area of our online survey sought to discover the percentage of staff with an immigrant background and also their positions in these institutions. Of the institutions polled, 60% responded that they do have immigrants in their staff. Most of them work as course instructors or cleaning staff (11 institutions). The fewest are in the top management (4 institutions).

One of our main goals was to show what kind of barriers there are for immigrants in regard to their access to continuing vocational training. In the view of the Styrian vocational training providers, the lack of German language skills is the major barrier (13 mentions). Other strong barriers seem to be cultural and religious barriers (5 mentions), traditional gender roles (4 mentions) and family situations and/or lack of support from the family (4 mentions). These results clearly show us that there is a deficit-orientated approach in this field as most immigrants tend to be seen as persons who lack knowledge. There is also a cultural-oriented approach (kulturalistischer Ansatz) as many barriers are understood to be a result of cultural differences.

Another subject was diversity management and the question of cross-cultural training for staff and management in the organisations polled. Only 11 of 35 providers indicated that they have an employee who is responsible for diversity management in their organisation. Even fewer (9 providers) have defined objectives for their institution regarding diversity management, anti-discrimination and the cross-cultural opening up (interkulturelle Öffnung) which clearly shows that there is a lot of space for change and improvement. Nevertheless, many vocational training providers report that their staff (26 mentions) and management (25 mentions) have received training in cross-cultural skills. To be more precise, 15 providers indicate that between zero and 25% of their staff attend cross-cultural training and 11 providers report that more than 75% of their management attend cross-cultural training.

Qualitative interviews

The qualitative part of our project aims at exploring the experiences of skilled migrants of former Yugoslavian origin in the Austrian labour market through interviewing 12 people from different professions. In order to achieve a structured analysis, we determined three focus categories: action strategies of immigrants (i.e.
their accessing of vocational training), social conditions (e.g. financial and legal situation) and their biographical background (e.g. qualifications and habitus). At the moment we are still in the process of completing the research and analysis.

5. Conclusion

In order to guarantee successful access to vocational training, those who provide education need to also open up to migrants. In Austria, one finds that there is resistance to change as a large number of training providers do not consider skilled migrants to be a target group. One of the arguments which can be found is the assumption that migrants don’t have sufficient financial resources at their disposal to participate in vocational training. Another important aspect can be seen in the didactic concepts and contents of training which are often not sufficient for migrant needs for participation in the labour market. Therefore the courses need to be re-evaluated in order to modify and adapt the contents, didactic concepts and learning materials. To offer language and learning support could be an important factor for the successful participation of migrants. Furthermore, the structure of organisations themselves should represent the current diversity in societies; this means that migrants should have leading positions in companies and organisations as well.

Apart from changes in adult education, the recognition of skills by the government should be enhanced. Migrants also need better support from the public labour offices which determine, for example, if a person is allowed to attend certain courses without losing unemployment benefits.

In addition to the other factors noted, an anti-discrimination policy has to be established in Austria in order to facilitate the successful participation of skilled migrants in the labour market.

6. References


Marcin Starnawski

Hierarchies and unities of the victimised: Poland’s minorities on the way to empowerment

Introduction

In this paper, the author intends to address questions concerning status of national/ethnic and other minority groups in contemporary Poland. What follows is an account of a non-minority scholar and activist committed to antiracist education and research. The paper is organized around three tasks. First is to grasp realities of “diversity in diversity”, that is, complexities and the actual inequalities of minority statuses in contemporary Poland. The notion of “hierarchy” conveys the thesis that there are substantial structural, axiological and situational differences in what it means to be in a minority position. Consequently, revealing some of these differences might help construct an argument about what is to be done en route to minority groups’ empowerment in the Polish context. Empowerment is understood as ability to organise lasting grassroots agencies and supportive national structures, which involve both “minority” and “majority” actors, capable of reducing or eliminating a wide range of daily social, economic, cultural and political problems and transforming majority-minority relations. The second task is an attempt to evaluate critically one empowerment strategy popular in antiracist activism in Poland, namely practice of tolerance by recognition of identity/difference in purely cultural terms. The condition of the victimized will therefore be seen from a broader perspective on identity politics under socioeconomic and ideological constraints of neoliberal capitalism. The third task is to pose further questions of whether (and how): (1) antiracist activism can be informed by contemporary critical social analyses; (2) antiracist scholarship and activism can be reframed by shifting conceptual schemes structured by dichotomies of victim/perpetrator or oppressed/oppressor. A suggestion is made that while disparities among minorities could be dealt with through mobilizing a “coalition of the victimized” for greater public recognition and protection, another mode of grassroots politics aimed at transforming social structure and the related regimes of cultural representation might be seen in overcoming effects of “ideological exploitation” of the marginalized sectors of the majority society, i.e. those which often rely on racism, xenophobia or homophobia to secure their status and to see themselves as de facto and de jure dominant group.

Two major sources used are recent studies, in which the author was involved. One was aimed at examining abilities and strategies of hate crime monitoring and victim assistance by NGOs and groups representing national and ethnic and other minority communities in Poland. (Grell et al. 2009). Another project (Gawlicz, Starnawski 2009) was focused on women in poverty, and it included a small sample of Roma women from south-west Poland, who shared their experiences of socioeconomic marginalization as well as expectations concerning the role of minority organizations in improving the lives of their people.

Although the author uses the term “minority” with some reluctance, due to its potentially stigmatizing nature on the one hand and because it might overlook transnational networks and multicultural entanglements of contemporary diasporas (i.e. communities whose factions within particular nation-states are conventionally treated as “national” or “ethnic” minorities within the state) on the other, it is adopted as a tool necessary to understand tensions over identity/difference, “inclusion”, and self-awareness of the culturally, politically or economically marginalized. The notion of the “victimized”, while it focuses on negative experiences such as racism and other forms of ideologically-motivated hatred, seems crucial
to capture factors that hinder fuller recognition and integration of minority groups in the broader society.

**Historical overview**

Prior to World War II, Poland’s demographic structure included a significant proportion of national, ethnic and religious minorities. According to various estimates, in early 1930s national minorities constituted about 1/3 of the society.\(^1\) Similar was the proportion of the country’s residents who did not belong to the dominant Roman-Catholic religion.\(^2\) Several factors contributed to radical change in ethnic, cultural and religious composition of Poland following World War II. These were first of all:
- the annihilation of about 90% of Poland’s Jews;
- territorial shift, i.e. annexation of the eastern parts of the country by the Soviet Union while expanding western and northern borders onto the formerly German areas (most of which belonged to Polish state before 14\(^{th}\) century), thus leaving a substantial number of national minorities (such as Ukrainians, Belarusians and others) within the borders of the USSR
- further population changes, especially due to several waves of Jewish emigration (caused at some point by vast institutional coercion, such as in 1968-69), internal displacement and dispersion of Ukrainians and Lemkos during the Wśla Action of 1947, which, at least to some extent, might have advance assimilation processes among some members of these groups, and expulsion of Germans from the newly-acquired territories.

In result, Poland’s society became relatively more homogenous – yet not uniform – in ethnic, linguistic and religious terms. The authorities of the party-state ruling elite largely took advantage of these transformations and especially from early 1960s onwards they attempted to fuse state-socialist project with nationalistic politics. The latter stressed, for instance, Polish “national” memory of wartime martyrdom, with universal national narrative subsuming or writing out particular historical experiences, such as those of the Jews (Steinlauf 1997; Irwin-Zarecka 1989), as well as marginalized cultural and ideological experiences, loyalties and identifications that went beyond the boundaries of officially constructed national community.

With restoration of capitalism and pluralisation of political life after 1989, socio-economic tensions triggered ideologies of hatred. Among these, anti-Jewish, anti-German and anti-Russian sentiments, were most extensively present among representatives of more radical political circles on the right and in media. Popular prejudice, acts of discrimination, incidents of violence and hate speech were also noted, which were directed in particular against those citizens, residents or temporary visitors, who were Roma, Africans (especially students and sportsmen), Asians (especially Vietnamese migrants), refugees from the Caucasus (e.g. Chechens), Muslim immigrants from Arab countries, economic migrants from the ex-Soviet republics (often treated overall as “Russians” or to use a derogatory term “Ruscy”), Jews as well as a number of other, not ethnically defined groups, such as sexual minorities, members of “alternative” youth subcultures, activists of progressive social movements (feminists, militant unionists, antiracists etc.), the homeless and people with disabilities.\(^3\) It seems that

\(^1\) This proportion was 31% according to the 1931 National Census, or up to 34-35% according to estimates of some historians (Chalupczak, Browarek 2000: 22), with Ukrainians and Jews being the largest groups.

\(^2\) Taking Roman Catholics as the dominant denominational group, and treating other Catholic rites (e.g. Greek or Armenian) as minorities, one can speak of approximately 39% of Poland’s population as belonging to religious minorities according to the 1931 National Census. About 30% were non-Catholics.

\(^3\) The most comprehensive account of hate crime, hate speech and the related incidents in Poland, remains the *Brown Book*, published recently by the “Never Again” Association. See: Kornak 2009.
while the problem of minority situation was kept marginal by the state-socialist authorities prior to 1989, with occasional repressive measures against groups such as Germans, Jews, Ukrainians/Lemkos or Roma, the issue re-emerged as a result of opening-up of political discourses under formally democratic conditions. At the same time, policy makers were preoccupied with macrostructural transition to market economy rather than with concerns of minority groups. The latter have been a secondary issue in public life despite the growth of extremist political organizations and persistence of popular prejudice. During the 2005-07 parliamentary term, some members of such groups entered mainstream politics through right-wing parties. It is only with the rise of civil society actors exposing intolerance and xenophobia, that issues of anti-racism and intercultural dialogue entered mainstream debates and found limited space in educational programs in recent years. Even though there seems to be growing awareness of the problem of victimization and marginalization of minorities among politicians, law enforcement institutions as well as journalists, the legislation recognizes only some of the minority groups officially. Also, while there has been some improvement in legal framework to combat hate crime and hate speech and protect victims’ rights, the actual execution of legal measures falls short of expectations of the victimized groups, often due to public institutions’ lack of recognition of ideological nature of activity directed against minorities (Grel et al. 2009: 121-122).

**Status differentiation among minorities in Poland**

Being a minority in Poland often means experiencing tensions resulting from cultural/religious incompatibility with the dominant population, structural positioning in terms of socioeconomic status or deficit of power, as well as subjective interpretations of stigmatization. Nevertheless, conditions of different groups, and within groups, vary. In order to grasp these complexities and relative inequalities of minority statuses, one can take a look at indicators, which might be seen as correlates of particular minority situations. Here three such aspects of unequal status among minority groups are suggested:

1. General public’s perception of various minority groups in Poland
2. The actual experiences of victimization and marginalization.
3. The existing internal capacity for empowerment of minority organizations.

---

4 The “Act On National and Ethnic Minorities and on the Regional Languages” of 6 January 2005, was meant to “regulate the issues connected with the maintenance and development of the respective cultural identity of national and ethnic minorities, the preservation and development of the regional language, and the observance of the principle of equal treatment of individuals irrespective of their ethnic descent; it also defines the tasks and powers of government administration agencies and of local government units in this regard” (Article 1). The document defines national or ethnic minority as “a group of Polish citizens who jointly fulfil the following conditions: 1) is numerically smaller than the rest of the population of the Republic of Poland; 2) significantly differs from the remaining citizens in its language, culture or tradition; 3) strives to preserve its language, culture or tradition; 4) is aware of its own historical, national community, and is oriented towards its expression and protection; 5) its ancestors have been living on the present territory of the Republic of Poland for at least 100 years” (Article 2). What differentiates the two categories is the sixth criterion: a national minority is a group that “identifies itself with a nation organized in its own state”, while an ethnic minority does not. Therefore, the Act recognizes 9 national minorities (Belarusians, Czechs, Lithuanians, Germans, Armenians, Russians, Slovaks, Ukrainians and Jews) and 4 ethnic ones (Karaim, Lemko, Roma, Tartar). The number of minorities can only be estimated. There is a gap between the numbers provided by the 2002 National Census (with only 1,23% declaring non-Polish nationality and further 2% not specifying their nationality) and some earlier estimates of 3-5% (with Germans, Ukrainians and Belarusians constituting the largest groups). Among possible explanations of this difference might be that assimilation process advanced among some members of minorities or among people of mixed origin; or – alternatively – that people were actually afraid of revealing their nationality to the state; also, in 2002 no official definition of ethnic or national minority existed as yet.
While the first aspect can be measured through conventional quantitative surveys aimed at assessing Poles’ attitudes towards different groups, the second and the third aspects can be analyzed by taking into account subjective view of the actual or potential victims of racism and other forms of chauvinism. A qualitative study on how representatives of minority communities perceive and articulate their groups’ victimization, as well as on how minority organizations tackle the problem of hate crime, is used for this purpose.

A number of surveys by the Centre for Opinion Research (CBOS) showed how different nationalities and ethnic groups were perceived by representative samples of Poles. For example, December 2008 polls indicated that while overall attitudes became less negative than in previous years, there still persists a visible hierarchy of sympathies for different national and ethnic groups (including Poland’s minorities). Among the groups most “liked” were those associated with the stereotype of the “developed West” (e.g. Italians, Spanish, English, French, Irish) or Central-European nations presented by mainstream discourses as having common geopolitical interests with Poles (Czechs, Slovaks, Hungarians). Among those at the bottom of the scale were, on the one hand, those perceived through the stereotype of the “undeveloped and backward East” (Arabs, Romanians, Russians, Turks, Vietnamese, Chinese) and those traditionally subject to stigmatization in the Polish society on the other (Roma and Jews) (CBOS 2008). Comparatively, in a 1999 study focused only on national and ethnic minorities living in Poland, the most negative attitudes were expressed towards Roma and Jews, and then Ukrainians and Russians, while the most favoured were Slovaks and Czechs (CBOS 1999). In a 2006 survey (CBOS 2007), 55% said they would oppose their child’s marriage with a person of Jewish nationality (also 20% of those who had positive attitudes towards Jews said they would oppose), while only 20% indicated their potential opposition to a Czech person marrying their child. On religious grounds, 55% and 47% said they would oppose their child marrying a Muslim or a Jew (person of the Mosaic faith), while less than 1/3 would oppose a member of the Lutheran church. Another study (CBOS 2005) showed how differently various national and ethnic minorities living in Poland are present in popular consciousness. Respondents were asked to mention all national/ethnic minorities they know. While 54% of those polled mentioned Germans, 42% – Ukrainians, 41% – Roma and 31% – Jews, Russians were mentioned only by 19%, Belarusians by 17%, Lithuanians by 11%, but Vietnamese only by 5%, Arabs by 2% and Africans by 1% of the respondents. Interestingly, 5% mentioned Muslims as an ethnic minority. Moreover, only 27% admitted they personally knew anyone who was a member of an ethnic or national minority.

While there seems to be a clear diversity among minorities regarding the ways they are perceived by the general public, it might be useful to take a brief look at how they differ in their self-description in terms of victimization and marginalization in the Polish society. One of the purposes of the 2008 Polish-German study on hate crime monitoring and victim assistance (Grell et al. 2009) was to examine operational uses of antiracist terminology, especially the term “hate crime”, by NGOs dealing with human rights and minority protection, including those representing particular ethnic, national, religious or other minority groups. It was noted that while there were organizations/leaders who were vocal about their experiences with racism and xenophobia, and were ready to articulate them openly, there were others, who avoided the subject or saw it as a relatively insignificant issue. Explicit use of “hate crime” terminology as part of organization’s agenda might be a result of higher competences in antiracist training or of the fact that in case of some victimized groups, their situation of stigmatization and suffering has been publicly recognized in the context of their history in Poland. At the same time there are those who do not deal with these problems

---

5 See also: Polish Public Opinion, December 2008: 3.
6 25 interviews with representatives of 23 organizations were used for analysis in the Polish part of the report.
specifically, due to their relatively stable conditions or relative absence of prejudice/discrimination in a group’s daily experiences (an example might be a representative of the German Students Union in Opole, who stressed that her organization is focused on promoting German culture rather than on countering xenophobia as such).

Still, there are those who can be considered “visible minorities” (for their distinct outlook, such as skin colour, or the daily use of their own language), but despite being theoretically most threatened by hate crime, they do not perceive racism or xenophobia to be the major issue in their experiences in Poland (Grell et al. 2009: 93-94). In fact, there seems to be a striking discrepancy between some groups’ experiences and their leaders’ attitude towards the problem of victimization. One example can be a representative of a Vietnamese association, who stated: “We do not deal with hate crime. The Poles are good people, and I do not see a problem.” Yet he mentioned numerous cases of abuse and mistreatment of the members of the Vietnamese community in Poland, especially by the police, immigration service or private security in the streets or at market places where a large part of these migrants work (ibid., p. 94). Another discrepancy was noted among representatives of Muslim and Arab community. On the one hand, an imam of the Muslim congregation in Wroclaw and director of the local Muslim Centre for Culture and Education, seemed to have an ambivalent position. He admitted that “activity against discrimination and xenophobia is our daily bread”, but seemed to underestimate or even marginalize the problem of hate crime as experienced by Muslims and Arabs in Poland. Despite the fact that incidents of arson attacks against two Arab restaurants in Wroclaw were reported in September 2001 (after the 9/11 attacks), the imam’s story was that of the city being open and tolerant and Poles (or Slavic people in general) more accepting of Muslims than other Europeans. On the other hand, this tendency to keep low profile seems to stand in contradiction to a view of a leader of the Arabia.pl Association, an organization whose aim is to promote Arab and Muslim cultures as well as to integrate the immigrant community with people interested in the related cultural, religious and social issues. He admitted that the community was threatened not only by groups of violent youngsters or neo-Fascist skinheads, but also by state security service (ibid., p. 94, 111).

What might account for these discrepancies in how a situation of a group is described, as well as for the avoidance to call these experiences by their name (racism, xenophobia, hate crime etc.), is the relative instability of conditions of those groups that are not recognized as minorities in legal terms. In case of the Vietnamese or other Asian immigrants, it is their undocumented status in Poland that forces them to keep low profile and not complain about the actual fate as victims of prejudice, discrimination and violence. In case of Arab community, it is both the Polish government’s position on the “war on terror” (and Polish army’s involvement in occupation of Iraq and Afghanistan) and anti-Arab/anti-Muslim discourses produced even by liberal mainstream media in recent years, that prevents some community leaders from speaking about mistreatment openly, and isolates those human rights activists who wish to expose such incidents.

Another aspect of diversity of experiences of victimization was voiced by a representative of African students’ community in Kraków. Although he recognized the fact that Africans in Poland were subject to racist attacks, he seemed to have a moderate position

---

7 It was estimated that some 70% of the Vietnamese in Poland are undocumented immigrants, which means they have no right to work and to live in the country. Due to the fact that most of them are economic migrants rather than victims of political oppression, they cannot apply for the refugee status (Grell et al. 2009: 94, footnote 3).

8 One famous case of deportation with a “rationale” provided on the grounds of “anti-terrorist” measures, was an expulsion of an imam Ahmad Ammar, a doctoral candidate at the University in Poznań and a long-time resident of Poland. Following the public accusations of the alleged links to terrorist groups, despite protests of the local academic community in his defence, Ammar was expelled to his home country, Yemen, in April 2004.
about the problem. He said the incidents of this kind were “accidental” and that during his five years spent in Poland he was a victim of racism “only” twice. At the same time he admitted that those of his colleagues and friends who have “darker skin” experienced such situations more frequently (ibid., p. 95).

The problem of unequal standing of different minorities can also be looked at through the question of organizational capacity to tackle the issues of racism and xenophobia. The study on hate crime monitoring and victim assistance showed that while there are NGOs with staff and volunteers with extensive training in the field and ability to provide legal and psychological aid to the victims, other organizations and groups lack the necessary cultural and social capital, such as professional knowledge, language and other cultural competences, financial assistance and political support from the mainstream society. An indicator of this might be a discrepancy in needs for victim support between officially recognized national and ethnic minorities as well as LGBT organizations relying on highly educated activists in large cities, and immigrant/refugee organizations working among people in refugee camps in Eastern Poland (mainly groups from Caucasus, such as Chechens and Ingush). While institutional conditions of some communities provide framework for a relatively advanced activity in the field of minority protection, in case of the two refugee organizations virtually every form of support was indicated as deficit so far: legal, psychological and social assistance, cultural and language education, legal training for community members, general education on minority rights, qualified staff and general political support (ibid., p. 120, Table 9). Public institutions’ failure to recognize hate crime and xenophobic tensions around some immigrant groups, made these communities organize self-defence groups for physical counter-confrontation – a form of activity not recognized as legitimate by community leaders, but proven the “most effective” in preventing escalation of violence (ibid., p. 111-112).

Looking from another angle: Roma women in poverty

Another field research, done in August 2009, was aimed at examining experiences as well as strategies of coping with situation of poverty by women from a post-mining town of Wałbrzych in the Lower Silesia region (Gawlicz, Starnawski 2009). Among study subjects were three Roma women aged 39, 47 and 56. They were included in the study sample because of difficult socio-economic situation that a substantial part of this ethnic group experience in Poland.10 Racist victimization did not appear as a major theme during interviews, however it was mentioned explicitly in two contexts. One was the experiences of Roma children in schools: it was noted that some of them faced stigmatization from their peers, yet the interviewees stressed that those harassing had been a tiny group as opposed to the majority of those pupils who had not hold prejudice based on ethnic stereotypes. It was rather the question of harsh social conditions and parents’ poverty that constituted the major concern of the women about Roma children being stigmatized and excluded from full participation in school activities. Two women, Jolanta (47) and Iwona (39), who were mothers of children in

---

9 Today the city numbers some 122,000 residents and has experienced decline of population by almost 20,000 over the last 15-18 years, due to complete liquidation of once well-developed state-owned coal mining industry that had formed the basis of local economy.
10 For general evaluation of conditions of Roma in Poland during the 1989-2002 period, see European Roma Rights Center 2002. The report mentions the following areas of human rights abuses against Roma in Poland: racially motivated violence, failure to protect Roma and denial of justice for Romani victims of hate crime, police abuse, racial discrimination in fields of housing, medical care, employment, social welfare and access to goods and services, as well as school segregation, denial of the right to education and school abuse.
schooling age, emphasized that due to lack of financial means their offspring frequently cannot participate in some school events, which is the reason for their absence:

> When the class go to a theatre or cinema and my son has to contribute 8 or 9 zlotys, I cannot give him such an amount of money, because I don’t have it. So, when there is theatre or cinema on the schedule, my son does not go to school. (Jolanta)

The same can be said about the lack of means to purchase school kit, such as copybooks: if children do not have copybooks, they will not go to school, but if paper materials are purchased, there will be shortage of money for food. Both Roma mothers stressed that school-related expenses are a heavy burden for them, and they were quite aware of the stigmatization of poor children by their peers. In this case stigmatization resulting from poverty is reinforced by ethnic difference, thus enormous efforts of these women to ensure that their offspring go to school clean and neatly dressed, “so that other kids don’t laugh that the Roma are dirty.”

More explicit experience with racial discrimination appeared in the context of public institutions’ failure to provide accurate solution for unemployment issues. The following story was shared by Jolanta:

> I passed an examination and received a certificate for cash register service. But it is hard for us [Roma] to get a job. It is not enough that a Roma woman has occupational training. In one shop they wanted to employ a saleswoman, so I went there with my certificate, and it was conveniently not far from my home. But a lady there saw that I was a Roma and she said they had already employed someone else. So I immediately knew they got scared, since the job was, you know, about cash register service. What a pity with this job training!

Here occupational training proved useless not because it was not fit the job market reality (as often happens), but because Jolanta faced racial prejudice and discrimination based on a stereotype of Roma as thieves. Even though the Roma women interviewed did not mention anti-Roma racism frequently, local public institutions seem to have failed to create better conditions for this group and there seems to be a lack of effective anti-discrimination policy.

What seems significant in these Roma women’s reflections on their situation, is that they did not stress the issues of ethnic difference or cultural recognition as much as they emphasized their social and economic needs. For persons who are periodically forced to beg, to ask for postponed payment in a local grocery store, or to hand items such as cell phone to a pawn-shop just to provide children with meals and satisfy their other basic needs, celebration of their own ethnic culture seems not as important as search for existential stability in terms of material conditions. At the same time, it should be noted that these Roma women stressed their rootedness in the local community of the White Stone district of Wałbrzych where they live. They claim that in this community, of which Roma families are only a small part, “everyone” knows them and that they feel accepted. It gives them a relative sense of security, which they may not have found somewhere else. When asked whether they would like to migrate to another town in Poland or abroad, they expressed little interest in such solution for their socioeconomic problems. The sense of belonging in Wałbrzych is one factor here, while another is the fact that they come from the Podkarpacie region (southern Poland), where Roma experience particularly harsh conditions, so the return could not be possible without solid welfare aid and renewal of contacts with their family and friends.

Roma women’s focus on questions of social welfare rather than cultural recognition can also be noticed in their criticism of activity of local Roma Association. While this NGO is sometimes perceived as a legitimate organization to tackle a wide range of problems afflicting Roma community, the interviewees expressed scepticism in this regard. When Teresa (56)
contacted the housing administration office to inform that the floor in her flat was broken and asked for repair, she was told that she should address the Roma Association for this. Yet in her opinion, the organization is not really active and one cannot rely on its support. Other women were also critical and said that the Association leaders “don’t do anything, and we get nothing from them, no assistance in housing difficulties.” They criticized the NGO for actions, which from their perspective are either irrelevant or do not alleviate their harsh living conditions. They treat cultural activity as such irrelevant form of community work:

“So what they create musical bands? It is no big deal to create a band, but the challenge is to provide children with complete school materials, copybooks etc.” (Teresa)

These women expected that the Roma Association would help them cope with daily problems that they cannot overcome themselves, such as replacement of leaky windows, purchase of school textbooks, paying for school insurance for children, as well as provision and distribution of clothing, food or cleaning chemicals. In their opinions, none of these expectations were actually met. It should be mentioned here that in the White Stone neighbourhood a substantial part of social assistance (including distribution of clothes or school kits for children, as well as legal aid in dealing with problems related to housing or welfare) is provided to this largely impoverished population not only by official institutions, but self-organized group of activists working for the neighbourhood council.

Perspectives of poor Roma women provide a somewhat different angle to look at marginalization and empowerment of minority, than the one presented earlier. First, these voices do not come from ethnic community leaders or other relatively well-positioned representatives, but from economically underprivileged grassroots members of the community. Since two of the three women who were interviewed are uneducated and illiterate persons, one might claim these are voices of the marginal among the marginalized. Second, they carry a gender perspective, which often seems to be absent from discourses of leaders, who often happen to be men. Primary concern with childcare and frequently expressed worry about lack of equality in task-sharing with men in coping with household or family issues, seem of particular importance in a community, which retains largely traditional gender patterns. One might therefore ask what kind of empowerment would be the primary need of these Roma women in poverty. Is it legitimate to infer from the above description a specific in-community critical discourse on identity/recognition strategy of minority emancipation? Can we construct an opposition of existential-material concerns of poor Roma women vs. public construction of idealized and romanticized Roma culture that in fact has gained some popularity in Poland through commercial festivals and TV broadcasts? Finally, given the women’s rootedness in a broader local community of an impoverished neighbourhood in a town afflicted by capitalist restoration manifested in destruction of industrial economic base after the collapse of state-socialist regime, can we search for empowerment strategies beyond ethnic identity by claiming that the integrating or unifying factor, or a “starting point”, are private and public experiences of poverty that cross ethnic divisions?

Some further suggestions

The above questions make way for a critique of cultural recognition strategy that seems to be the dominant view on minorities’ emancipation among multicultural educators, advocates of tolerance, as well as many antiracist activists in Poland. Perhaps these questions can be articulated in a form of stronger claims, like those made by Pierre Bourdieu and Loïc Wacquant with regard to “multiculturalism” as an example of “neoliberal newspeak” of
academic or intellectual circles whose “scholastic discussions of recognition and identity” the authors contrast with the actual socio-economic conditions of “subordinate classes and ethnic groups”. It is “a celebration of the culture of the dominated” that was criticized by the authors calling instead for a structural analysis of the effects of state failure to perform its social functions such as public education or provision of equal access to institutions of higher learning (cf. Bourdieu, Wacquant 2000).

Nonetheless, one can locate the above analysis within the framework of the recognition/redistribution debate, keeping in mind different philosophical rationales that might underlie attempts to reconcile the cultural (or cultural-political) with the economic (or socioeconomic) (see Fraser, Honneth 2003). It seems that both categories need to be invoked in the Polish context. On the one hand, eradication of the prejudice/discrimination/violence requires various forms of recognizing inequality of ethnic/national/religious and other minority statuses (with predicament of LGBT persons being among more politically vivid minority issues in Poland) and striving for cultural, ideological as well as legal-political change. On the other hand, as example of Roma women has shown, there certainly are aspects of minorities’ existence where the primary need is an effective redistribution policy not only able to transform labour market relations and resolve immediate welfare problems, but also inclusive of measures for development in areas such as housing, education or even issues related to gender division of unwaged labour in the context of domestic work.

There remains the question of whether (and how) scholarship and activism aimed at promoting both cultural/ethnic diversity as understood in terms of approaching the democratic ideal on the one hand, and social and economic policy aimed at creating cohesive structures of relatively egalitarian society on the other, could foster the creation of effective political agencies able to transform the existing institutional and symbolic regimes. Here the author would like to suggest two parallel but mutually nourishing modes of constructing collective emancipatory action. For the task of increasing public recognition and protection of minorities, a kind of “universalisation of difference” strategy might be welcome in a form of a “coalition of the victimized”. That is, a multitude of minority groups, categories and individuals creating not only the platform for recognition politics but also for replacing “inherited diversity” with “diversity in inventing the future” (Amin 2004). One of the roles of adult educators in this regard could be to identify “sites of tensions” in a society, where a minority’s status is threatened. In the Polish part of the study on hate crime monitoring and victim assistance, it was found that informal groups of local volunteers and grassroots campaigners (mainly of younger generation) had competence to play such a role, based “not so much on specialized knowledge and skills necessary for long-term and systematic research on hate crimes, but rather a very practical knowledge on local sites of tensions (relations between subcultures or inter-religious conflicts over symbolic space)” (Grell et al. 2009: 101).

For the task of struggling for redistributive justice, what may be relevant is the possible reconfiguration of categories of the oppressed and the oppressors. As we have seen, there are differences of positioning and capacities among the former to undertake empowerment action. Likewise, it may be useful to look at those groups and individuals who enter subcultures or movements motivated by chauvinist ideologies directed against minorities, as being subject to “ideological exploitation” by political leaders, media, intellectuals or other centres of power (cf. Starnawski 2008: 321-323). Ideological exploitation can thus be seen as a social relation, where some individuals/groups take advantage of other individual’s/group’s social or cultural background and dispositions to feel and act as dominant group despite the actual (relatively) underprivileged position in the broader socioeconomic structure and deprivation of political power. Just as tolerance and respect for otherness are learned and internalized as part of individual’s or group’s habitus, so is the disposition to intolerance and hatred. As a form of “habitus abuse”, ideological
exploitation (as manifested historically in popular antisemitism, racism of the poor whites, anti-immigrant campaigns among the working class, or ultraconservative backlash against sexual minorities, progressive women’s movements or liberal culture in general\textsuperscript{11}) serves the benefit of the truly dominant (or oppressive) classes and ethnic/cultural groups, but those marginalized or relatively worse off sectors of the cultural, ethnic or national majority, who are actually ideologically exploited, can find psychological, symbolic or even partial socioeconomic “gratifications” as well. The role of adult educators committed to transformative action in this context could be of double significance. On the one hand they could facilitate the critical education-in-action by unmasking the effects of ideological exploitation to the deprived sections of the “majority” society by showing the structural causes of social inequalities, economic crises or political domination. On the other hand, they could assist both minority communities and the worse off classes or groups of the majority in forging links and alliances in articulating claims of greater social justice in the society as a whole. This project could be carried out within a nation-state, but perhaps the EU institutional context as a supranational space allows constructing a transnational European social movement, which was argued for by Bourdieu (2003). The latter idea seems to have found some articulations in the European Social Forum’s “assembly of social movements” and development of proposals for “democratic and social Europe”, where anti-neoliberal and anti-racist claims are treated as necessary components of such transformative program. Perhaps such an approach, by taking issues such as poverty, unemployment, housing deterioration, educational needs etc. could provide us with a broader view on the unities of the victimized, which might be established both within and across ethnicities, but with “universalized difference” strategy, might help go beyond ethnic divisions altogether. The suggested way towards minorities’ empowerment (and, in fact, majorities as well) through antiracist action, is not, however, that of eradicating difference, but rather seeks to explore greater potential of “diversity in inventing the future.”

\textbf{Bibliography}


\textsuperscript{11} On the appeal of the backlash politics for lower and working classes, see the well-known account by Frank 2004 in the U.S. context.


ARISTOTLE, ADULT EDUCATION AND EUROPEAN CITIZENSHIP

David Sullivan, Bangor University
Shirley Egley, University of Wales, Newport

The Current Background

The European Union has had much to say about adult education and at times it has seemed to be very generous in the role it accords it in the development of a tolerant and democratic Europe. The authors of Making a European Area of Lifelong Learning a Reality (Commission of the European Communities, 2001), for example, write fulsomely of its benefits.

‘Lifelong Learning contributes to the establishment of an EU area of Lifelong Learning the aims of which are to empower citizens to move freely between learning settings, jobs, regions and countries, making the most of their knowledge and competences and to meet the goals and ambitions of the EU to be more prosperous, inclusive, tolerant and democratic.’

Empowering citizens to move freely between learning settings sounds as if it must be a good thing, even if ‘learning settings’ seems slightly Orwellian. And what adult educator wouldn’t be pleased to be involved in a project to make the EU more inclusive, tolerant and democratic? They would even welcome the idea of helping to make the EU more prosperous, though they would also want to ask: ‘prosperous for whom?’ And there is the difficulty.

Much of the EU’s official thinking about adult education, and much British policy making too, have stressed its pragmatic importance to the economy and issues of inclusivity, tolerance and democracy have been understood in the light of that. This is particularly important because these issues feed into the EU’s much stated concern for the promotion of social justice, to which adult education has a great deal to contribute. While we do not wish to deny that the EU understands that adult education has a significant role to play in building an inclusive, tolerant and democratic Europe, we do wish to argue that this aim may at times be in conflict with this other, more pragmatic, view of the place of adult education in the economy.

Conflicting views of adult education

Contemporary adult education, then, is drawn in two conflicting directions. On the one hand it is increasingly expected to reinforce certain dominant European and national narratives of citizenship. These place special stress on a range of economic and social values, with a particular emphasis currently on the need to develop the skills and attitudes required to compete in a global economy. In that sense they emphasise a form of European social cohesion, although during
times of economic downturn this may be partly challenged by a greater emphasis on national (or even regional) cohesion.

Yet such an approach is often considered to be in conflict with the idea that adult education should provide the space for a critical analysis of dominant narratives and the resources to consider alternatives—a process that is essential for the promotion of an active citizenship which recognises and values cultural, ethnic and linguistic diversity. Indeed, current funding for adult education in Britain often plays down the critical and emphasises the functional. Moreover, adult educators sometimes overreact by emphasising the element of pleasure in education—as if it were a pastime with no ultimately serious purpose.

The two points are closely related and brought together with some force in a recent editorial in the *International Journal of Lifelong Education*.

‘The civilised society requires more than consumer durables and tradable derivatives. It requires values and principles. It requires rigorous and organised knowledge and understanding. This means we should have the courage to examine, teach and discuss what requires hard, sustained discipline—not only what is fun. It means making a humane, liberal lifelong education available as a matter of principle to all members of society—not only to the élite.’ (Editorial, 2009)

**Aristotelian Perspectives**

In order to address these issues (and with particular reference to the third and fourth themes of the conference) we discuss some recent work in moral philosophy and the philosophy of education which draws on neo-Aristotelian ideas. In particular we look at Aristotle’s analysis of the relationship between the intellectual and moral virtues and citizenship and seek to show its significance for the current debate.

Aristotle’s account of citizenship emphasises the need to be educated in to the values of one’s community and in doing so to learn the dominant narrative and acquire the moral virtues required in order to live as a member of that community (Aristotle, 2009: 1130b8). But the cultivation of the intellectual virtues involves the development of (among other things) the ability to think critically. This, we argue, must include the ability to criticise the dominant narrative into which one has been educated. We argue that this approach provides the tools for an articulation of a concept of citizenship and education which allows for a genuinely critical approach to shared narratives. Adult education has a role both in helping in the articulation of the different narratives and in providing a space in which they can be subjected to critical analysis.¹

¹ This view the relationship between the moral and the intellectual virtues in Aristotle is not uncontested. See Hughes (2001: 45-51) for an introduction to the debate, and Curren (2000), discussed below.
How can we understand the role of adult education in processes of belonging and community formation? The Aristotelian answer to this question would stress the importance of reinforcing the dominant narrative, what Aristotle refers to, in the opening section of the *Politics*, as the shared concept of the good (Aristotle, 1988: 1252a1). The maintenance such a narrative is essential to the well being of a society and without it the society could not function.

This seems to indicate a significant difference between the two elements in Aristotelian moral theory. However, as Randall Curren has argued (Curren, 2000) this picture is modified quite significantly when we considerer the content of the moral virtues which a proper education is supposed to develop. These virtues are, as Aristotle himself frequently points out, virtues which are required to live in a civil manner in good standing with one’s fellow citizens but their application is also subject to critical analysis by the intellectual virtues.

But there are problems with this view, one of which may seem particularly appropriate given our earlier emphasis on the importance of critical thinking. Aristotle’s account of a just society presupposes a shared concept of the good, but isn’t that exactly what we have been claiming is wrong with the way in which European and national governments, including the British, view adult education? They take a particular view of the public good and draw from that a particular economic and social model for education which, we claim, is far too narrow.

**A Liberal Alternative**

The alternative might seem to be a liberal view such as that of John Rawls which gives priority to the right over the good.

For Rawls, the key idea in public reason is that people who live in a democracy have to have ways of negotiating with each other over the basic principles of justice and order in society. This is really a pragmatic issue – what is necessary to live together peacefully?

‘The idea of public reason, as I understand it, belongs to a conception of a well-ordered constitutional democratic society. The form and content of this reason – the way it is understood by citizens and how it interprets their political relationship – are part of the idea of democracy itself. This is because a basic feature of democracy is the fact of reasonable pluralism – the fact that a plurality of conflicting reasonable comprehensive doctrines, religious, philosophical, and moral, is the normal result of its culture of free institutions. Citizens realize that they cannot reach agreement or anything approaching mutual understanding on the basis of their irreconcilable comprehensive doctrines. In view of this, they need to consider what kinds of reasons they may reasonably give one another when fundamental political questions are at stake. I propose that in public reason comprehensive doctrines of truth or
right be replaced by an idea of the politically reasonable addressed to citizens as citizens.’ (Rawls, 1999: 131-2)

Public reason does not encompass the public sphere in Habermas’ sense of the term. It only extends to the public space and does not include what Rawls calls

‘the background culture. This is the culture of civil society. In a democracy, this culture is not, of course, guided by any one central idea or principle, whether political or religious. Its many and diverse agencies and associations with their internal life reside within a framework of law that ensures the familiar liberties of thought and speech, and the right of free association.’ (Rawls, 1999: 134)

So the background culture is much more open, and allows for a wide range of discussions. This seems very liberal and even-handed, but the difficulty is that much of this background discussion can have no bearing on the debate over public policy.

And this in turn is relevant to the present position of adult education in Britain, and in the broader European context. Much of traditional liberal and radical adult education was concerned precisely with questions about competing values and narratives. And it was often directly concerned to challenge what Rawls refers to as ‘an idea of the politically reasonable.’ The current view of adult education as providing economic skills relegates questions about values to the background, where they become irrelevant to policy decisions. That is why some adult education is in danger of being reduced to entertainment or, as the Editors of the International Journal of Lifelong Education so damningly put it, ‘fun’.

For all its apparent fairness, Rawls’ model effectively rules out of contention any but a small range of options that fit with the current consensus. Our disagreement with this is partly over fairness – people have a right to be heard even if their views are unorthodox. But there is a philosophically much more important point, which is that that we cannot really discuss – let alone settle – questions about policy without addressing the more fundamental moral (and perhaps religious or metaphysical) issues. It is for this reason that discussions about the nature of the good – or as Aristotle would put it ‘the good of the community’ – cannot be relegated to the backroom of adult education but have to be explored in the public space.

The Good Life and the Bad

Michael Sandel makes a similar broad Aristotelian point in the Reith Lectures for 2009.

‘The attempt to detach arguments about justice and rights from arguments about the good life is mistaken for two reasons: first, it’s not always possible to decide questions of justice and rights without resolving substantive moral
questions, and this is true whether we’re arguing about surrogacy or about how to distribute flutes or political authority or the right to use a golf cart or same sex marriage. Arguments about justice and rights are unavoidably arguments about the moral meaning of the goods at stake. The second reason is that even where it may be possible, it may not be desirable.’ (Sandel 2009)

Nevertheless, we should not minimise the dangers inherent in an idea of the good articulated and defended in a public narrative. In a European context that can encourage the sense of a European identity which diminishes the value of specific regional or national identities. This is a problem with some versions of cosmopolitanism, which so emphasise the global that they diminish the worth of the local. The experience of many people who have worked on European projects, including ourselves, is that working with European partners can bring a heightened sense of difference, as well as deepening an awareness of much in common.

As an illustration of this, one of has recently been working on an Erasmus multilateral Curriculum Development project. Quite properly we were seeking to find agreement not only on the framework for the curriculum but also a consensus in relation to the values we bring to such a project. One of the central issues was around the different perspectives on the use of English as the language of the project. The difficulties here were apparent not only on both the official openly articulated level but more disturbingly on a deeper emotionally charged level which was never confronted but affected all other discourse.

How is it possible, against such a background, to promote both social cohesion and diversity – or are they indeed incompatible objectives? One way to address such problems is in terms of the frequently discussed idea of multiple identities. We will talk about this in the recent work of Amartya Sen.

Sen’s recent book The Idea of Justice (Sen, 2009) has been highly critical of Rawls’ approach, in a way which fits well with our earlier discussion of Rawls. But here we want to discuss his argument in Identity and Violence: The Illusion of Destiny (Sen, 2005) that it is misleading – and dangerous – to define a person or a community in terms of one particular identity. This makes him highly critical of communitarianism which defines a person’s identity in terms of the community of which he or she is a part.

‘Many communitarian thinkers tend to argue that a dominant cultural identity is only a matter of self-realization, not of choice. It is however, hard to believe that a person really has no choice in deciding what relative importance to attach to the various groups to which he or she belongs, and that she must just ‘discover’ her identities, as if it were a purely natural phenomenon (like determining whether it is day or night). …’ (Sen, 2005: 5)
Such an idea does underpin much nationalist thinking in Europe (including in the UK), and often underpins educational policies, including the various varieties of the national curriculum which exist in the different parts of the UK. As such they reinforce the dominant narrative, but in a manner that is, potentially at least, particularly oppressive. By arguing that the narrative enables people to realise their true potential, which is available to them as part of their cultural heritage it closes down certain other possibilities.

‘The point at issue is not whether any identity whatever can be chosen (that would be an absurd claim), but whether we do indeed have choices over alternative identities or combinations of identities, and perhaps more importantly, substantial freedom regarding what priority to give to the various identities we may simultaneously have.’ (Sen, 2005: 38)

This is not only about whether a person might have say a British / European conflict of identities but whether other sources of identity might compete with identities relating to place – such as identities related to gender or sexual orientation – which lend a complexity to place identities. For instance, during an exchange programme, female students from Wales studying alongside female students in Ireland found their assumptions surrounding identity challenged. Instead of experiencing difference in relation to religious identity (which is what they expected as they paused to reflect on what to expect from their exchange visit) they found an unexpected commonality in relation to their gender identity.

A particular danger in the idea of fixed or natural identities is that it excludes those who are not part of that heritage from participating in it: they cannot actualize something which was not potentially there to begin with. For those who are not part of the national community the narrative is, effectively, not available to them. They can understand it but they cannot embrace it as their own.

A critically educated people will be aware of the dangers of too narrow a view of human potentially. Like Aristotle they will recognise multiplicity of human experience and will perhaps share his conviction that a wide ranging knowledge of other societies will help us to appreciate both the value and the temporality of our own. Perhaps, too, they will (and should) share Aristotle’s view that there is a common good to which all humans aspire even though it is glimpsed in different ways in different societies.

Conclusion

Of course huge problems remain. There will be much misunderstanding and some serious disagreements. But what is important is that open debate will help to clarify misunderstanding and that disagreements can be acknowledged and faced squarely. This is something that we have reflected on as we have worked to establish a philosophical Community of Enquiry to open up opportunities for the free exchange of ideas within our classes (see Fisher (2003), Kelly (2005) &
Kuhn (2005)). This pedagogy (whereby students are encouraged to build upon each others ideas in response to questions that themselves have determined) has been found to offer the means by which the public space can be creatively and productively occupied by adult learners who seek to learn from and through each other’s diversity.

For such an open debate to take place properly requires citizens who are not just educated in the skills required to make themselves – and their society – prosperous. It also requires, as *Making a European Area of Lifelong Learning a Reality* rightly says, the skills needed to live as citizens in an inclusive, tolerant and democratic society. This, we have argued, is central both to the historic vision of adult education and to the Aristotelian perspective that we have been defending because both emphasise that citizens should seek to shape, or reshape, that society according to just principles. To do so those citizens will need a shared idea of the good life which is just and fair but also based on a critical understanding of the need to listen to others and engage in open debate with them. Not a new agenda for adult education, but a welcome return to what it has always been at its best.
REFERENCES


How to live with difference in a homogeneous society: findings from a training initiative to combat xenophobic attitudes in Japanese student nurses in the wake of an influx of Indonesian nurses to Japan.

Naoko Suzuki
Associate Professor in Continuing Education
Centre for University Extension
University of Tokushima, Japan

Introduction
As the economic crisis worsens in many parts of the globe, developing a cosmopolitan way of thinking and acquiring personal flexibility and adaptability are becoming important factors in moving towards a genuinely multicultural society. This is easier said than done, however, especially in a country which has a strong tradition of homogeneity. This paper intends to illustrate the difficulties faced by foreign workers and their would-be co-workers in Japan, and focuses on the current influx of Indonesian trainee nurses into the Japanese medical sector. First, the author defines the background to the topic. She draws on her experience of delivering a training course to student nurses, and examines where and how people living in a country with such a strong homogeneous tradition can learn to live with different cultures in a heterogeneous environment.

Background to the Issue
Japan has long been reluctant to live with outsiders for fear of disrupting its social order, and in fact there was a period from the early sixteenth century to the late nineteenth century when the feudal government broke off almost all relations with foreign countries. One clear reason for this tendency is Japan’s geography. It consists of four main islands and has no national land borders. Over time, this has had a tremendous effect on people’s attitudes within the country. On the one hand, it has solidified internal unity, but it has also made people, consciously or unconsciously, indifferent to the existence of others with different cultural backgrounds. Most people have retained this attitude in today’s society, and it has been difficult to change the way they see people from other cultures.

In the period after the World Wars there was a surplus of internal labour which resulted in workers emigrating, and this situation continued into the late 1970s. From the early 1980s onwards, there were clear developments in workers’ mobility due to demographic changes and a maturing of society. More young people were achieving higher degrees and qualifications, and domestic Japanese workers were beginning to lose interest in unskilled work. At the same time, many workers in other countries lost their jobs during the economic slump which followed the oil crisis, and they began to look towards Japan’s buoyant economy. At this point, they poured into the country from a variety of places in Asia, such as the Philippines and Korea in the early 1980s, and Bangladesh, Pakistan, Iran, Brazil and Peru from the mid 1980s.

Until the late 1980s, a debate on whether the nation should open up its labour market did not lead to any major changes in policy, as the central government stuck to its original line of “accepting only skilled, as opposed to unskilled, labourers from overseas.” They were afraid that there would be fewer job opportunities for domestic workers and reduced productivity within the labour force. They were also concerned that the development of the industrial infrastructure would be delayed even further, that there would be an increase in unemployment in domestic workers (with the attendant social costs), and that there would be a
number of direct and indirect impacts on workers, their places of work and their country of origin.

Despite official policy, however, a large number of foreign workers were admitted to manual jobs. Most of them first entered the country on a sightseeing, student or training visa, and then took on manual work by changing their visa status or by working illegally. In fact, most employers in medium to small sized companies, especially in the manufacturing sector, have now acknowledged that they cannot meet their needs without foreign manual workers. This tendency was accelerated by an amendment to the Immigration Control and Refugee Recognition Act in 1990. Given this situation, industry is urging the government to acknowledge that the nation has come under increasing pressure to accept more immigrant workers to cope with a labour shortage. This sense of crisis has been accelerated by the sharp drop in the overall population in absolute terms in 2005, together with issues such as globalisation, an aging society and declining fertility rates.

Nowadays, foreign residents make up 1.7% of the total population (2007) and 1.1% of these are workers (2006) [JILPT 2009]. This figure is still far lower than the average rate for most industrial countries, but it has nevertheless been rising year by year. The main nationalities of foreign workers are currently Chinese, Korean, Brazilian, Peruvian, Filipino, Taiwanese, Thai, Indonesian and Iranian, and they undertake the majority of the low-paid jobs. Though the percentage of foreign workers is relatively small, their importance to the labour force cannot be underestimated, given the country’s current labour market situation. The problem, however, is that the central government has made legislative changes without implementing sufficient measures to counteract the variety of anxieties and fears affecting both Japanese and foreign workers, including those they experience in their personal lives. In short, the issue has not been debated within the context of social cohesion, but has simply been treated as the need to adjust immigration policy. In the longer term, all local authorities and/or employers will be forced to consider frameworks for taking in foreign workers.

The recent increase in foreign workers, especially from Southeast Asia, can also be explained by Japan’s diplomatic policy, particularly the implementation of bilateral trade agreements with a number of Asian countries. These were negotiated in order to prevent losses in the share of overseas markets, and agreements were signed with Singapore (2002), Malaysia (2005), the Philippines (2006), Brunei (2007), Indonesia (2007) and Thailand (2007). Of these countries, the closest economic relationship has been with Indonesia since the early 1970s, mostly through ODA (Official Development Aid), but also through FDI (Foreign Direct Investment) and the transfer of technology and expertise [Stott 2009]. In return, Japan absorbs around 20% of Indonesia’s total exports, and this has secured a stable supply of natural resources, as Japan has been the recipient of nearly 70% of Indonesia’s fuel, metal and mineral exports in the last three decades. The Japan-Indonesian Economic Partnership Agreement (JIEPA), which came into force in July 2008, aims to redress this imbalance and broaden economic cooperation between the two countries by enhancing bilateral trade. This arrangement is intended to facilitate Japan’s investment and industrial capacity-building programmes, and Indonesian firms will benefit from the transfer of production and management techniques. Under JIEPA, Indonesia is expected to lift import tariffs on Japanese imports, while Japan is to remove tariffs on industrial and natural resource products from Indonesia.

**Influx of Foreign Nurses**

Against this background, Japan has, for the first time in its history, brought in 1,000 nurses and nursing-care specialists from Indonesia on a full-time basis under JIEPA. This follows a similar agreement between Japan and the Philippines. As soon as they have
completed a six-month Japanese language course, Indonesian specialists are to be placed in hospitals as nursing assistants, or in nursing care facilities as care workers. Indonesian trainees, who are licensed nurses in their own country, will be required to pass the national registered nursing examination in Japanese within four years of entering Japan, and will undertake on-the-job training at their workplace. Under JIEPA, this is reciprocated by economic benefits and is therefore a form of personnel exchange. It is uncertain whether Japan will receive any more workers beyond the two-year period as both the Japanese Nursing Association and the Association of Certified Care Workers of Japan are urging the government to prioritise job retention amongst Japanese workers [Kaneko 2008]. Nevertheless, given that future demographic trends indicate a rapid decrease in 15-64 year olds in the next 50 years and that the number of elderly people is set to rise, and given that there is a particular demand within the service industry in the field of nursing and care-giving, the need for skilled labour is likely to grow.

The terms of this agreement, however, have created a number of difficulties on both the Indonesian and Japanese sides. Indonesia has questioned whether the agreement is truly equal, and is unhappy with the stipulation that Indonesian certified nurses be treated as assistants (as opposed to professionals) until they pass Japan’s official nursing examination [The Japan Times 2008]. In addition, the Japanese government has refused to guarantee minimum wage levels determined by the Indonesian government. Indonesia also claims that, as this comes under personnel exchange, it should not be discussed alongside economic benefits within JIEPA. On the positive side, they consider that this could lead not only to the reduction of domestic unemployment and a rise in wage levels, but also to an opportunity for Indonesia to prove its ability to provide world class human resources at global level [Kuswandini 2008]. Recent reports show that staff destined for Japanese hospitals and nursing homes express genuine aims and aspirations, such as ‘learning about advanced medical technology’ and ‘improving my nursing career and nursing ability.’ [Tjandraninhsih 2008]

However, not long after they are assigned to their respective medical institutions, they realise that, in many respects, very few avenues are open to foreign workers. Reports suggest that the greatest difficulty they face is language, as six months’ language training is insufficient to pass the official nursing exam, given the enormous differences between the two languages [Terada 2008]. Even if they achieve a reasonable level of competency in the language, they also have to learn the philosophy underlying Japanese behaviour and ways of thinking. In most cases, they are required to read between the lines, as Japanese people do not tend to express what they think directly. They also have religious concerns. Japan has one of the lowest Muslim populations of all the Asian countries, whereas ‘some 82% of Indonesians are Muslim’ [Stott 2009]. Different approaches to nursing also give cause for concern. What they have been taught in their own country will not be acceptable in Japan and vice versa. For instance, Indonesian nurses are not used to washing patients or changing their pads, as this is regarded as the family’s job [Kaneko 2008]. Moreover, they are faced with the fact that Japanese patients are generally older than Indonesian patients, so nurses are mostly communicating with the elderly, whereas some of them have only learned how to communicate with children in hospitals in Indonesia [Kaneko 2008].

Where the Japanese are concerned, the main problems lie with both Japanese co-workers and patients. Since the central government has not given much consideration to how medical workers or patients are treated, each institution will need to consider their own measures in practice. However, finding a positive solution to this problem is a daunting task for all concerned. They have to work out how to live with people from different backgrounds, and at the same time overcome differences in language, religion and culture. At government
level, a major issue is whether some discussion is required on how to support Indonesian trainees in getting through the Japanese official nursing test. According to the latest survey [Asahi Shinbun 2009], 70% of medical institutions are in favour of providing them with support in passing the exam, while only 20% consider that Indonesian trainees will pass the exam without any special measures. At institutional level, each institution will need to give serious consideration to how Indonesian trainees communicate with their Japanese co-workers, and will also need to assess communications between Indonesian trainees and Japanese patients. At present, their main concerns focus on the programme’s viability [Terada 2008] and the transitory nature of the trainees [Harada & Okanouchi 2007]. As soon as they finish their training, they may, for example, be headhunted by larger hospitals offering better conditions. However, it is the patients who would be most affected by this new environment, and this issue should be considered more carefully.

Author’s Experience at a Nursing School

The author has been teaching nursing students in a suburb of Tokushima since April 2008, and has been introducing strategies to help them overcome their anxieties towards new nursing trainees from abroad. Since Tokushima is a long way away from central Japan and there are not many foreign residents there, nursing students hardly ever have the opportunity to talk to non-Japanese. Their initial reaction towards this issue is therefore largely negative and most students have no idea how to deal with it. Moreover, the nursing school’s current curriculum does not address the issue, and nurses do not encounter it until they start to work in individual hospitals. As a university lecturer and adult educator, the author has been given the task of delivering a part-time training course at this nursing school. By offering this course, the author aims to fill gaps in the present curriculum, such as how to live with different cultures.

A survey which the author conducted with students at the beginning of the course indicated that most of them were wary of foreigners (73%) and that some had a strong aversion towards foreign nurses (9%). In contrast, fewer students answered that they would welcome the new nurses (18%). Students who were in favour of foreign nurses actually felt that it was good to address nursing shortages, whoever the new staff might be, and that it was interesting to work with people of other nationalities as it broadened their views. However, none of those in favour of foreign nurses answered that they had ‘any interest’ in foreign countries. Those who were strongly opposed to importing foreign nurses expressed the view that they were worried about potential problems which had not been properly discussed. Those who were wary of working with foreign nurses admitted the increasing demand for nursing staff and caregivers within the context of demographic change. However, they felt that this demand should be filled by Japanese citizens as there were a large number of job-seekers within the country and also former nurses who have left the professional because of atrocious working conditions.

They had a variety of concerns: language (72% of students), methods of communication (72%), religion (60%), culture (60%), underlying doubts (48%), differential medical knowledge and skills (48%), lifestyle (27%), and working conditions (18%). More specifically, they worried about issues such as whether or not Indonesian nurses are able to get along with Japanese doctors, nurses and patients, as their jobs involve the life and death of patients. Since most Japanese people are sensitive to differences in words, behaviour and appearances, non-Japanese nurses may eventually find themselves going back home for stress-related reasons. As note-taking and reading records written by previous nursing staff are very important aspects of the work, will they be able to manage the complex reading and writing skills required by a language which is made up of thousands of ideograms? They study the language in a general way in order to pass the test, but other than that, six months is
not long enough to acquire a Japanese way of thinking, or behaviour which people can understand implicitly without the use of too many words. Will individual institutions be well enough prepared to deal with the everyday needs of foreign nurses? Some patients could feel uneasy if they are treated by foreign nurses. What should they do if a difficult patient complains? How might we be able to share our medical knowledge and the skills we have acquired from the different curricula? Is it possible to establish a school or a hospital with this specific aim? Then again, might working conditions degenerate for Japanese nurses if there is an influx of foreign co-workers?

The author’s course begins with “understanding the context”, and she introduces JIEPA as an integral part of the Japanese government’s overall political strategy in Asia. She looks at the background and the conditions which apply to Indonesian nurses under the agreement. Secondly, she describes the history of the relationship between the two countries at government, organisational, institutional and individual levels. Thirdly, using attractive image resources to help understand Indonesia, she introduces aspects of the culture which have something in common with Japanese habits, such as burning incense, or techniques for dyeing cloth. She sometimes supplements this with videos of the scenery at world heritage sites or she uses scenes from people’s daily lives. Alternatively, she might introduce the culture through books or guidebooks on Indonesia.

The author’s intention is to broaden students’ understanding of Indonesia to encourage them to develop a more balanced and rounded international outlook, in the hope that this will reduce prejudice. The process is implemented through a number of classroom activities as well as lectures. The classroom is arranged with six or seven tables with four to six students at each table. They are given different tasks using a variety of resources to help them understand Indonesia, and during this process the students are required to discuss their concerns and exchange views. Each group is expected to give a presentation on their discussions at the end of each class. As a result of these activities, most students say that ‘getting to know another country is enjoyable and important. When we understand the country from different angles and at different levels, we start to lose our fears and underlying doubts.’ Students also comment that the more they know, the more they start to have an interest in others, and this encourages them to help each other to find solutions to problems they might face in the workplace. They also express a desire for joint learning space with Indonesian nursing trainees, where they can exchange their views more freely in both a formal and non-formal environment. They stress that this additional support must be backed by central and local government, individual hospitals, the communities where the nurses are placed, and by local NGO and NPO activities. Given the differences between the Indonesian and Japanese nursing curricula, they feel that it would be better to begin the nursing course together from day one, inviting the new nurses to join them at a much earlier stage. In delivering this course, the author has come to the conclusion that positive attitudes towards foreign nurses can best be fostered by giving student nurses an opportunity to get to know them in a number of different ways.

**Conclusion**

Japan has taken an exclusive stance towards foreign workers throughout its history, and has not traditionally allowed unskilled workers to enter the country. However, current increases in the number of unskilled foreign workers and the present demand for foreign staff have prompted the government to reconsider its immigration policy. Recent bilateral agreements with a number of Asian countries have also motivated it to accept more foreign workers to counteract a labour shortage in Japan. The current influx of nurses and care-givers from Indonesia can be explained in this context, though there is still no proof that it
will definitely take root in the Japanese medical sector in the longer term. By providing training for student nurses in Tokushima, the author has introduced a number of practices for easing students’ anxieties and fears about working with foreign nurses. There are various different areas of concern, and this is an attempt to reduce their prejudice towards foreigners. Many of the students begin to see the issue in a positive way after they have taken the course, which uses a variety of resources and emphasises “getting to know the context” from different angles. It may take a more comprehensive strategy to address all their concerns, but the course could be a vital step towards making them feel more comfortable, and it may provide a basis for developing strategies for living with different cultures in a positive way.

References:

Periodials

Reports

Newspapers
Asahi Shinbun
· ‘Hospitals claim the difficulty to overcome the language in taking the National Nursing Exam’, November 2, 2009.

The Japan Times
· Terada, S., ‘First nurses arrive from Indonesia’, August 8, 2008.

The Jakarta Post
· Kuswandini, D., ‘First batch of nurses leaves for Japan’, August 7, 2008
Diversity and Social Cohesion – are these incompatible objectives?
What is the role of adult education and adult educators in understanding these tensions and contributing to the development of diverse societies?

Conference Theme:
How can we understand the role of adult education in processes of belonging and community formation?

Andreas Thiesen (Hannover, Germany)

What’s really Behind Diversity? The Rediscovery of Difference as a Challenge for Adult Educational Programmes.

1. Intro: What’s new with Diversity?
2. Theoretical views on Diversity
3. Political background and socio-political challenges of diverse societies
4. The relevance of the local area for transcultural learning
5. Objectives and requirements for a Diversity-based adult educational programme

Contact:
Andreas Thiesen, Simrockstraße 26, 30171 Hannover/Germany,
Tel. +49(0)511-4591076, eMail: A_Thiesen@web.de
1. Intro: What’s new with Diversity?

The social and cultural heterogeneity of New Europe’s postmodern society has been subject to several discourses in recent years. Diversity – some recently say “Super-Diversity” (VERTOVEC 2007) – has become a catchword when it comes to the description of multidimensional issues of social exclusion. In the field of adult education, Diversity stands for a new way of thinking about integration: When considering the needs of deprived persons suddenly everybody stresses individual and collective resources, opportunities and skills. Compared to past concepts like assimilation (cf. ESSER 1980) or multiculturalism (cf. TAYLOR 1994), this apparently completely different paradigm presents a strong incentive for a more precise study.

Why is everybody dealing with Diversity nowadays? Are we just replacing the old paradigm called “equality of opportunity” – or rather: the basis for using equal opportunities\(^1\) – with a new term?

Among other things the interest in the meanwhile interdisciplinary led Diversity-discourses is attributed to the changing social, political, economical, cultural and judicial parameters of the postmodern society – as a consequence of temporal and spatial shifting (cf. ROSA 2005). Of course one has to be clear that Diversity is not so much a “product” of the postmodern era as it is the effect of it. Social change, value change, demographic change as well as a permanent differentiation and re-location of lifestyles require a serious consideration about the special status of pluralism and multiplicity. Moreover, cultural control systems and approved strategies of conflict resolution have to be renegotiated; by the way: this is not a worst case scenario, the conceptual expectation is: diversity contains potentials. The Diversity approach not only seems to enable the description of complex “variety” issues, but to reflect social categories and individual and collective attributions.

\(^1\) Remember Hannah ARENDT who claimed “Having the right to have rights” is the basis for implementation of Human Rights.
If diversity-sensitivity focuses on understanding “strange” perhaps sometimes paradoxical Lebenswelten and concepts of everyday culture, it might reveal different individual dispositions within the various milieus. Not least, the more we are witnessing a flexibility within cultural identities (cf. HALL 1999) we have to face the perspectives of intercultural competence and cultural “translation”: most of all in the cities – like the sociologist SIMMEL already noted at the beginning of the 20th century (SIMMEL 2006) – and not so much in the rural areas. Therefore the topic of ethnographical research has switched from “faraway civilizations” to the complex character of “western” postmodern societies.

On that basis I consider the following statement as an important contribution to a paradigm shift concerning the discussion about Managing Diversity in segregated urban areas. In contrast to other concepts of integration, Diversity on the one hand appreciates individuality and particular interests and needs. On the other hand it stresses similarities between different individuals or groups (cf. VEDDER 2006: 10). In this context I hypothesise: The truth of the matter is that researchers of several disciplines try to determine the missing link between individualism and universalism. Well, I have a sketchy idea of how that missing link might look like – but not yet at this point.

2. Theoretical views on Diversity

Today Diversity is a topic of importance in several disciplines. While the economic sciences already have been dealing with Diversity Management since the eighties, (cf. VEDDER 2005), the social sciences, particularly the educational sciences, dealt with anti-discrimination, racism-critique or equal opportunities (cf. MELTER/MECHERIL 2009). However, the educational sciences have found a term for their discussions coining it Diversity Education (cf. PRENGEL 2006). In my further discussion I will use the definitions from social and cultural sciences to examine what is “behind” Diversity.

Although Diversity as a term has not been well developed theoretically and not yet standardized both within the social sciences nor transdisciplinary (LUIG 2007: 87), it is an issue which affects diverse disciplines (cf. KRELL/RIEDMÜLLER/SIEBEN/
Regarding the dimensions of Diversity from the view of social sciences we notice that the socio-economical dimension (like poverty, social disparity or exclusion) does not appear. Rather, the literature often offers a discussion about “gender”, “ethnical background”/“nationality”, “age”/“generation”, “disability”/“handicap”, “religion”/“ideology” and “sexuality”. As Diversity allows us to reflect on social attributed categories, it won’t take the discussion further if we remain on certain, isolated dimensions. We see from the writings of Pierre BOURDIEU that not so much the particulars about the characteristics – like gender, ethnicity or age – are crucial for the position of social actors and their specific scope when he talks about “social space”. To a greater degree it is the combination of these characteristics and the compatibility with the specific requirements of the particular social spaces (GEILING 2005: 1).

Following the sociologist SCHERR we can identify at least three perspectives on Diversity (cf. SCHERR 2008: 12):

1. **Diversity as a functional understanding**
   The support of Diversity is subject to specific motives. For example firms, usually transnational operating concerns, expect economic advantages by practising Diversity Management.

2. **Diversity as an anti-discrimination discourse**
   Especially in Europe Diversity is discussed on a political-judicial level, concerning the protection of individuals or groups.

3. **Diversity as a critique of power and dominance**
   As Diversity is laid out in a horizontal and putatively individualistic way there is a risk of obscuring connections of power and dominance.\(^2\)

In this last context of “power” we have to question: Who has got the prerogative of interpretation? Who is defining Diversity? Minorities? Dominant groups? Educators?

\(^2\) This is especially a domain of the gender studies.
If we leave the social sciences and enter the cultural studies we are coming face to face with that central question of “power”. The cultural studies are interested in the primacy of everyday “cultural power” (cf. HÖRNING 1999: 89). From such a perspective, “culture” is not just connected to the level of its meaning and representation, but through this open-minded attitude to diverse lifestyles, the numerous, often implicit and non-semantic forms of knowledge and life skills are brought to light (HÖRNING 1999: 88).

Anyway, Diversity – compared with societal ideas like *multiculturalism* (cf. TAYLOR 1994) – increases a sensitivity in dealing with differences *inside* a certain group, considering that all cultures are interwoven, highly complex, differentiated or “hybrid” (cf. EAGLETON 2000: 15; cf. also BHABHA 2007).

Concluding the theoretical framework so far, we realise that Diversity is dependent on its specific requirements of implementation. In the field of local adult education we have to consider the effect of subjective perception (cf. BRECKNER 1999: 85) before we arrive at a decision, therefore leading us to know what is best for our addressees, as their needs would then be the basis for programme development.

### 3. Political background and socio-political challenges of diverse societies

The year 2010 is the *European Year for Combating Poverty and Social Exclusion* (EUROPEAN COMMISSION 2009a) which is an example for Europe’s strong publicity concerning the integration of Europe’s multicultural population. Managing Diversity in Europe has become more important through the EU’s latest enlargement. The fact alone that 25 different ethnic minorities live in Rumania underlines this discovery (EUROPEAN COMMISSION 2003: 98). As the year 2007 was the *European Year of Equal Opportunities for All* (EUROPEAN COMMISSION 2009b) Europe’s accentuation of Diversity and inclusion – as well as the stress of national and regional heterogeneity – is somehow “amazing” and seems to cut across the hegemonic cultural understanding of the EU (“be mobile”, “be flexible”, and not least “be adaptable”). However, the completion of the European Single Market has stimulated mobility and free movement of labour in the EU. Inner-European migration into prosperous regions has put cultural norms
in motion. At the same time Europe’s linguistic and cultural diversity causes barriers of communication (cf. BENZ/BOECKH/HUSTER 2000: 208).

While on the international level the course is set for the advancement of Europe as an economic power, the responsibility for socio-political support rests mainly on individual nation states, regions and communities. In virtue of the European Employment Strategy (EES), Diversity has always been related to European employment policy. By now, the providers of regional and urban development are required to encourage the cooperation between all relevant actors, for example within integrated development concepts. Above all the headline goals are employment incentives and social cohesion (cf. ULLRICH 1999: 171ff.), as key qualifications seem to be the answer to “manage” one’s own employability (cf. WACKER 2009).

On the one hand there is a marked trend towards activating EU-employment policy. On the other hand an increasing part of the population is not reached by the several relevant programmes of the National Action Plans and is missing out on the promises of Europeanisation. Experiencing immobility and exclusion in the middle of a dynamic environment may cause anti-European resentments as well.3 At the same time it is full of irony that dealing with Europeanization and the slow downfall of the nation state force us to think of the regionalism-discourse which dates back to the 1980s (cf. ELKAR 1981).

Anyway, as the European integration is taking place on the local, first of all the urban level, Diversity may be a mediating concept between the EU’s symbolic policy and local politics for adult educational programme development. In this connection we have to refer to theories of urban development to understand the relevance of the local area for learning processes.

3 These resentments renew questions about the legitimation of euro-political decisions: For example, in Germany the ratification of the Treaty of Lisbon by means of plebiscite would not be assured (cf. WEFING 2009: 9).
4. The relevance of the local area for transcultural learning

The neighbourhood serves as a place of learning (that implies the hegemonic conveyance of values and norms via the dominant groups of a district) and as a place of stability and belonging together (that implies the integrative efforts of the district’s active social agents, e.g. key personalities or multipliers) (URBAN/WEISER 2006: 24ff.).

In the field of urban development we necessarily come across the “phenomena” diversity: For example, in the deprived residential areas which are located on the outskirts of a city, there are often a high degree of social problems. Deficiencies of urban building, environmental problems, infrastructural deficits, social, economic and cultural issues, neighbourly clashes and frequently negative images lead to felt and physical downward spirals (DIFU 2009). These deficiencies also can be seen as the key challenges to modern urban development. Urban development influences the change of urban structures as it is influenced by the interests of various populations, particular social actors, subtle power structures etc. as well. This always implies a certain degree of disparity between these social actors (cf. HÄUSSERMANNSIEBEL 2004: 118). The stepwise harmonization of that disparity leading to the establishment of social cohesion is the original content of social urban development.

So what does it mean for adult educational work when we talk about “resources” in highly deprived neighbourhoods? What does it mean when we talk about a heterogenic mass of “outsiders” (BUDE 2008)? Considering the uneven distribution of resources like power, education or wealth we have to face the fact that particular resources – not least the autochthons’ ones – are workable while others – which are generally the allochtones’ ones – are not demanded or obviously obsolete. In short: Why can’t migrants, irrespective of their (technical or professional) qualifications, apply their individual and collective resources profitably (cf. THIESEN 2009)? Consulting BHABHA (2007), we are coming face-to-face with the chances of hybridity: There is much to be said for examining how far the autochthones can draw on the resources of the allochthones – resources
they once were able to bring in, before they realized they are worth nothing by then.

All in all, we enter a highly ambivalent field when dealing with Diversity and education. Regional success stories will not necessarily lead to success in flanking regions. The challenge of a diversity-sensitive practice is to be able to deal with its own contradictions. We have to focus on the question of how the individual resources of a highly heterogenic urban population can be cultivated while coping at the same time with the mechanisms of “workfare” (cf. ESPING-ANDERSEN 2002, WYSS 2007).

5. Objectives and requirements for a Diversity-based adult educational programme

As we begin to discuss Diversity – be it as a paradigm or be it as a concept – we immediately have to focus on the objectives for its implementation in an educational programme; otherwise discussing Diversity would be pointless.

As the objectives of local adult educational programmes correspond structurally with the objectives of the EU, it is easy to name them: Employment development and social cohesion are at the heart of Europe’s integration policy. Realising that all European anti-discrimination efforts are linked to gainful employment, we have to deal with the effects of these efforts on the local community in a creative way while initiating local educational projects. These educational programmes are being refinanced ever more through the European Social Funds (ESF). As communities effectuate more and more Europe’s – or more precisely the EU’s – political targets, local professional actors practising Diversity Management have to walk a tightrope: They must combine manifold forms of activation to get a solid basis of support from their clientele.

---

Regarding new professions of the service sector, adult education programming has to focus on key competences which are increasing importance to the workforce. Not just by chance the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) has mentioned “interacting in heterogeneous groups” in its selection of key competences (OECD 2005: 12). The variety of pluralistic societies has led to a boom of soft skills like empathy or the ability to work in a team. Above, the relevance of social capital is distinctly valued. This development actually carries a chance for eminently deprived groups like long-term unemployed or single parents. While educators detect and support their “hidden”, not recognised potentials, they may run a chance to step into an “untrodden” field and create a new work order. This detection progress may be done through the advancement of assessment tests or through more intensive biographical examination of their clientele. Educators have to reflect what is “behind” the complex cultural settings, they are dealing with. From another point of view they have to be aware not just to “use” their addressees’ potentials for the sake of social cohesion – by educating intercultural multipliers, nannies etc. – to express it vividly: The “needs” have to correlate with the “wants”.

This leads me to several questions I would like to link with the aforenamed theoretical framework: Are local educational institutions sensitised to the issues of diversity? Which opportunities does diversity hide to manage local learning processes in deprived districts? What kind of interests are behind the oppositions against the paradigm Diversity? How do people in different social settings cope with diversity? In which way can allochthones “field” their cultural capital (BOURDIEU 2006) in the domain of everyday culture?

Without giving quick answers to those fundamentally important questions we can detect that Diversity in its political adoption is not so much about a new way of integration but all the more about its normative objectives: first and foremost full employment and social cohesion. But, while every EU-financed project which focuses on these objectives must stress the importance of “resources”, “potentials” or simply “talents” (whatever this may be) of their addressees, we have to consider
that individuals use particular accesses to activate their specific resources. As a consequence, we have to develop a universal framework for Diversity.

Summarizing the mentioned influencing variables, Diversity needs a *contentual*, a *spatial*, an *institutional*, a (everyday) *cultural* and a *political-judicial framework*:

**Framework for Diversity**

![Framework for Diversity diagram](http://media.portland.indymedia.org/images/2003/12/277255.jpg, access: 01.11.09)

The concept of Diversity could definitely give innovative answers to the urgent questions of learning processes in heterogenic cultural settings. In doing so, diversity and pluralism are considered as chances while educational institutions:

- encourage the multilingualism of migrants instead of constraining them to linguistic assimilation,
- take the visionary suggestions and – sometimes – creative strategies of avoidance of excluded persons seriously, instead of stipulating terms they will not be able to discharge,
- appreciate the work experience of old people instead of infantilizing them,
- train their employees toward diversity-sensitive behaviours instead of pretending that there is no need.

Diversity stresses and likewise overcomes social and cultural differences. In doing so, the postulation of Diversity is full of contradictions: On one side every imaginable form of difference may be “examined” under the “microscope” of Diversity so that subjects are able to choose between different identities. On the other side Diversity accumulates all kinds of differences by relativising them through its duplication. The politics of identity become irrelevant in this case (MECHERIL 2009).

This deeply immanent contradiction makes it difficult not to go out of this lecture with a couple of questions. So have I already solved my promised proposal at the beginning of my speech, yet? You know, just to bring the search for the missing link between individualism and universalism to an end. Unless, I do now: Well, I would like to re-declare the Human Rights as a proper link.

References


OECD - Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (2005): The Definition and Selection of Key Competences. Executive Summary, online: http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/47/61/35070367.pdf, access: 01.11.09


Abstract

In this paper, we focus on the current revival of a narrative perspective on multicultural issues. However while this narrative perspective aim to energize the process of learning to live together in a multicultural society, there is a lack of insights into the actual dynamics they stimulate. We explore how telling each other life-stories can open up and shape a political space in which citizens can express their ambivalence about living together in diversity and plurality. Inspired by Cavarero, we argue that the scene of narrations is best understood as relational politics where the focus shifts from a categorical or discursive norms to an attempt to account for 'who' each citizens as singular being.

Introduction

Large apartment blocks, inhabited by Turkish, Moroccan, Italian and Flemish residents, determine the face of the Kolderbos area. Socially and economically, this area is not nearly as prosperous as other town areas in Genk (Belgium). Kolderbos is marked by high levels of poverty and unemployment, which gives rise to fierce conflicts, particularly among third-generation immigrants. In this area, a Genk-based theatre company, ‘De Queeste’, started gathering human-interest stories. Of central importance were the respondents and their views on the unmistakable diversity typical of this area. Stories, testimonials and interviews with Flemish-Turkish couples formed the basis for the play “Biz Kolderbos”, a remarkable love story situated in Genk’s Kolderbos area. Stories unique to the area, and which are given back to its inhabitants.
Various cities in Flanders set the scene for a profusion of narrative practices. These practices sail under many flags: community arts, social and artistic projects, cultural heritage, and so on; and narratives are employed in view of different aims. (Vandenabeele, 2008) Some practitioners use these stories as a means of oral history, trying to document the daily life of people at a particular time in history and place. Still others support stories as a voice making process by which ordinary citizens can speak out loud about the way they experience their everyday environment. In all these practices assumptions about community building or how inhabitants can develop a sense of belonging to the place and a sense of connection to the people they live with is present. However, while narrative practices clearly aim to energize the process of learning to live together as citizens in a multicultural urban context, there is a lack of research and insights about the actual dynamics they stimulate. When we discussed our research interest with people that were involved in the narrative project of Kolderbos they agreed that being able to tell a highly personal story, without fear of interruption or embarrassment, was a positive experience. People seem to realize that they are being offered a unique opportunity. They mention the enchantment wrought by time, location and narrative space: “it is as if people were waiting for the chance to tell their story.” In turn, the neighbourhood responded positively to the performance. They catch a fleeting glimpse of the reality of living together in a highly diverse neighbourhood as Kolderbos. Also words or utterances that would otherwise be repressed, out of fear or shame could be expressed and were even put on stage.

In what follows, we tease out how practices of narration can trigger a process of community within urban areas as the Kolderbos area and, more generally, within today’s society. Amish (200) observes that nowadays inhabitants of mixed neighbourhoods – and the immigrant in particular – feels obliged to participate in a fairly fixed norm of living together in a multicultural society. Or as he writes ‘the spotlight has fallen on local community and a shared sense of place, both said to constitute the local glue for agreement and understanding within a mixed community’ (Amish, p16). In the field of social sciences, the American political Scientist, Robert Putnam achieved worldwide fame with his book ‘Bowling Alone’ and his ideas about the importance of local networks of interpersonal connections
and ties for the development of communitarian values. But this focus on a cohesive local civic space blunts with a distinctive feature of mixed neighbourhoods. They are, according to Amish ()
‘communities without community, each marked by multiple and hybrid affiliations of varying geographical reach and each intersecting momentarily (or not) with another for common local resources and amenities. They are not homogeneous or primarily place-based communities (especially for residents with strong diaspora connections and those with virtual and/or mobile lifestyles). They are simply mixtures of social groups with varying intensities of local affiliation, varying reasons for local attachment, and varying values and cultural practices’ (Amish, p17). In local civic space where the focus is entirely on social cohesion, these different types of plurality are removed from the public realm. Huber and Whelan (2001) have already explored that ‘a lack of opportunity to openly name and explore the dilemmas, contradictions and tensions that shape our lives’ (Huber and Whelan, 2001, p 229) even makes community unity elusive. They reveal that communities that do not allow for their citizens to acknowledge and examine ambivalence are filled with normative meanings about difference. They represent a world in which diversity is not recognized or dealt with. Difference gets indexed on a hierarchy of values which are governed by the binary oppositions of ‘us’ and ‘them’, by an ethnicisation/racialisation of the identities of non-White people.

Narrative practices shape the experience of diversity in at least two ways: on the one hand, they fill public space with ‘human interest’ stories that people can often relate to and, on the other hand, they manage to transform the particular diversity of a neighbourhood to something that is both bearable and provocative. In the analysis below we try to understand how narrative practices can strengthen the process of shifting meanings about the others and can create a troubling space where the ambivalence in relation to others is not wiped out but handled with care.

**Examples of narrative multiculturalism**

Phillion (2002) mentions narrative multiculturalism and reflects on her struggles while becoming a narrative inquirer in a multicultural landscape: ‘I had in my mind the questions and the answers to the
questions prepared, like a script of expectations (…). The truths of the script were what I personally and professionally believed in and tried to practise’ (Phillion, 2002, p268). The purpose of her research was ‘to describe the details of teaching and learning in a multicultural classroom and to document successful strategies in working with immigrant and minority students.’ (Phillion, 2002a, p535) Phillion chose the classroom of teacher Pam as the ‘perfect’ teacher-participant: ‘an immigrant, visible minority, female teacher working in a diverse community school’. She knew this teacher from the research of colleagues (Connelly and Clandinin) in the same school and at the start of her research Phillion ‘walked into Bay Street School of Toronto with notions of the perfect place, the perfect participant, and the perfect study of multicultural practices’ (Phillion, 2002a, p266). As the inquiry proceeded, Phillion became interrelated to the context. She got puzzled by what she saw in practice and realized that the fixed script did not work. She had to admit that ‘real life was complicated, messy, and laden with complex moral dilemmas’ (Phillion, 2002: 269). In retrospect, Phillion reflects on the narrative turn she made in her research, seeing multiculturalism as fluid rather than as fixed, as contextualized in time, place and sociality. ‘As I began to think narratively by being in the midst of Pam’s life, it became more difficult to see Pam as a representative of the normative literature on multiculturalism. She became less `immigrant’ teacher, less `Black’ teacher, less `minority’ teacher. Pam became Pam, with her own knowledge derived from years of working with students and years of personal experience. As we began to make meaning within our developing relationship, I began to recognize Pam’s personal practical knowledge … Pam’s personal practical multicultural knowledge demonstrated different qualities from the kinds of multicultural knowledge I was reading about in the literature.’ (Phillion, 2002b, p538)

In another Canadian city, colleagues of Phillion started to set up classroom spaces where children from elementary school were stimulated to share stories of their lives. It was a space for children to speak their stories, to listen to others’ stories and experience one another when they have diverse cultural histories. Children talked about the issues they felt relevant. ‘Problems at recess, an issue on the school bus, and the experience of being in Year 1 at school with so many other children were all topics.’ (Huber, Murphy and Clandinin; 2003, p354) Huber, Murphy and Clandinin (2003) tried to
understand how children used this space to explore the possibilities they felt for living community in school. These spaces also helped the researchers to attend more closely to children’s and family’s stories as they bump up against the more dominant ‘stories of school that teachers and administrators live and tell’ (Huber, Murphy and Clandinin; 2003, p346) As the year evolved the children began to more regularly call for these gatherings and they often told stories of conflicts and incidents that happened when playing outside. Researchers and teachers started to see these spaces as a move away from a more scripted way of being in classrooms, spaces where researchers, teachers and children were allowed to stay with the diverse narratives of their experience and to explore their ambiguities, contradictions and tensions. ‘What became evident to us were the tensions that were present… . These tensions could not be smoothed over if we were to attend to the lives gathered in that space’. (Huber, Murphy and Clandinin; 2003, p359). Attending narratively to these tensions turned out to be ‘an urgent burder’ as more familiar plot lines of schooling bumped up. One of the teachers involved reflect on his own struggle with the more passion-filled moments of tension and complexity during these gatherings, falling into a teacher plot line of being responsible and imposing order. The principal ones entered these gatherings, because of a fight between two children during sports and responded with ‘a story of certainty, of determining right from wrong, of fixing up problems’ (Huber, Murphy and Clandinin; 2003, p359). ‘Neither quieting her own story to hear another’s or imagining other ways of being, she appeared to lecture the children, telling them “that they need to learn what to do when they become angry.” A story of blame wove into the space when she said that she “want[ed] everyone to think about how they contributed to the situation.”’ (Huber, Murphy and Clandinin; 2003, p359)

We elaborated in an extensive way on these two examples as they captures very well the main search of narrative multiculturalism. Narrative multiculturalism is an attempt to make space for the plurality of stories that can be told about what Leeuwen (2008) calls the existential register of everyday multiculturalism. The focal point is to avoid generalizing theories and predetermination of how cultural pluralization can be understood solely in terms of either ‘enrichment’ or ‘disenchantment’ (Simonsen, 2008). To listen to the stories people tell is according to Boomkens (2006) taking the
chaos of globalisation seriously and giving a voice to the tentative character of the knowing within these stories. It is this subjective dimension, seeking to bear differences that are often difficult, opaque and with multiple contested meanings that geographers have called a politics of propinquity. A politics ‘that is shaped by the issue thrown up by living with diversity and sharing a common territorial place’ (Amin, 2004, p39). What becomes clear from these two examples is that a shared practice as telling each other life stories are particularly important for living community within a diverse society. A narrative space, where different interpretations of a particular issue can encounter each other, may foster involvement with the other. But we are still puzzled by the kind of community that becomes possible within these kind of practices. In the case with Phillion and Pam the ongoing relationship is not constituted by a common language or a common conceptual framework. On the contrary it became more difficult for Phillion to see Pam as a representative of the literature-supported truths on multiculturalism. In the case with children from a mixed neighbourhood in a Canadian elementary school telling each other life stories provided for this school a precarious site where children and teachers could speak out their disagreement and differences. The key of a narrative community seems to lie in the acceptance of the idea that we lack fixed rules and language to assign meaning to the otherness of the people we live with. It is this more complex vision of what ‘narrative’ and ‘community’ might mean in a culturally diverse society that we explore further below.

**Thinking about community narratively**

A popular thought held by community workers and researchers, is that the most reasonable way to deal with the overwhelming diversity in urban landscapes is to stimulate an understanding of the culture, norms and values the others adhere, trying to point at the possibility to bridge the differences. In a likewise vein, the unifying resource of narratives is put forward. Storytelling is associated with fun, relaxation or cosines, which makes listeners more receptive to the testimony of others. Gergen and Gergen (2006) sum up these relational opportunities of storytellings as follows: ‘receptivity, familiarity, trust, empathic witnessing and recreating the self’ (Gergen and Gergen, 2006, p). These relational qualities definitely played a role in the two examples elaborated above. Huber, Murphy and
Clandinin (2003) called the narrative space they were trying to stimulate ‘peace candle’ gatherings. With their reference to peace they point at the absence of war and also the stillness and playfulness of these gatherings, trying to hear other people’s stories, ‘not only in the physical sense but also in the sense of quieting our own stories to hear another’s’ (Huber, Murphy and Clandinin, 2003, p353) As our analysis of this case made clear it was not a stillness that silenced or smoothed over tensions or a stillness that did involve a particular vision of peace, trying to fit the diverse stories into one particular image. ‘Peace, as stillness, allowed the possibility for lives, with all their ambiguity, uncertainty, tension, and complexity, to be expressed. Peace, as stillness, allowed the possibility of moving away from the certainty and arrogance of knowing to the uncertainty and humbleness of not knowing.’ (Huber, Murphy and Clandinin, 2003, p353)

We can also recognize this ‘peculiar’ combination of storytelling as both stimulating familiarity and tensions in the narrative practices we came across in a study project we set up with students of the first master year of social pedagogy at the Leuven University (Flanders/Belgium). The relational qualities of storytelling often foster a readiness to share parallel experiences. In a narrative practice called ‘consolation’, for example, people living in the city of Ghent and belonging to different cultural groups were stimulated to tell about the way they comfort others and found comfort with others. In another narrative practice, called ‘In-fusion’, doctors, nurses and other staff, patients and visitors are stimulated to tell and listen to stories about the daily life in hospitals. A hospital is a place where everyone has to go sometimes and where people of very different background come across each other. These practices of intercultural storytelling about critical life events, the need for consolation, the pain related to illness or the joy of care supports a sense of familiarity among storytellers but also a sense of an inexhaustible variation of life. A narrative perspective, says Randall (2007), ‘is equipped to acknowledge the inescapably idiographic and interpretive elements that are entailed in being human and the intricate uniqueness of actual lives in time’ (Randall, 2007, p370). The narrative event becomes a space where commonness is acted out, validated, and created but where the particular context and self of each participants is also incorporated in the stories. And as Van Leeuwen (2008) observes, intensive contact can slowly transform the ‘strange other’ into a ‘familiar other’, but ‘this
does not alter the fact that a multicultural society will always retain a degree of strangeness’ (Van Leeuwen, 2008, p162). It is precisely this sense that our own horizon of understanding can never encompass the social and cultural reality of the other that gives rise to what Van Leeuwen calls ‘a fundamental affective ambivalence’ of intercultural contact.

Two conceptual clarifications are in order here. First, we connect the relational qualities of narratives, with the difficult exercise for travelling to one another’s world. Van Leeuwen stresses that ‘we cannot simply experience the cultural other – with his or her strange customs and clothing, eccentric views and behaviour – as an external manifestation of our own common sense. That which is strange resists being incorporated; it breaks through the illusion of a perfect symmetry. Here our understanding encounters a boundary with that which we have no relationship with, which is not a reality ‘for us’ but rather a reality that ‘opposes us’ (Van Leeuwen, 2008, p152). Precisely because of the relational qualities of narratives this boundary is not experienced as a cognitive imperfection but as an existential ambivalence that can make a switch between a negative moment marked by anguish, pain and shock and a positive moment marked by an awareness of depth, delight and significance. The strength of narrative practices is then that it enables to articulate both feelings: feelings of cultural discomfort and feelings of fundamental respect for cultural and ethnic others. This makes possible ‘that loyalty to ideals of living together with cultural and ethnic others need not be undermined by an emotional purism that interprets any form of discomfort as a ‘deeper loyalty’ to racism or nationalism.’ (Leeuwen, 2008, p168). As we will show further on this analysis is consistent with a search to understand narratives as a precarious political space.

Second, we do acknowledge that narratives often orient the listeners towards the support for a particular claim, usually based on a clear-cut recognition of sameness and differences. Helstein (2005) has described this process as the creation of a ‘community of identification’, ‘coming together in solidarity around an essence’ (Helstein, 2005, p3). This notion of community is also in line with Goffman’s (1981) concept of narration as social action and Bauman’s (1986) ideas about how narration expresses and creates the sociocultural life of a community. Although this kind of
community can be very effective in terms of social action and inclusion, empirical research also shows its problematic side; ‘the complexity and difference of each individual is subsumed in an either/or logic’ (Helstein, 2005, p8). In her research on undocumented Mexican immigrants in the United States, for example De Fina (2000) shows the pervasiveness of ethnic identification. These Mexican immigrants need to redefine their identity in a host country and in the narratives of these immigrants De Fina observes a stereotyped vision about themselves, strongly determined by particular meanings of ethnic affiliation. And as De Fina also shows this identification with ethnic roots, language and culture is favoured by a public discourse that in the United States is obsessed with racial/ethnic politics. Ethnic affiliation presents the Mexican immigrants with many dilemmas. ‘First, they need to accept the idea of using and applying ethnic categorizations to themselves, although other properties of their definition as human beings, such as social class or occupation, for example, might be more salient to them. Second, they need to build specific connections between what they feel they are as individuals, and the categories socially available to them.’ (De Fina, 2000, p136). Witteborn (2007) shows how this process of identification is also operative in the narratives told by Palestinian speakers who live in the United States and appeal ‘to a shared human identity and fundamental human needs, such as food and free movement’ (Witteborn, 2007, p160). And as Witteborn observes ‘telling their story they are using several linguistic and rhetorical means for creating common bonds with the audience and bridging potentially different cultural and sociopolitical identities, values, and expectations’ (Witteborn, 2007, p159). By narrating their experiences in public Palestinian see themselves as activists who inform and convince people and urge the audience to envision a particular political scenario.

For us, the everyday experience of urban plurality implies a certain insight that ‘perhaps the time has come to consider recognition differently, freed from norms that often merely crystallize (or weaken) identities’ (Beneduce, 2008, p523). Narrative practices can foster an ‘awareness that there is no ultimate horizon from which we can understand everything and everyone from the ‘inside’ (Van Leeuwen, 2008: 161). Huber, Murphy and Clandinin (2003) analyze the narrative practice they were stimulating as a place where teachers, students and researchers could step outside comfortable plot
lines of who they were in school and could enter a place of liminality or referring to Heilbrun (in Huber, Murphy and Clandinin, 2003, p351) ‘a state of necessary in-betweenness’. The common is the in-betweenness where the focus shifts from a categorical or discursive norm to an attempt to account for each citizens as a singular being (Cavarero, 2000). This shift refers to new ways of theorizing and practicing community or what Helstein (2005) refers to as ‘community of articulation’. We’ve already pointed to the ‘peculiar’ combination of storytelling as both stimulating familiarity and tensions or as joining and separating at the same time. This dynamic relation is the space where singularities cannot be reduced to identity or essence nor to common beings. In the articulation there is nothing to control, nothing to unify, there is only ‘the singularity and materiality of human uniqueness together with its necessary relationality and vulnerability’ (Cavarero, 2008, 130). Inspired by Cavarero (2000), we can understand this community of articulation as ‘one place in which the possibility of a new dialogue, or a new sense, of politics might present itself – one which is founded upon the exposition and vulnerability inherent in each of our entrances into the world.’ (Kottman about Cavarero in Cavarero, 2000, pxvii-xviii) Whereas traditional ‘identity polities’ continues to articulate the general ‘what’ of identities, narration can become a discursive performance that purportedly is capable of articulating the who, the corporeal singularity of the speaker in relation to others. The pivotal process of narratives is not about ‘abstracting from one’s own contingent situation to think in the place of any other man’ (Biesta, 2001, p.396) but considered attention to a way of speaking as singular beings in their contingencies.

Cavarero frequently refers to the ideas of Arendt and for both ‘the first consideration of any politics is that human beings live together, and are constitutively exposed to each other through the bodily senses’ (Kottman about Cavarero in Cavarero, 2000, pix). For both, politics depends on a space where each participant is acknowledged as a singular being and where the plurality arises within the engagement of speaking and acting in concert with others. Like Arendt, Cavarero (2008) focus on the human condition, which originates at birth. She defines ‘this human condition in terms of exposure and, more recently, in terms of vulnerability’ (Cavarero, 2008, p156). The pain of hate-speech
comes from the fact that this vulnerability is utterly violated, ‘the feeling that who one is, is not being addressed, and indeed has no place in the name-calling scene at all’ (Kottman about Cavarero in Cavarero, 2000, pxix). For Cavarero the disjunction between discourse and the way we experience our life, not only present in a hate-speech but in every kind of relationship where language is used, marks each in a different way and calls for the ‘who’ of the existent in response. ‘Put simply, this vulnerability – by opening us to be hurt, or affected, by ‘what’ we are called – might even be that which gives us the sense, through the pain or shock we feel, that what we are called does not correspond with who we feel ourselves to be.’ (Kottman about Cavarero in Cavarero, 2000, pxx). The narratable self is a vulnerable self that desires to hear or to read the tale of one’s life and for Cavarero it is in the relationship to others that I am constitutively exposed to the others’ narration of my life-story. It is in a narrative relationship with others that a sense of self becomes possible – quite apart from the content of the narration itself – that ‘hints at ways of being in which the individual is not simply a ‘specimen’ of a more encompassing order’ (Biesta, 2009, p.8).

‘Concluding’ remarks

The analysis of Cavarero suggests that it is probable the desire for narration, as a sort of spontaneous reflex of the narratable self, that fuels the profusion of narrative practices that we can observe in cities today. And as Cavarero (2000) makes clear stimulating narration is not about a process of empathy nor about the struggle of a collective subjectivity. The scene of narration is capable of maintaining an in-between that relates and separates at the same time. ‘What emerges is — both in life stories and through the focus on voices — is the who, the corporeal singularity of the speaker in relation to others, no matter what one says.’ (Cavarero, 2008, p130) It is this possibility of a limit space where singularities are in articulation with each other that provides a productive power for processes of community within cities. In this sense also the work of Nancy about ‘being-in-common’ and the community as an empty spacing between singularities is relevant. Nancy (in Helstein, 2005) suggests
that the group as one (common being) is actually the death of community as there is no possibility for articulation (and thus community) because there is no difference or no space to be articulated. In this process of being-in-common the interruption of the other, the immigrant, the clandestine, the refugee is close or even in its existential structure similar to the sense of each human being’s uniqueness as an absolute difference that elude our rational consideration. And as Cavarero and Arendt argue, a true democratic society lives by the condition to entitle citizens to trust themselves and to explore the often paradoxical and ungraspable character of their experiences. It is learning where citizens are involved as singular beings and where at the same time they are prepared to be taken by surprise by the ways others bring in their point of view. From this perspective, it follows that a narrative practice is educational as participants work hard to attend the singularity of each other.

REFERENCES


Huber, Murphy and Clandinin; 2003


